BRILL

Vivarium 47 (2009) 241-294

VIVARIUM

brill.nl/viv

Gerald Odonis' Commentary on the *Ethics*: A Discussion of the Manuscripts and General Survey

Camarin Porter*

Abstract

Gerald Odonis produced a lengthy commentary on the *Ethics*, recognized by both his contemporaries and modern scholars as a substantial analysis of Aristotelian thought on the virtues, the will, moral choice, justice, and the nature of ethical inquiry. As recent research on late-medieval ethics has expanded deeper into these discussions, interest in Odonis' contributions has grown, but it has been limited textually to the two early printed editions of the work. The present survey of the commentary's manuscript tradition investigates the codices attributed to Odonis, identifies the incomplete witnesses and misattributions, and clarifies the nature of the manuscripts recently assigned to Odonis.

Keywords

Gerald Odonis, Aristotle, ethics, Jean Buridan, manuscripts

Gerald Odonis, whose thought has been characterized in other contexts as eclectic and highly individualized, stands out in medieval ethics for his lengthy

*) Various people and institutions assisted in the completion of this rather complicated study. William Duba travelled to Tübingen to inspect the codex preserved there. For (N), in Florence, I am grateful to Garrett Smith for his help in consulting the bibliography, and, especially, to Fabrizio Amerini and Marta Vittorini for describing the manuscript and providing the foliation respectively. Vittorini also kindly consulted the Subiaco witness *in situ*. For the manuscripts and the appendix, William Duba and Chris Schabel went well above and beyond their duties as general editors. Thanks are also due to the libraries whose manuscripts were inspected, in addition to the Hill Monastic Manuscript Library (and the always helpful Julie Dietman) at St John's University, Collegeville, MN, for a Heckmand Stipend allowing me to see the Tarazona witnesses and for providing copies of the (authentic) Vienna manuscript; the Knights of Columbus Vatican Film Library at Saint Louis University and Dr. Susan L'Engle for assistance with the Vatican manuscripts; and Chris Schabel and the University of Cyprus for the Padua and Florence (F) codices.

© Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, 2009

DOI: 10.1163/156853409X428131

commentary on Aristotle's *Ethics*, the *Scriptum super libros Ethicorum* or the *Sententia et expositio cum quaestionibus super libros Ethicorum Aristotelis*, the first full exposition of that text by a Franciscan. Although Odonis' work on the *Ethics* was remarkable enough among fourteenth-century contemporaries to earn him the epithet *Doctor moralis* and to merit continued circulation and study of his commentary into the sixteenth century, the full significance of his contribution remains undetermined. Previous research has depended primarily on early printed editions of the work, but a brief survey of the extant manuscripts confirms that the commentary warrants further textual study and expanded exploration of the breadth of Odonis' ethical thought.

Although Odonis' commentary received preliminary attention in early biographical accounts, work done by James Walsh, Odd Langholm, and Bonnie Kent in the mid-1970s and 1980s represented the first focused studies of his text.[1] Walsh included Odonis' work in his study of late-medieval *Ethics* commentaries and established it as a significant source for Jean Buridan's own extremely influential commentary.[2] Bonnie Kent's 1984 dissertation, *Aristotle and the Franciscans: Gerard Odonis' Commentary on the Nichomachean Ethics*, situated the text within the Franciscan voluntarist tradition and remains the only full-length study of the work.[3] Interest in Odonis' commentary has since expanded deeper into his contributions to economic thought and to broader discussions on the virtues and moral *akrasia*.

---

1) C.-V. Langlois, 'Guiral Ot, Frère Mineur', *Histoire littéraire de la France* 36 (1927), 203-25, at 216-17; J.J. Walsh, *Aristotle's Conception of Moral Weakness* (New York, 1963); idem, 'Buridan and Seneca', *Journal of the History of Ideas* 27 (1966), 23-40; *L'Ethique à Nicomaque*, ed. R.A. Gauthier and J.Y. Jolif (2nd ed., Louvain, 1970); Walsh, 'Some Relationships between Gerald Odo's and John Buridan's Commentaries on Aristotle's Ethics', *Franciscan Studies* 35 (1975), 237-75; idem, 'Teleology in the Ethics of Buridan', *Journal of the History of Philosophy* 18 (1980), 265-86; O. Langholm, 'Economic Freedom in Scholastic Thought', *History of Political Economy* 14 (1982), 260-83; G. Wieland, 'The Reception and Interpretation of Aristotle's *Ethics*', in *The Cambridge History of Later Medieval Philosophy: From the Rediscovery of Aristotle to the Disintegration of Scholasticism, 1100-1600*, ed. N. Kretzmann, A. Kenny, and J. Pinborg (Cambridge, 1982), 657-72; B. Kent, *Aristotle and the Franciscans: Gerard Odonis' Commentary on the* Nichomachean Ethics (Ph.D. dissertation, Columbia University, 1984); Langholm, *The Aristotelian Analysis of Usury* (Bergen, 1984); Kent, 'The Good Will According to Gerardus Odonis, Duns Scotus, and William of Ockham', *Franciscan Studies* 46 (1986), 119-39.

2) Walsh, 'Some Relationships', and idem, 'Teleology' (cit. no. 1 above).

3) Kent, *Aristotle and the Franciscans* (cit. no. 1 above). A brief 1928 dissertation, L. Bartolomé O.F.M.'s *Fray Gerardo de Odón, Ministro General de la Orden Franciscana, 1329-1342* (Dissertation, Collegio Internacional de San Antonio de Roma, 1928), has not been of influence in the historiographical tradition.

Odonis' commentary, along with his economics treatise, *De contractibus et restitutionibus et de sententia excommunicationis*, established him as a provocative thinker in dialogue with contemporaries on concerns over just price, usury, the nature of money, and the ethics of a profit economy.[4] Thirteenth- and fourteenth-century economic theory drew heavily on the *Ethics*, particularly Aristotle's treatment of justice and money in book V; Odonis' contemporaries and modern scholars have in turn taken note of his exposition of these subjects. Odd Langholm has worked most closely on Odonis as a source for scholastic economic theory and has supported Anneliese Maier's broad characterization of Odonis as a courageous thinker, especially given the challenges Odonis made to Aquinas' and Olivi's economic thought.[5] Joel Kaye has also surveyed Odonis' economic thought and set it in the context of late-medieval natural philosophy.[6]

With regard to late-medieval debates on the virtues, the will, and the subject of moral philosophy, Odonis' commentary figures along with those of Aquinas and Buridan as a fundamental source for the development of ethics from the late-thirteenth to the mid-fourteenth century.[7] Kent's early work on

---

4) *De contractibus et restitutionibus et de sententia excommunicationis*, ed. G. Ceccarelli and S. Piron, forthcoming. As Langholm has pointed out, Odonis' explicit coverage of economic thought comes from his lectures (*lectiones*), not the questions: O. Langholm, *Wealth and Money in the Aristotelian Tradition: A Study in Scholastic Economic Sources* (Bergen, 1992), 29.

5) Langholm, *Economics in the Medieval Schools: Wealth, Exchange, Value, Money, and Usury According to the Paris Theological Tradition, 1200-1350* (Leiden, 1992), 509. Cf. idem, *The Legacy of Scholasticism in Economic Thought: Antecedents of Choice and Power* (Cambridge, 1998). Evidence for Odonis' engagement with and dependence on Olivi's thought appears most explicitly in elements of Olivi's treatise on contracts that appear in the *Ethics* commentary and Odonis' own work on contracts; see Langholm, 'Economic Freedom' (cit. n. 1 above), 264, and Ceccarelli-Piron in this volume. For an edition of Olivi's economic texts, see *Quodlibet* I, qq. 16 and 17, and *De contractibus usurariis*, ed. A. Spicciani, 'Gli scritti sul capitale et sull'interesse di Fra Pietro di Giovanni Olivi', *Studi francescani* 73 (1976), 289-325.

6) See J. Kaye, *Economy and Nature in the Fourteenth Century: Money, Market Exchange, and the Emergence of Scientific Thought* (Cambridge, 1998), 128-38.

7) I. Bejczy, 'The Cardinal Virtues in Medieval Commentaries on the *Nichomachean Ethics*, 1250-1350', in *Virtue Ethics in the Middle Ages: Commentaries on Aristotle's Nichomachean Ethics, 1200-1500*, ed. I. Bejczy (Leiden 2008), 199-221; P. Blazek, 'The Virtue of Virginity: The Aristotelian Challenge', ibidem, 247-73; B. Sère, *Penser l'amitié au moyen âge: Étude historique des commentaires sur les livres VIII et IX de* l'Éthique à Nicomaque *(XIII^e-XV^e siècle)* (Turnhout, 2007); eadem, 'De la vérité en amitié. Une phenomenologie médiévale du sentiment dans les commentaries de *l'Éthique à Nicomaque* (XII^e-XV siècle)', *Revue historique* 636 (2004-05), 793-820; R. Saarinen, 'The Parts of Prudence: Buridan, Odonis, Aquinas', *Dialogue* 42 (2003), 749-65; D.A. Lines, *Aristotle's* Ethics *in the Italian Renaissance (ca. 1300-1650): The Universities and the Problem of Moral Education* (Leiden,

the commentary pursued the question whether Odonis' thought broke from or contrasted with what can be broadly identified as a Franciscan tradition in ethics, marked by an interest in preserving the freedom of the will and moral culpability against any percieved subordination of the will to the intellect in Thomistic thought. After surveying Odonis' arguments on the location of the virtues and on free will, Kent argued that Odonis' positions in fact closely reflected currents among his Franciscan contemporaries.

Her suspicions reflected the "conflicting expectations" that initially surrounded Odonis' commentary; of all of Aristotle's works, the *Ethics* posed the most conflicts between Christian and classical views of *eudaimonia*, fortune, the necessity of wealth and goods, and the nature of moral choice. Beyond these abstract tensions, Odonis' close ties to Pope John XXII and John's known high regard for Aquinas' theology, particularly on poverty and property rights, raised suspicions that Odonis himself may have responded sympathetically to Thomist ethics; as evidence of the contrary, Kent cites several instances of Odonis defending Augustinian positions against Thomas.[8]

Risto Saarinen more recently confirmed Kent's analysis. In his study of Odonis' conception of *akrasia* in the *Ethics*, he cited inconsistent positions on consent between book III and book VII, in which Odonis first upholds the traditional Augustinian position, but also supports the Thomistic view. For Saarinen, this inconsistency signaled an attempt to create a synthesis, though evidently at the cost of a more innovative approach. Overall, however, Saarinen recognized a general Augustinian defense in Odonis' thought.[9]

A limited but influential number of late thirteenth-century commentaries, based on Grosseteste's translations, preceded Odonis' work. Albert the Great, Aquinas, and Alexander of Hales commented on the text, although their for-

---

2002); R. Lambertini, 'Individuelle und politische Klugheit in den mittelalterlichen Ethikkommentaren (von Albertus bis Buridan)', in *Individuum und Individualität im Mittelalter*, ed. J.A. Aertsen and A. Speer (Berlin, 1996), 464-78; O. Pluta, 'Albert der Grosse und Johannes Buridan', in *Albertus Magnus und der Albertismus. Deutsche philosophische Kultur des Mittelalters*, ed. M.J.F.M. Hoenen and Alain de Libera (Leiden, 1995), 91-105; R. Saarinen, *Weakness of the Will in Medieval Thought from Augustine to Buridan* (Leiden, 1994); idem, 'Die heroische Tugend als Grundlage der individualistischen Ethik im 14. Jahrhundert', in *Individuum und Individualität im Mittelalter*, ed. Aertsen and Speer, 450-63; B. Kent, *Virtues of the Will: The Transformation of Ethics in the Late Thirteenth Century* (Washington, DC, 1995); eadem, 'The Good Will' (cit. n. 1 above); Walsh, *Aristotle's Conception of Moral Weakness* (cit. n. 1 above).

8) Kent, *Aristotle and the Franciscans* (cit. n. 1 above), 3 and 100.

9) See Saarinen, 'Die heroische Tugend' (cit. n. 7 above), idem, *Weakness of the Will* (cit. n. 7 above), 146-160, and idem, 'Walter Burley on *akrasia*: Second Thoughts', in *Vivarium* 37 (1999), 60-71, at 66.

mats and foci varied considerably.[10] Albert's commentary featured an exposition of Aristotle's text supplemented with disputed questions, whereas Aquinas produced a literal exposition of the text.[11] As suggested by one of the two alternative titles for the work, *Sententia et expositio cum quaestionibus*, Odonis' commentary is closest to Albert's in style and structure, with questions supplementing many of his lectures (*lectiones*), or sections of commentary on Aristotle's text itself.[12] The brief quotations from Aristotle's text that introduce each *lectio* match William of Moerbeke's recension of Grosseteste's translation.[13] This composite format of exposition followed by questions based on issues raised within the lectures privileged contemporary discussions over pure exposition of Aristotle's thought.[14] Odonis' choice of questions thus offers us more direct access to his individual response to the *Ethics* than do the lectures.

As shown here, Odonis raised significantly more questions in books I through VI than in VII through X:[15]

Prologue: 4 questions	Book IV: 45 questions	Book VIII: 0 questions
Book I: 32 questions	Book V: 23 questions	Book IX: 8 questions
Book II: 26 questions	Book VI: 17 questions	Book X: 0 questions
Book III: 25 questions	Book VII: 1 question	Total: 181 questions

10) For the medieval and Renaissance manuscript traditions for *Ethics* translations and commentaries, see Lines, *Aristotle's* Ethics *in the Italian Renaissance* (cit. n. 7 above), Appendices B and C.

11) See Mark Jordan's argument, though, that the second part of the *Summa* more explicitly comprises Aquinas' commentary on the *Ethics*: M. Jordan, 'Aquinas Reading Aristotle's *Ethics*', in Ad litteram*: Authoritative Texts and Their Medieval Readers*, ed. M. Jordan and K. Emery, Jr. (Notre Dame, IN, 1992), 229-49.

12) *Giraldus Odonis O.F.M., Opera Philosophica II: De intentionibus. With a Study on the Medieval Intentionality Debate up to ca. 1350*, ed. L.M. de Rijk (Leiden-Boston, 2005), 2, n. 3; Lines, *Aristotle's* Ethics *in the Italian Renaissance* (cit. n. 7 above), 161; O. Weijers, *Le travail intellectuel à la Faculté des arts de Paris: Textes et maîtres, ca. 1200-1500* (Turnhout, 2003), 218-19; eadem, 'Un type de commentaire particulier à la Faculté des arts: la *sententia cum questionibus*', in *La tradition vivie: mélanges d'histoire des textes en l'honneur de Louis Holtz*, ed. P. Lardet (Turnhout, 2003), 211-22; Langholm, *Economics in the Medieval Schools* (cit. n. 5 above), 511; Langholm, *The Aristotelian Analysis of Usury* (cit. n. 1 above), 29; and Walsh, 'Some Relationships' (cit. n. 1 above), 245.

13) *Ethica Nicomachea*: *Translatio Roberti Grosseteste Lincolniensis sive 'Liber Ethicorum'. B. Recensio Recognita*, ed. R.A. Gauthier (*Aristoteles Latinus* XXVI:1-3, fasc. 4) (Leiden, 1973).

14) Cf. Wieland, 'The Reception and Interpretation of Aristotle's *Ethics*' (cit. n. 1, above), 666.

15) Cf. Weijers, 'Un type de commentaire' (cit. no. 12 above), 219, n. 37. One idiosyncrasy to this format arises in book X, where Gerard's text announces four questions between the fifth and sixth lectures, but the texts of the questions themselves do not appear in any witnesses.

Odonis' general disinclination to cite contemporaries has frustrated efforts to reconstruct his participation in broader debates, and his *Ethics* commentary characteristically lacks references to any figure after Averroes.[16] Langlois, Walsh, and Kent each surveyed Odonis' citations and found several scriptural, classical, patristic and twelfth-century authorities, but no explicit references to the late thirteenth- and early fourteenth-century writers Odonis whom was drawing upon and responding to.[17] The citations that do appear comprise works by Cicero, Boethius, Augustine, Al-Ghazali, and Hugh of St Victor.

Of the tacit references to contemporaries, Kent and others have noted the high number to Aquinas.[18] Additionally, given his reference to Scotus' formal distinction, and more broadly given his dependence on their thought in other works and his immersion in the Franciscan theological tradition, we can be certain that in the context of the *Ethics* Odonis read Scotus and Olivi, and possibly Burley.[19]

Regarding the *Ethics*'s dating and its relationship to Odonis' other works, we lack specific evidence for the location and context in which Odonis produced it, but can make a reasonable guess where to place it in relation to the dates posited for his progress through the degree program. The sequence of his academic and administrative careers suggests at a miminum that Odonis wrote the *Ethics* between his first *Sentences* lectures and his election as Minister General in 1329.[20] Odonis initially lectured on the *Sentences* in Toulouse sometime in the late 1310s, and he did so again in Paris in the late 1320s, with evidence pointing to the academic years 1326-28.[21] Although the full import of the

---

16) Langlois thus took a conservative view of the text's potential, despite recognizing its magnitude in terms of length and its significance as Odonis' most substantial work, lamenting, "L'auteur a trouvé moyen de ne rien dire, en tant de phrases, qui soit de nature à instruire la postérité des choses de son temps"; Langlois, 'Guiral Ot' (cit. n. 1 above), 217.

17) See Kent, *Aristotle and the Franciscans* (cit. n. 1 above), 34-39; and Walsh, 'Some Relationships' (cit. n. 1 above), 257-58. Kent and Walsh came up with differing lists of authorities cited; the unusually high number (42) of references to legal sources prompted Walsh's characterization of Odonis' ethics as "moral legalism." Kent qualified these citations by pointing out that nearly half are canon law references, and thus theological, many are in book V on justice and law, and some are citations of views Odonis rejects: Kent, *Aristotle and the Franciscans* (cit. n. 1 above), 35.

18) Kent, *Aristotle and the Franciscans* (cit. n. 1 above), 40 and 100.

19) Kent, *Aristotle and the Franciscans* (cit. n. 1 above), 42.

20) Hence the custom has arisen of simply dating the work *ante* 1329. See Kaye, *Economy and Nature* (cit. n. 6 above), 129; Saarinen, *Weakness of the Will* (cit. n. 7 above), 147; Kent, 'The Good Will' (cit. n. 1 above), 124; eadem, *Aristotle and the Franciscans* (cit. n. 1 above), 33; Lines, *Aristotle's* Ethics *in the Italian Renaissance* (cit. n. 7 above), 161; and Walsh, 'Some Relationships' (cit. n. 1 above), 245.

21) C. Schabel, 'The *Sentences* Commentary of Gerardus Odonis, O.F.M.', *Bulletin de philosophie*

revisions made to his lectures between Toulouse and Paris remains to be established, a strong relationship exists between his Paris *Sentences* commentary and the *Ethics*.[22] When preparing his manuscript survey of the *Sentences* commentary, Chris Schabel identified forty questions that share material with the *Ethics*, over half of them with identical wording, most of which are concentrated in books II and III of the *Sentences*.[23]

Of particular interest for Odonis' reworking of his thought between Toulouse and Paris is his revised discussion of usury (*Ethics* IV, q. 20), which suggested to Langholm that Odonis revised for the *Sentences* commentary passages found in his *Ethics*.[24] If we accept that the period between the Toulouse and Paris lectures was the window in which Odonis produced his independent tracts on logic and natural philosophy and revised passages from his first *Sentences* lectures, which he then incorporated into his second lectures, this also appears to be a more viable stage of his career to place the *Ethics* than the much shorter window between his second lectures and his election as Minister General of the Franciscans in 1329.[25] It would also explain the incipit found in the Salamanca (S) witness of the *Ethics* describing Odonis as "bachalarius" (see full incipit below). In sum, dating the *Ethics* between the early 1320s and 1326-28 accounts for the relationship of shared material between *Ethics* passages and the Parisian *Sentences* lectures, fits with the reference to Odonis writing the *Ethics* before he became a master, and provides more time for him to have composed such a lengthy commentary than the period immediately preceding his election. Contextual and manuscript evidence thus encourages us to include it as one of the works written between the Toulouse and Paris lectures on the *Sentences* and incorporated into the latter.

Odonis' commentary was a recognized influence on contemporaries and later figures, particularly as a source for Jean Buridan's own, better-known *Ethics*

---

médiévale 46 (2004), 115-61, at 119-24; idem, '*Non aliter novit facienda quam facta.* Gerard Odonis' Questions on Divine Foreknowledge', in *Chemins de la pensée médiévale: Études offertes à Zénon Kaluza*, ed. P.J.J.M. Bakker, E. Faye, and C. Grellard (Turnhout, 2002), 351-77, at 352.

22) Schabel, 'The *Sentences* Commentary of Gerardus Odonis' (cit. n. 21 above), 122-24.

23) See Schabel, 'The *Sentences* Commentary of Gerardus Odonis' (cit. n. 21 above), 123, for a list of correlative questions. As per Schabel's findings, the questions containing shared content and wording are noted in the appendix.

24) Langholm has noted, "This is not a common case of an author copying verbatim or nearly verbatim from an earlier work into a new one, for the actual wording is different in the two cases." See Langholm, *Economics in the Medieval Schools* (cit. n. 5 above), 512, and idem, *The Legacy of Scholasticism* (cit. n. 5 above), 65.

25) Schabel, 'The *Sentences* Commentary of Gerardus Odonis' (cit. n. 21 above), 120; and de Rijk's introduction to Odonis' *Opera Philosophica II* (cit. n. 12 above), 9-10.

commentary.[26] One could argue that the latter's heavy dependence on the former attracted attention to Odonis' previously overlooked commentary. As noted above, other contemporaries of Odonis took interest in his exposition of book V; his work, along with Walter Burley's, became a conduit for economic thought from earlier commentators, including Grosseteste and Albert, to Buridan, Nicole Oresme, and other later fourteenth-century thinkers.[27]

The commentary has also received increased attention as a source for the study and transmission of the *Ethics* during the Renaissance.[28] Langlois cited its influence on later works, notably Guillaume de Vaurouillon's *Sentences* commentary and Pietro Pomponazzi's *Defensorium de animae immortalite*.[29] Most recently, David Lines has surveyed the medieval and Renaissance traditions of *Ethics* commentaries and established that for the fifteenth- and sixteenth-century ethics tradition in Italy, Odonis' work stood beside that of Albert, Thomas, Walter Burley, Buridan, Henry of Friemar, and Albert of Saxony as the most vital medieval sources of ethical thought.[30]

Manuscripts and Incunabula

Eighteen manuscripts and two incunabula contain all or part of Gerald Odonis' *Ethics*:

A = Assisi, Biblioteca del Sacro Convento, 285
B = Boulogne-sur-Mer, Bibliothèque municipale, BV 111
G = Città del Vaticano, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Pal. lat. 1027

---

26) Kaye, *Economy and Nature* (cit. n. 6 above); Kent, *Aristotle and the Franciscans* (cit. n. 1 above), 124; Langholm, *The Aristotelian Analysis of Usury* (cit. n. 1 above), 29; Walsh, 'Teleology' (cit. n. 1 above), 267; J.B. Korolec, 'Les principes de la philosophie morale de Jean Buridan', *Mediaevalia Philosophica Polonorum* 21 (1975), 53-72, at 68-71; Walsh, 'Some Relationships' (cit. n. 1 above); and idem, *Aristotle's Conception of Moral Weakness* (cit. n. 1 above), 26.

27) See Langholm, *The Aristotelian Analysis of Usury* (cit. n. 1 above).

28) C. Flüeler, 'Teaching Ethics at the University of Vienna: The Making of a Commentary at the Faculty of Arts (A Case Study)', in *Virtue Ethics in the Middle Ages*, ed. Bejczy (cit. n. 7 above), 277-346; D.A. Lines, 'Sources and Authorities for Moral Philosophy in the Italian Renaissance: Aquinas and Jean Buridan on Aristotle's *Ethics*', in *Moral Philosophy on the Threshold of Modernity*, ed. J. Kraye and R. Saarinen (Dordrecht, 2005), 7-29; idem, *Aristotle's* Ethics *in the Italian Renaissance* (cit. n. 7 above); idem, 'The Commentary Literature on Aristotle's *Nicomachean Ethics* in Early Renaissance Italy: Preliminary Considerations', *Traditio* 54 (1999), 245-82.

29) Langlois, 'Guiral Ot' (cit. n. 1 above), 217.

30) Lines, *Aristotle's* Ethics *in the Italian Renaissance* (cit. n. 7 above), 112 and 467-68; and *The Commentary Literature* (cit. n. 28 above), passim.

H = Città del Vaticano, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Urb. Lat. 1369 (fragment)
C = Città del Vaticano, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Vat. lat. 2168
F = Firenze, Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana, S. Croce XIII Sin. 3
N = Firenze, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale, Conv. soppr. I.3.25
M = Madrid, Biblioteca nacional, 6546 (incomplete)
D = Padova, Biblioteca Antoniana, XVIII 389
R = Paris, Bibliothèque Mazarine, 3496
P = Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, lat. 16127
S = Salamanca, Colegio de S. Bartolomé, 1869
L = Sevilla, Biblioteca Colombina, 7.5.14
Q = Subiaco, Biblioteca statale monumento nazionale di S. Scolastica 26 (XXIV)
T = Tarazona, Archivo Catedral Capitular, 15
Z = Tarazona, Archivo Catedral Capitular, 71 (non-authorial redaction)
U = Tübingen, Universitätsbibliothek, Mc. 378 (incomplete)
W = Wien, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Palatinus 2383

X = Brescia incunabulum of 1482
V = Venezia incunabulum of 1500

Nearly all research on Odonis' *Ethics* has been based on the early printed editions of the text, especially Venice 1500, with little use made to date of the extant manuscripts.[31] Previously inventories have cited seventeen existing manuscripts and the two incunabula.[32] Charles Lohr listed fifteen manuscripts: ABCDFGHLMPR*W* plus another Vatican codex (BAV, Pal. lat. 1020) and two more Vienna witnesses (ÖNB 5149 and 5433), while he characterized three others as *olim*: Bologna, Collegio di Spagna; Rimini, Biblioteca di San Francesco; and Salamanca.[33] The Salamanca manuscript is in fact still extant (S), although Pal. lat. 1020 is not a manuscript, but simply the Brescia edition, and the two other Vienna manuscripts do not contain Odonis' text. Other witnesses have since been identified in Florence (N), Subiaco (Q), Tarazona

31) Kent used V, checked against manuscript W: *Aristotle and the Franciscans* (cit. n. 1 above), 10. Kaye had access to both printed editions: *Economics and Nature* (cit. n. 6 above), 128, n. 47; Langholm employed X: *Economics in the Medieval Schools* (cit. n. 5 above), 512; Saarinen had V: *Weakness of the Will* (cit. n. 7 above), 147.

32) See Langlois, 'Guiral Ot' (cit. n. 1 above), 216-17; C. Lohr, 'Medieval Latin Aristotle Commentaries: Authors G-I', *Traditio* 24 (1968), 163-65 (henceforth cited as Lohr); Lines, *Aristotle's* Ethics *in the Italian Renaissance* (cit. n. 7 above), 467-68; and Weijers, *Le travail intellectuel* (cit. n. 12 above), 83.

33) Lohr 164. Lohr's list comprised and supplemented the list of witnesses in Langlois' early biography of Odonis: 'Guiral Ot' (cit. n. 1 above), 216.

(T and Z), and Tübingen (U), and, with the help of the appendix below, more manuscripts, partial or complete, may yet be identified.[34]

The present study is based on an inspection of eighteen manuscript witnesses and both incunabula. As mentioned, two Vienna manuscripts are misattributions. In the case of Vienna 5433 (W_2), the text appears instead to be Jean Buridan's *Quaestiones in decem libros Ethicorum Aristotelis.* Vienna 5149 (W_3) also mirrors the questions from Buridan's *Ethics*, but a survey of several passages of text shows that it is not an exact match; this ambiguity over Buridan's text notwithstanding, W_3 does not contain Odonis' commentary. Furthermore, one of the Vatican witnesses (H) is a fragment, while the Madrid witness (M) contains only the first two full books of Odonis' *Ethics* and a fragment of book III, as well as a fragment of Walter Burley's *Ethics* commentary. The Tübingen manuscript (U) contains an abbreviated text that primarily reports the questions; conversely, one of the Tarazona codices (Z) appears to do away with the questions altogether and adapt the *lectiones* to a marginal gloss format. Finally, the Subiaco manuscript (Q) presents an even more complicated case of fragmentation, selection, and adaptation. In view of these findings, the revised count shows Odonis' commentary to survive in thirteen known complete manuscripts (ABCDFGLMPRSTW), five fragments, abbreviations, and derivative redactions (HMQUZ), and two printed editions (VX).

The incipits, explicits, and other notes found in these manuscripts mark Odonis' status as a theologian and Minister General; interestingly, two manuscripts feature references to Odonis as having training in law. The incipit in W_3 (f. 1r) makes an oblique reference to Odonis as "Necnon iuris perito eximo." More specifically, a note below the explicit in G (f. 317vb) describes him as a doctor of theology and "utriusque iuris doctor." Detailed descriptions of the witnesses follow:

A = Assisi, Biblioteca del Sacro Convento, 285[35]
14th c., 215 ff., parchment, 2 cols. Ff. 1ra-183rb, Odonis' *Ethics*; ff. 184ra-184vb, Albertus Magnus, fragment, *III Sent.*; ff. 185ra-211va, Bonaventure, *Lectura super tertium Sententiarum.*[36] Incipit, f. 1ra: "Incipit Scriptum Magistri G. super librum Ethicorum Aristotelis. Qui liber est D. Nostri Yhesu Christi concessus ad usum fr. Nichole

34) For Subiaco, see also Lines, *Aristotle's* Ethics *in the Italian Renaissance* (cit. n. 7 above), 467 and 539.

35) C. Cenci, O.F.M., *Bibliotheca manuscripta ad Sacrum conventum Assisiensem* (Perugia, 1981), vol. I, n. 163, n. 554, n. 859.

36) The Assisi text is on ff. 1r-183r, although in Lohr and Lines, *Aristotle's* Ethics *in the Italian Renaissance* (cit. n. 7 above), it appears as 1r-133r.

de Burgo Fratrum Servorum S. Marie et amicorum suorum fidelium." A note in a later hand in the top margin on f. 1r reads: "Ethicorum," and following that in a third hand: "Odonis sup. Lib. Ethicorum." No explicit or *tabula quaestionum*. Digital images accessible online [http://www.sisf-assisi.it/digitalizzazione.htm].

B = Boulogne-sur-Mer, Bibliothèque municipale, BV 111[37]
15th c., 320 ff., 2 cols. Ff. 1ra-320vb, Odonis' *Ethics*. A note in a later hand *mg. sup.* on f. 1 reads: "Fratris Gerardi Odonis in Ethicam Aristotelis." No incipit, although there may have been at one point; f. 1ra begins: "…unum hominem hec autem melioration est bonum humanum," which is the second line of q. 1 of the Prologue, meaning that the first *lectio* (*Quid est virtus scrutamur*…) and the beginning of q. 1 are missing, which in turn suggests that the opening folio has been lost. Explicit, f. 320va: "Explicit Sententia et expositio cum questionibus super librum Ethicorum, edita a reverendo patre fratre Geraldo Odonis magistro in theologia et Ordinis Fratrum Minorum generali ministro. Deo gratias." *Tabula quaestionum*: 321ra-322vb. A note on f. 1r reads: "Fratris Gerardi Odonis in Ethicam Aristotelis." Ff. 66, 67, and 68 are misbound, affecting the foliation for book II, lectio VIII, through book III, lectio I.

C = Città del Vaticano, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Vat. lat. 2168[38]
1439, 264 ff., 2 cols. Ff. 1ra-250rb, Odonis' *Ethics*; ff. 250va-260rb, idem, appended questions omitted in original text. A note on f. b reads: "Girardi Odonis in X lib. Ethic. Aristot. Eiusdem Questio utrum omnis ars sit habitus cum recta ratione factivus" and refers to a unique error in book VI by which all of the questions from lectiones V through XIII were left out of the original sequence of the text but added later on ff. 250va-260rb. Explicit, f. 250rb: "Explicit liber Ethicorum cuius expositionem et sententiam aliqualiter assumavimus prestante Deo qui operatur omnia in omnibus. Cui est honor et gloria in secula seculorum. Amen." Two notes in later hands follow below the explicit. The first reads: "Scriptus est iste liber Nuremburge per manus Johannis Rosengart de Slezia, anno Domini millesimo cccc° xxx° ix° et completus est in vigilia Corporis Christi." The second reads: "Sequitur quaestio Girardi Odonis = utrum omnis ars sit habitus cum recta rationem factivus," referring to the appended questions. *Tabula quaestionum*, 263ra-264va. A note in a third hand follows on f. 264va: "Scriptum Fratris Girardi Odonis sacre theologie doctoris eximii generalis Ordinis Minorum, in libris Ethicorum Aristotelis tempore Johannis pape xxii."

D = Padova, Biblioteca Antoniana, XVIII 389
15th c., 175 ff., 2 cols. Ff. 1ra-176rb, Odonis' *Ethics*. A note in a later cursive hand on f.1r reads: "Sententia et expositio cum questionibus in libros Ethicorum magister Geraldi Odonis minister generalis Ordinis Fratrum Minorum conventualium." Explicit

---

37) *Catalogue général des manuscrits des bibliothèques publiques*, vol. IV (Paris, 1872), 641.
38) Lohr 164; A. Maier, *Bibliothecae Apostolicae Vaticanae codices manuscripti recensiti, Codices Vaticani latini: Codices 2118-2192* (Vatican City, 1961), 139-140.

on f. 176rb: "Sententia et expositio cum questionibus super libros Ethicorum Aristotelis edita a reverendo patre fratre Geraldo Odonis magistro in theologia et Ordinis Fratrum Minorum generali ministro explicit. Deo gratias." Partial *tabula quaestionum* in a later hand, f. 176v. A unique irregularity occurs in book I: lectio VIII cuts off on f. 16va (at "maxime vero cum fruitur maximo bono"*)* and in the same sentence, with no transition, picks up near the end of lectio IX (at "est a fortuna, sed felicitas tantum"*)* then continues normally. Both of those lectures are thus incomplete, and questions 23-26 that follow lectio VIII in the other manuscripts are missing in D.

F = Firenze, Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana, S. Croce XIII Sin. 3
14th c., 262 ff., 2 cols. Ff. 1ra-262rb, Odonis' *Ethics*. No incipit; explicit on f. 262rb: "Explicit sententia et expositio cum questionibus super librum Ethicorum Aristotelis edita a fratre Gerardo Odonis de Ordine Minorum"; *tabula quaestionum,* ff. 262rb-263r.

G = Città del Vaticano, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Pal. lat. 1027[39]
15th c., 317 ff., 2 cols. Ff. 1ra-317vb, Odonis' *Ethics*. F. 1r is heavily illuminated and inscribed with a crested "B." No incipit; explicit, f. 317vb: "Explicit sententia et expositio cum questionibus super librum Ethicorum Aristotelis edita a fratre Girardo Odonis Ordinis Fratrum Minorum province Aquitanie. Deo gratias." A note in a later hand below reads: "Qui frater Girardus fuit tunc generalis minister Ordinis Minorum et sacre theologie utriusque iuris doctor et omnium scientiarum et artium peritissimus. Hoc opus omnia alia opera super librum Ethicorum excedit bene magna difficultate [*add. sed del.* ac (?)] exemplum acquisivi et demonstratum exemplari feci." Several unique scribal errors occur in G. Book III is missing several questions: lectio VI, q. 1 ends abruptly on f. 80vb, and f. 81ra begins mid-way through lectio X, q. 23. G thus omits the rest of the questions in lectio VI, as well as lectiones VII, VIII, IX and their questions, and lectio X through q. 23. A foliation error occurs in book IV: f. 115 is followed by f. 115a, then f. 116. Book VII, lectio X cuts off abruptly on f. 252rb, mid-sentence (at "Incontinens autem debilis similis est…"), at which point the text picks up mid-way through lectio XI (at "et ideo sunt indisciplinati…"); both the end of lectio X and the beginning of lectio XI are thus missing.

H = Città del Vaticano, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Urb. Lat. 1369[40]
14th/15th c., 295 ff., 1 col. Ff. 3v-252v, Walter Burley, *Expositio super X libros Ethicorum Aristotelis*; ff. 253r-255v, anonymous, *Quaestiones in aliquot libros politicorum Aristotelis*; ff. 256ra-287vb, Richard Kilvington, *Quaestiones morales*; ff. 288r-291v, *Index quaestionum in Burlei opus super Ethicam Aristotelis*; ff. 291v-293v, Odonis'

---

39) A. Mau et al., *Il catalogo dei codici Palatini latini, mss. 2-1078*, *1341-1986*, Unpublished, Saint Louis University, 144.
40) C. Stornajolo, *Codices Urbinates Latini, vol. III, Codices 1001-1179* (Rome, 1921), 287-288; Lohr 164.

Ethics (fragment). No incipit; explicit, f. 293v: "Expliciunt questiones fratris Giraldi." H is not a full witness; rather ff. 291v-293v include fifteen of the lectures and questions raised by Odonis, with brief summaries of his opinions instead of the full text. Most of these abbreviated questions come from books V and IX, and have been noted in the survey list below. Odonis' questions begin immediately (and in the same hand) following the index to Burley's *Ethics* commentary with no clear division between the texts, although a marginal note on f. 291v marks the beginning of Odonis' text: "fratris Geraldi in scripto Ethicorum." The questions included are (book-lectio-question) as follows: I.I.5 (291v-292r); I.IV.15 (292r); IV.XVIII.24 (292r); V.VII.11 (292r); V.XVII.20 (292v); V.XVII.21 (292r-v); V.XX.24 (292v-293r); IX.I.1 (293r); IX.II.2 (293r); IX.II.3 (293r); IX.II.4 (293r); IX.II.5 (293r-v); IX.II.6 (293v); IX.II.8 (293v); IX.IV (lectio) (293v).

L = Sevilla, Biblioteca Colombina, 7.5.14

14th c., 187 ff., 2 cols., but set up as a gloss, with the incipits for Aristotle's text inset between columns on ff. 3v-184v. Ff. 2ra-185rb, Odonis' *Ethics*. A note in a later hand on 1r reads: "Mag. Geraldi Odonis Expositio in Ethicas Aristotelis." Incipit, f. 2ra: "Incipit scriptum super libros Ethicorum editum a fratre Geraldo Odonis de Ordine Fratrum Minorum magistro in theologia." Explicit, f. 185r: "Explicit sententia et expositio cum questionibus super librum Ethicorum Aristotelis edita a reverendo patre fratre Geraldo Odonis magistro in theologia et Ordinis Fratrum Minorum generali ministro. Deo gratias." *Tabula quaestionum*, f. 185va-186rb. Heavily rubricated and illuminated.

M = Madrid, Biblioteca nacional, 6546[41]

14th c., 166 ff., 2 cols. M is an incomplete witness: ff. 1ra-67va, Odonis' *Ethics*, books I and II, and book III, lectio I (fragment); ff. 68ra-151vb, Walter Burley, *Ethics* commentary (frag.); ff. 152ra-152vb; *tabula quaestionum* for Odonis' *Ethics*, books I through book IV, q. 22; ff. 154ra-164vb, appended questions from book I; ff. 165ra-166rb, unknown.[42] Missing text in book I: the second question after lectio V (q. 16) begins on f. 24rb and continues through f. 25vb (ending at "virtuali in causa habet esse"), but f. 26ra begins mid-way through lectio VIII (at "ibi optimum ergo"). The following text is thus missing from the original sequence in book I, but appended in the same hand on ff. 155ra-164vb: q. 16 (fragment), qq. 17-18, lectio VI, lectio VII, qq. 19-22, and the beginning of lectio VIII. Although lectio VIII is also only a fragment in D, it cuts off at a different line, and the missing text in that case is the questions that follow lectio VIII, not those that precede it. Therefore, the book I errors in

41) See the *Inventario general de manuscritos de la Biblioteca Nacional*, vol. XI (Madrid, 1987), 212, which identifies only Burley's commentary; and C. Lohr, 'Aristotelica Matritensia', *Traditio* 53 (1998), 251-308, at 277.

42) Lohr 164: "f. 1r-67v (anon.; expl. mut.), 152r-v (tabula quaestionum I-IV), 154r-164v (I qq. 7-12)."

D and M are unique. Book II lacks clear transitions between the questions following lectio VI (qq. 11-20). Additionally, near the end of book II, the lemmata of Aristotle's text are missing, as is all other rubrication. In book III, lectio I cuts off abruptly on f. 67va (at "et sustinendi tali."); the rest of the folio is blank, and f. 68ra begins with a different text.

N = Firenze, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale, Conv. soppr. I.3.25[43]
14th c., 182 ff., 2 cols. Ff. 1ra-182rb, Odonis' *Ethics*. Parchment with illuminations, probably French in origin. Incipit, f. 1ra: "Incipit scriptum super librum Ethicorum editum a fratre Geraldo Odonis de Ordine Minorum magistro in theologia." Explicit: "Explicit sententia et expositio cum questionibus super librum Ethicorum a fratre Girando Odonis Ordinis Fratrum Minorum provincie Aquitanie." A few *pecia* marks and marginal notes. Formerly of the convent of San Marco; a note on the fly-leaf reads "de 12º banco ex parte occidentis."

P = Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, lat. 16127[44]
14th c., 169 ff., 2 cols. Ff. 2ra-168ra, Odonis' *Ethics*. No incipit; explicit, f. 168rb: "Explicit sententia et expositio cum questionibus super librum Ethicorum Aristotelis super dicit reverendo patre fratre Geraldo Odonis magistro theologia de Ordine Fratrum Minorum generali ministro. Deo gratias. Sequitur tabula." *Tabula quaestionum*, ff. 168rb-169rb. A note in French on f. 1r reads: "Ce MS du 14 siècle contiene la somme du L'Éthique d'Aristote par Gerard Odon Cordelier. l'incip.: quid est virtus?"

Q = Subiaco, Biblioteca statale monumento nazionale di Santa Scolastica, 26 (XXIV)[45]
15th c., paper, 247ff., written in a semi-Gothic book hand of German origin, 1 col. (ff. 1r-11v), then mostly 2 cols. (ff. 12r-247v). Contains Aristotle's *Ethics*, with commentary. On f. 1r, in a 16th-century hand: "Iste liber est monasterii Sublacensis signatus numero 139," corrected to 332. The commentary text is not attributed explicitly to an author. The work is divided into two continuous but heterogenous parts: I on ff. 1-118va and II on ff. 118va-247va. Section I features Leonardo Bruni's translation of the *Ethics*. The commentary in section I is initially Guido Vernani da Rimini's

---

43) G. Murano, *Opere diffuse per exemplar e pecia* (Turnhout, 2005), 448-449; B.L. Ullman and P.A. Stadter, *The Public Library of Renaissance Florence: Niccolò Niccoli, Cosimo de' Medici and the Library of San Marco* (Padua, 1972), 195, n. 621.

44) L. Delisle, *Inventaire des manuscrits latins conservés à la Bibliothèque nationale sous les numéros 8823-8613* (Hildesheim, 1974), 40.

45) R. Crociani and M. Leardini, *I manoscritti della Biblioteca statale monumento nazionale di Santa Scolastica di Subiaco* (Rome, 2006), n. 26, 51-52; T. Kaeppeli, *Scriptores Ordinis Praedicatorum Medii Aevi*, 4 vols. (Rome, 1978-93), II, 77, n. 1410; Gauthier, *Aristotelis, Ethica Nichomachea, Praefatio* (cit. n. 13 above), CLXIII, n. 208. Thomas Aquinas, *Sententia libri Ethicorum*, Leonine ed., XLVII:1, 39*.

Sententia libri Ethicorum, but then turns into Odonis' commentary, possibly as early as f. 12ra (when the script shifts to two columns), and most certainly by f. 16va (book II, *lectio* VI). While the commentary remains that of Odonis, there are minor deletions, additions, and adjustments, the lemmata have been changed to reflect the humanist translation, and, instead of a division into *lectiones*, the books are divided into *distinctiones* and *capitula*, which do not correspond precisely; so, for example, book IV, lectiones XIV-XVI, are all subsumed into *distinctio tertia* (ff. 76va-82vb), whereas book III, lectio IV, is divided into five sections, separated by the Aristotelian text (ff. 26rb-28r, 28r being in one column). Most notably, while Odonis somewhat idiosyncratically has book IV begin at 1115a6 (corresponding to book III, c. 6, according to the common and current reckoning), Q marks book IV at 1119b22. Nevertheless, at the spot where Odonis begins book IV, Q observes (f. 43va): "Distinctio sexta de fortitudine. Liber quartus secundum quosdam." At the place where Q (and the common tradition) begins book IV, one reads: "Incipit liber quartus secundum quod distinguit beatus Thomas," along with elements of Thomas' *Sententia libri Ethicorum*. Also starting from f. 16va, Section I contains questions whose titles correspond to those of Odonis' commentary (with the exception of the questions for book II, lectio VII and book III, lectio I). Section II, on the other hand, has the translation of Robert Grosseteste, divisions that correspond precisely to the Odonis lectiones (starting with book V, lectio VII), but none of the questions.

R = Paris, Bibliothèque Mazarine, 3496[46]

14th c., 256 ff., 2 cols. Ff. 1ra-64rb, Giles of Rome, *Opus super librum Ethicorum Aristotelis*; ff. 65ra-200rb, Odonis' *Ethics;* ff. 201rb-256vb, Walter Burley, *Scriptum super librum Politicorum*. A later index added on the fly leaf reads: "In Aristotelis libros Rethoricorae, Ethicorum atque Politicorum commentaria Aegidii Romani, Giraudi Odonis et Walteri Burleye," to which another hand has added "titre des trois ouvrages, Aegidius de Roma, Sententia super librum Aethicorum Aristotelis. Giraudus Odonis, commentaria super librum Ethicorum Aristotelis. Walterus Burleye, Scriptum super librum Politicorum Aristotelis." A note in a later hand on f. 65r reads: "Scriptum Giraudi Odonis (*add. sup. lin*. by a third hand) Minoris super librum Ethicorum." Explicit in a later hand, f. 200rb: "Explicit scriptum supra librum Ethicorum a fratre Geraldo Odonis, minore de conventu Pruvinensi." No *tabula quaestionum*.

S = Salamanca, Colegio de S. Bartolomé, 1869[47]

14th c., 353 ff., 1 col. through f. 267r; 2 cols., ff. 267v-282v; 283r is 1 col. Ff. 1r-346r, Odonis' *Ethics.* Incipit, f. 1r: "Incipit scriptum super librum Ethicorum fratris Geraldi Odonis Ordinis Fratrum Minorum bachalarii in theologia." (A note in a second hand in the left margin is cut off at the binding, but appears to repeat the

46) A.E.L.M. Molinier and A. d'Artois, *Catalogue des manuscrits de la Bibliothèque Mazarine* (Paris, 1890), 109.

47) See Langlois, 'Guiral Ot' (cit. n. 1 above), 216, n. 2, for provenance.

incipit verbatim.) Explicit, f. 346r: "Explicit liber Ethicorum cuius expositiam et sententiam aliqualiter assumavimus prestante Deo, qui operatur omnia in omnibus, cui est honor et gloria in secula seculorum." *Tabulae quaestionum*, ff. 347r-351r. Several folios are misnumbered, but no text is missing; foliation skips from f. 162r to 166v. Also, ff. 249v-250r and 315v-316v are skipped. S omits one question in book IX (q. 5), which seems to be a unique scribal error, as is an error in book X, lectio II, which is a fragment (ending at "et hoc modo videtur per se bonum omne") that shifts mid-sentence to a point mid-way through lectio III (at "platonici dicunt tristitiam").

T = Tarazona, Archivo Catedral Capitular, 15[48]
14th c., 177 ff., 2 cols. Ff. 1ra-177vb, Odonis' *Ethics*. Incipit, f. 1ra: "Incipit scriptum super libros Ethicorum editum a fratre Geraldo Ordinis (!) de Ordine Minorum magistro in theologia." Explicit, f. 175va: "Explicit sententia et expositio cum questionibus super librum Ethicorum Aristotelis, edita a fratre Girardo Odonis Fratrum Minorum, provincie Aquitanie. Finito libro sit laus et gloria in Christo, etc." In a later hand below is added, "Ad usum fratris (?) de (?) est Ordinis Minorum." *Tabula quaestionum*, ff. 176ra-177vb. A foliation error occurs after f. 115r, where the manuscript skips to no. 117r (116 *deest*), but no text is missing.

U = Tübingen, Universitätsbibliothek, Mc. 378.[49]
First half of 15th c., 120 ff., 1 col. Ff. 6r-120v, Odonis' *Ethics* I-IX, q. 2. Incipit, f. 6r: "Gerardus Odonis super libro Ethicorum," at the bottom of the same page, a note that reads in part "Hunc librum legavit dominus Conradus Hager, canonicus de… Frontenhausen… anno domini <15>39." Sparse annotations and marginal corrections; partial rubrication (ff. 6r-10r, 30r-32r, 35r-36r). The text is a fragmented witness that also shows signs of abbreviation. The vast majority of the lectiones are omitted or reduced to the lemma and the list of questions in the form "sequitur textus: (*lemma*). Ad evidentiam." In addition, a sounding of book I, lectio 1, q. 12, reveals that the scribe has skipped elements that might be deemed repetitive or superfluous. Furthermore, the order of the questions pertaining to book I and the first lectio of book II is particularly disrupted, such that a few of Odonis' questions are missing, and a few questions not identified with Odonis are included.[50] Along with the abbreviations and missing lectiones, we were unable to identify whether the very different lectio given for the beginning

---

48) J.R. Izquierdo, J.A.M. Armendáriz, and J.S. Ruiz, *Biblioteca de la Iglesia Catedral de Tarazona: catálogo de libros manuscritos, incunables y de música* (Zaragoza, 1984), 10.

49) G. Brinkhus and A. Mentzel-Reuters, *Die lateinischen Handschriften der Universitätsbibliothek Tübingen: Teil 2: Signaturen Mc 151 bis Mc 379 sowie die lateinischen Handschriften bis 1600 aus den Signaturengruppen Mh, Mk und aus dem Druckschriftenbestand* (Wiesbaden, 2001), 252-53. Before 1992, this manuscript had the shelf-mark Md.1.

50) Anonymous questions and texts: f. 9v-10r: "Utrum omnis operatio humana ad finem est relativa…"; f. 10r: "Utrum intentio Philosophi repugnet fidei"; f. 10v: "Utrum virtutes morales sunt in appetitu sensitivo subiective, etc."; f. 11r: "Utrum ad felicitatem requiratur usus, delectatio et spiritualis prosperitas"; f. 11r-v: "Utrum ad essentiam felicitatis pertineat gaudium de

of book VII (f. 117v-119r) and the one for all of book VIII (120r) correspond to anything in Odonis' commentary. Furthermore, the manuscript ends abruptly with folio 120, in the middle of book IX, q. 2 (Explicit: "Obediendum est principi magis quam patri in rebus domesticis"). On f. 37r there is a question associated with Durand of St.-Pourçain's commentary on book III, d. 38, of the *Sentences*.[51] The first five folios contain a few fifteenth-century charters concerning gold and spice transactions.

W = Wien, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Palatinus 2383

14th c., 129 ff.; 1 col. Ff. 1ra-125ra, Odonis' *Ethics*. Explicit, f. 125r: "Explicit sententia et expositio cum questionibus super librum Ethicorum Aristotelis, edita a fratre Geraldo Odonis, Ordinis Fratrum Minorum, de provincia Aquitanie, sacre theologie doctore et generali ministro eiusdem ordinis, quem Burydanus in suis scriptis plures sequitur, et nominatim allegat secunda et tertia questionibus noni Ethicorum." No incipit or *tabula quaestionum*. Several folios from book VII are missing, but added in a later hand immediately following book X. Book VII, lectio IV cuts off abruptly at the end of f. 95vb (at "…est ergo sciendum cum"); lectio V, lectio VI, q. 1, and the first portion of lectio VII all appear added *alia manu* on ff. 126rb-129va, after book X. (A note *sup. lin.* on f. 126ra reads: "Quod hic habentur 3 defectus huius continenti, proceditur in septimum Ethicorum post tertium folium.") Lectio VII thus begins on f. 129va, but continues back on f. 96ra with "sua primo capitulo. Consequenter ibi…" In her dissertation, Kent checked the Venice incunabulum against W, and she too noted the missing text in book VII.[52] Additionally, f. 60r and ff. 87r and 88r do not appear in the microfilm examined, and are responsible for missing foliation in books IV and VI.

W_2 = Wien, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Palatinus 5433

15th c., 504 ff., 2 cols. Lohr ascribed this work to Odonis ("ascribed; inc. [mut.]…/…fideliter est traditurus"), and the manuscript is catalogued as Odonis' *Quaestiones et tractatus super Aristotelis libros Ethicorum, cum registro subjuncto*.[53] In fact, the manuscript does not contain Odonis' work, but Buridan's *Ethics* commentary. Two notes on f. b speak to W_2's contents. The first assigns the text to Odonis, referencing the collatio to book II of his *Sentences* commentary: "Gerardus Odonis de Ordine Fratrum Minorum, baccalarius in theologia legens Sententias Parisius A.D. 1326, scripsit super secundo Sententiarum opus valens cuius principium: veni Ierosolymam videre Petrum, *Ad Galath.* primo, et continent 123 questiones et finitur sic: 'In sanctis hominibus hic in via est spirituali modo per gratiam et beatis spiritualibus superius per gloriam'." A note in a second hand below the first suggests the source of confusion:

---

bono"; ff. 11v-12r: "Utrum omnes homines summe et de necessitate velint felicitatem"; f. 20r: "Utrum omnes bonum appetant"; f. 21v: "Utrum felicitas consistat in bonis animae."

51) F. 37r, top margin: "Durandus in 3o Sententiarium, d. 38." Incipit: "Utrum virtutes morales maneant in patria."

52) Kent, *Aristotle and the Franciscans* (cit. n. 1 above), 10.

53) See Lohr 164.

"Idem scripsit subtile ac magistrale opus super libris *Ethicorum*, quod venerabilis magister Burydanus, scribens super eisdem, ante se habuit et plures eundem sequitur in eiusdem suis dictis ac ipsum allegat et sua via propria ponit, ut in primo *Ethicorum* questione quinta et in aliis locis et precipue in octavo et nono libris Ethicorum." As the reference to Buridan's use of Odonis' work in his own *Ethics* commentary suggests, a check of Walsh's 1975 overview of material overtly borrowed by Buridan from Odonis reveals the misattribution.[54]

W_3 = Wien, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Palatinus 5149

15th c., 288 ff., 1 col. As with W_2, this manuscript does not contain Odonis' *Ethics*. Ff. 1r-284r include all of the questions for books I-V of Buridan's commentary, although the text itself is an abbreviated or otherwise distinct version of his full commentary. W_3 does, however, contain Odonis' *Quaestio de vitio usurae* (ff. 284v-288r). Incipit, f. 1r: "Incipit prologus receptus a Geraldo Odonis Ordinis Fratrum Minorum de provincia Aquitanie sacre theologie professore et generali ministro eiusdem ordinis, nec non iuris perito eximo." Another note in a second hand just above the incipit, at the top edge of the folio, has been partially cut off, but appears to read: "Incipit prologus receptus a g… provincia Aquitanie sacre theologie professore et generali ministro eiusdem ordinis." Ff. 1-284 are heavily annotated.

Z = Tarazona, Archivo de la Catedral, 71[55]

14th c., 124 ff., 1 col. Ff. 1r-124r, Aristotle's *Ethics*, with a marginal gloss of Gerald Odonis' *Ethics* commentary. Heavily annotated in at least two hands, with some interlineal notation. The marginal gloss, attributed to G. Aldomar, provides the lectiones of Odonis' commentary, in most cases abbreviated at least with regard to the first few lines, and generally placed in the margin immediately parallel to the corresponding chapter. Two notes in separate hands appear on f. a. The first is illegible, as the ink appears to have been partially removed. The second, immediately below that, reads: "Iste liber est ad usum fratris G. Aldomar Ordinis Fratrum Minorum de provincia Aragonis et de custodia Ilerde (= Lerida) et de conventu Servarie (= Cervera)." A note on f. b reads: "Iste textus … est ad usum fratris G. Aldomar de Ordine Fratrum Minorum et custodia Ilerde." F. b is also illuminated with a sketch of the Virgin and Child. On f. c: "mandamus" appears in one hand; a note in a second hand below that reads: "Iste textus Ethicorum cum suo scripto…" Below that in a third hand reads: "Textus Ethicorum Ferdinandi Petri Calvielso (?) decani… decrecorum doctoris." Explicit: the last seven lines of marginal gloss on f. 124r read: "Explicit ergo liber Ethicorum cuius

---

54) See Walsh, 'Some Relationships' (cit. n. 1 above), and E. Faral, 'Jean Buridan: Notes sur les manuscrits, les éditions et le contenu de ses ouvrages', *Archives d'histoire doctrinale et littéraire du moyen âge* 15 (1946), 40-49. At least seven other known Vienna manuscripts of Buridan's *Ethics* exist; see Faral, 42, and Lines, *Aristotle's* Ethics *in the Italian Renaissance* (cit. no. 7 above), 470.

55) Identified in Gauthier, *Aristotelis, Ethica Nichomachea, Praefatio* (cit. n. 13 above), CLXIV, n. 212.

expositionem et sententiam ego frater Guillelmus Aldomar Ordinis Minorum . . . conventus Servarie ad rogamina aliquorum dominorum iurisperitorum de dicta villa super aliquibus partibus dicti libri aliqualiter secundum mentem domini magistri Geraldi Odonis olim eiusdem ordinis generalis ministri . . . ad laudem et gloriam omnipotentis Dei cui est honor et gloria per infinitam secula seculorum Amen. Deo gratias Amen. anno domini MCCCLXX." F. 125r features notes in four hands, although not all legible; the last note reads "Fratris G. Aldomar ad usum est."

Città del Vaticano, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Pal. lat. 1020

Pal. lat. 1020 has appeared alongside the above witnesses in previous lists of *Ethics* manuscripts, but it is not a manuscript at all, but the Brescia printed edition, on which see X below.[56]

X = Brescia[57]

1482, 347 ff., 2 cols. The edition is unfoliated, but the Vatican copy I inspected (Palat. lat. 1020) was bound with another work of 120 folios and then numbered 121-467. Here and in the question list I give the foliation in this copy. Ff. 121v-139r, *tabula quaestionum*; f. 139v, dedication; ff. 140-467, Gerardus Odonis, *Expositio in Aristotelis Ethicam.* Incipit, f. 140ra: "Incipit scriptum super librum Ethicorum editum a fratre Geraldo Odonis de Ordine Fratrum Minorum magistro in theologia." Explicit, f. 467r: "Explicit sententia et expositio cum questionibus super libros Ethicorum Aristotelis." Colophon below that: "Impressa ad expensas. Sp. Domini Bonifacii de manerua. AD MCCCC.lxxxii. die ultimo aprilis."

V = Venezia[58]

1500, 202 ff., 2 cols. Ff. iira-vb, *Tabula quaestionum*; iiira-xva, alphabetical table (xvb blank); ff. 1ra-192rb, Geraldus Odonis, *Sententia et Expositio cum questionibus Geraldi Odonis super libros Ethicorum Aristotelis cum Textu eiusdem*. There are many errors in

---

56) See the *Inventarium codicum Latinorum Bibliothecae Vaticanae*, vol. XIII, 132, and Lohr 164.

57) L. Hain, *Repertorium bibliographicum* (Milano, 1948), vol. III, n. 11968; R. Proctor, *An Index to the Early Printed Books in the British Museum: From the Invention of Printing to the Year 1500* (London, 1960), no. 7048; M. Stillwell, *Incunabula in American Libraries: A Second Census of Fifteenth-Century Books Owned in the United States, Mexico, and Canada* (New York, 1940), 367; J.F.S. Guillén, *Catálogo de manuscritos de la Biblioteca Colombina de Sevilla* (Seville, 2002), no. 510.

58) Hain, *Repertorium bibliographicum*, vol. III (cit. n. 57 above), n. 11969. D. Hillard, *Catalogues régionaux des incunables des bibliothèques publiques de France, 6: Bibliothèque Mazarine* (Bordeaux, 1989), n. 1479; Proctor, *An Index to the Early Printed Books* (cit. n. 57 above), no. 5628; Stillwell, *Incunabula in American Libraries* (cit. n. 57 above), 368. J. F. de Castilho Barreto e Noronha, *Relatorio ácerca da Bibliotheca nacional de Lisboa* (Lisbon, 1844), 247; and I. Collijn, *Katalog der inkunabeln der Kgl. universitaäts-bibliothek zu Uppsala* (Uppsala, 1907), no. 1121. The Venice imprint is accessible online through the BnF's Gallica catalog, which is the text used for the survey below.

numeration, and ff. 51r-54v are misnumbered and corrected according to my numbering below, as is an error in book V, where q. 19 is mislabeled as a second q. 18, leaving qq. 19 through 24 misnumbered. Incipit, f. 1ra: "Incipit scriptum super librum Ethicorum editum a fratre Geraldo Odonis de Ordine Fratrum Minorum magistro in theologia etc." Colophon, f. 192rb: "Venetiis per Simonem de Luere. Impensis domini Andree Torresani de Asula, xiiii mensis Iulii, M.d."

With the exception of HMQUZ, all the witnesses cited below contain the full commentary, AGLPRSW being the cleanest witnesses. Significant omissions indicate unique structural differences in several of the witnesses: D (omissions in book I); B (fragments in books II and III); G (omissions and fragments, books III and VII); Q (book I and part of book II omitted and replaced with commentary of Guido Vernani), U (omission of lectures *passim*; abbreviated or edited versions of some questions, and omission of book IX after lectio II, q. 2, and omission of book X); S (omissions and fragments in books IX and X); and W (qq. omitted and appended later in book VII). T also features unique structural errors, most notably lacking a clear transition between books I and II. Fuller study is needed to confirm relationships among the full witnesses and to determine what broader significance the other manuscripts convey for the reception of Odonis' commentary and its influence in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. It is possible to suggest that ABDLNP (with ADP constituting a subgrouping) and CFGSTW represent broad families based on common errors with regard to run-ons between *lectiones* and questions, although BDFLP and GNT share common or similar explicits.

In the table of lectures (*lectiones*) and question below, for convenience the numbering follows that in the incunabula (with corrections), which is employed in the secondary literature. Thus the questions are numbered sequentially throughout each book (e.g., the questions in book IV are cumulatively numbered 1-45). In the manuscripts, however, the questions that appear after the *lectiones* are numbered sequentially within their own grouping, with the first question after each *lectio* introduced as *primo*. For each *lectio* I first provide the Aristotelian lemma identifying the passage in the *Ethics* upon which each lecture is based, along with the chapter and Bekker number where the passage begins. In the manuscripts, the lemma consists of a few words, except that LQZ are set up as glosses. The editors of the Brescia and Venice incunabula have added the entire Aristotelian passage. For the questions that follow some of the *lectiones*, the titles are taken from Odonis' preliminary list that immediately follows the *lectio*, based on the majority reading

in the manuscripts. Odonis sometimes repeats a question later on when he comes to address it, often with different wording, but this is ignored here.

The *tabula* gives the foliation for all manuscripts and incunabula in square brackets. The only exception is Z, a marginal gloss prepared *secundum mentem domini Geraldi Odonis*, based on Odonis' lectures, for which the text's nature as a derivative, non-authorial redaction and the poor legibility of the microfilm combined to render its inclusion neither desirable nor practical. As the foliation for the inset text and Odonis' own commentary in L do not share the same foliation, I have indicated the beginning and end points for Aristotle's text in parenthesis, followed by the foliation for the lecture, e.g., "L (3v-5r) 3va-5ra." For questions that are matched verbatim or nearly so in the *Sentences* commentary, I give the corresponding question in parentheses according to Schabel, "The *Sentences* Commentary of Gerardus Odonis" (cit. n. 21 above), 123, = meaning verbatim, ≈ indicating close matches with different wording, || standing for looser parallels. Finally, "n.t." means "no transition from the previous unit."

Geraldi Odonis
Scriptum super libros Ethicorum
sive
Sententia et expositio cum quaestionibus super libros Ethicorum Aristotelis
Tabula lectionum et quaestionum

Prologus: Quid est virtus scrutamur ut boni efficiamur, ait Aristoteles, II *Ethicorum*… [A 1ra-b; B *deest*; C 1ra-va; D 1ra-va; F 1ra-vb; G 1ra-va; L 2ra-b; M 1ra-2ra; N 1ra-va; P 2ra-b; R 65ra-b; S 1r-2r; T 1ra-b; U 6r-v; V 1ra-b; W 1ra; X 140ra-141ra].

1. Utrum bonum humanum sive operatio humana sit subiectum primum in hac scientia [A 1va-b; B 1ra-va (fragment) C 1va-2ra; D 1va-b; F 1vb-2ra; G 1vb-2ra; L 2rb-va; M 2ra-vb; N 1va-1vb; P 2rb-va; R 65rb-va; S 2r-v; T 1rb-vb; U 6v-7r; V 1rb-va; W 1ra-va; X 141ra-va]

2. Utrum homo ut liber [A 1vb; B 1va-b; C 2ra-b; D 1vb-2ra; F 2rb-va; G 2ra-b; L 2va-b; M 2vb-3rb; N 1vb-2ra; P 2va-b; R 65va-b; S 2v-3r; T 1vb-2ra; U 7r-v; V 1va-b; W 1va-b; X 141va-142ra]

3. Utrum haec scientia sola sit practica [A 1vb-2rb; B 1vb-2vb; C 2rb-vb; D 2ra-va; F 2va-3rb; G 2rb-3ra; L 2vb-3ra; M 3rb-4rb; N 2ra-vb; P 2vb-3rb; R 65vb-66ra; S 3r-4r; T 2ra-b; U 7v-8r; V 1vb-2rb; W 1vb-2ra; X 142ra-vb]

4. Utrum sit sufficienter divisa in ethicam economicam et politicam [A 2rb-va; B 2vb-3rb; C 2vb-3va; D 2va-vb; F 3rb-vb; G 3ra-va; L 3ra-rb; M 4rb-5ra; N 2vb-3ra; P 3rb-va; R 66ra-rb; S 4r-5r; T 2rb-vb; U 8r-v; V 2rb-va; W 2ra-rb; X 142vb-143va]

Liber primus

Lectio I: Omnis ars et omnis doctrina: c. 1: 1094a1 [A 2va-4ra; B 3va-6rb; C 3va-5va; D 2vb-4va; F 3vb-6rb; G 3va-5vb; L (3v-5r) 3va-5ra; M 5ra-8va; N 3ra-5ra; P 3va-5ra; R 66rb-67va; S 5r-9r; T 2vb-4va; U 8v-9r; V 2va-4rb; W 2rb-3va; X 143va-146vb]

5. Utrum omnia appetant bonum tanquam finem [A 4ra-b; B 6va-7ra; C 5va-6ra; D 4va-b; F 6rb-vb; G 5vb-6ra; H 291v-292r; L 5ra-b; M 8va-9rb; N 5ra-b; P 5ra-b; R 67va-b; S 9v-10r; T 4va-b; U 18r-19v; V 4rb-va; W 3va; X 146vb-147rb]

6. Utrum homo habeat esse et vivere propter finem [A 4rb-va; B 7ra-va; C 6ra-b; D 4vb-5ra; F 6vb-7ra; G 6ra; L 5rb-va; M 9rb-vb; N 5rb-va; P 5rb-va; R 67vb-68ra; S 10r-v; T 4vb-5ra; U 9r-v; V 4va-b; W 3va-b; X 147rb-147vb]

7. Utrum omnes operationes humanae habeant unum finem [A 4va-b; B 7va-8ra; C 6rb-vb; D 5ra-b; F 7ra-va; G 6ra; L 5va-6ra; M 9vb-10vb; N 5va-6ra; P 5va-b; R 68ra-b; S 11r-v; T 5ra-b; U 9v; V 4vb-5ra; W 3vb-4ra; X 147vb-148va]

8. Utrum civilis scientia et tota humana vita habeant eundem finem [A 4vb-5rb; B 8ra-9ra; C 6vb-7va; D 5va-6ra; F 7va-8rb; G 6ra-7ra; L 6ra-va; M 10vb-

12ra; N 6ra-va; P 5vb-6rb; R 68rb-va; S 11v-13r; T 5rb-6ra; U 20r-21r; V 5ra-va; W 4ra-va; X 148va-149va]

Lectio II: Dicitur autem sufficienter: c. 3: 1094b11 [A 5rb-va; B 9rb-vb; C 7va-8ra; D 6ra-b; F 8rb-vb; G 7ra-8va; L (5r-6r) 6va-b; M 12ra-vb; N 6va-b; P 6rb-va; R 68va-vb; S 13r-14r; T 6ra-b; U *deest*; V 5va-b; W 4va-b; X 149va-150ra]

Lectio III: Unusquisque autem: c. 3: 1094b27 [A 5va-b; B 9vb-10va; C 8ra-va; D 6rb-va; F 8vb-9va; G 8va-9rb; L (6r-v) 6vb-7ra; M 12vb-13va; N 6vb-7rb; P 6va-b; R 68vb-69ra; S 14r-15r; T 6rb-va; U *deest*; V 5vb-6ra; W4vb-5ra; X 150ra-vb]

9. Utrum moralis scientia sit in primo gradu certitudinis [A 5vb-6ra; B 10va-11ra; C 8va-9ra; D 6va-7ra; F 9va-10ra; G 9rb-vb; L 7ra-b; M 13va-14va; N 7rb-vb; P 6vb-7ra; R 69ra-b; S 15r-v; T 6va-7ra; U 12r; V 6rb-va; W 5ra; X 150vb-151rb]

10. Utrum sit ad audiendum utilis [A 6ra-b; B 11ra-va; C 9ra-b; D 7ra-b; F 10ra-b; G 9vb-10ra; L 7rb-va; M 14va-15ra; N 7vb-8ra; P 7ra-b; R 69rb-va; S 15v-16r; T 7ra-b; U 21r-v; V 6va-b; W 5ra-b; X 151va-b]

Lectio IV: Dicamus autem resumentes: c. 4: 1095a14 [A 6rb-7va; B 11va-13vb; C 9rb-11ra; D 7rb-8va; F 10rb-12va; G 10ra-12rb; L (6v-9v) 7va-8va; M 15ra-18ra; N 8ra-9va; P 7rb-8va; R 69va-70va; S 16v-19v; T 7rb-8vb; V 6vb-8rb; W 5rb-6rb; X 151vb-154va]

11. Utrum felicitas sit bona vita et feliciter vivere idem quod bene vivere [A 7va-b; B 14ra-b; C 11ra-b; D 8va; F 12va-b; G 12rb-va; L 8va-b; M 18ra-b; N 9va; P 8va; R 70va; S 20r; T 8vb; U *deest*; V 8rb; W 6rb; X 154va-b]

12. Utrum felicitas consistat in bonis exterioribus (≈ *Sent.* IV.49.1) [A 7vb-8rb; B 14rb-15ra; C 11rb-vb; D 8va-9ra; F 12vb-13va; G 12vb-13va; L 8vb-9ra; M 18rb-19rb; N 9va-10ra; P 8va-9ra; R 70va-71ra; S 20r-21v; T 8vb-9rb; U 13r-v; V 8rb-vb; W 6rb-va; X 154vb-155vb]

13. Utrum consistat in bonis corporis (≈ *Sent.* IV.49.2) [A 8rb-va; B 15ra-va; C 11vb-12ra; D 9ra-b; F 13va-14ra; G 13vb-14ra; L 9ra-b; M 19rb-20ra; N 10ra-va; P 9ra-b; R 71ra-b; S 21v-22r; T 9rb-vb; U 13v; V 8vb-9ra; W 6va-b; X 155vb-156rb]

14. Utrum consistat in bonis spiritualibus animae (|| *Sent.* IV.49.3) [A 8va; B 15va-b; C 12ra-b; D 9rb-va; F 14ra-b; G 14ra-b; L 9rb-va; M 20ra-b; N 10va; P 9rb; R 71rb; S 22r-v; T 9vb; U 13v-14r; V 9ra; W 6vb-7ra; X 156rb-va]

Lectio V: Quod autem universale melius est: c. 6: 1096a11 [A 8va-9va; B 15vb-17va; C 12rb-13vb; D 9va-10va; F 14rb-15vb; G 14rb-15vb; L (9v-11v) 9va-10va; M 20rb-22va; N 10va-11vb; P 9rb-10rb; R 71rb-72ra; S 22v-25r; T 9vb-11ra; U *deest*; V 9rb-10rb; W 7ra-va; X 156va-158rb]

15. Utrum veritas sit praeferenda amicitiae (*Sent.* III.38.3) [A 9va-10rb; B 17va-18vb; C 13vb-14vb; D 10va-11ra; F 15vb-16va; G 15vb-16vb; H 292r; L 10va-11ra; M 22va-24ra; N 11vb-12rb; P 10rb-vb; R 72ra-va; S 25r-26v; T 11ra-va; U 14r-15r; V 10rb-11ra; W 7va-8ra; X 158rb-159va]

16. Utrum sit aliquod bonum per essentiam [A 10rb-11ra; B 18vb-20rb; C 14vb-15va; D 11ra-vb; F 16va-17vb; G 15vb-18rb; L 11ra-vb; M 24rb-25vb

(fragment) and 154ra-155ra; N 12rb-13rb; P 10vb-11va; R 72va-73ra; S 26v-28v; T 11va-12va; U *deest*; V 11ra-va; W 8ra-va; X 159va-161ra]

17. Utrum bonum dicatur univoce de singulis bonis [A 11ra-b; B 20rb-21ra; C 15va-16ra; D 11vb-12rb; F 17vb-18rb; G 18rb-vb; L 11vb-12rb; M 155ra-vb; N 13rb-va; P 11va-b; R 73ra-rb; S 28v-29v; T 12va-b; U 15r; V 11va-b; W 8va-b; X 161ra-va]

18. Utrum bonum per essentiam felicitet hominem [A 11rb; B 21ra-b; C 16ra-b; D 12rb-va; F 18rb-va; G 18vb-19ra; L 12rb; M 155vb-156rb; N 13va-b; P 11vb; R 73rb; S 29v-30r; T 12vb-13ra; U *deest*; V 11vb-12ra; W 8vb; X 161va-b]

Lectio VI: Rursus autem redeamus: c. 7: 1097a15 [A 11va-12vb; B 21rb-24rb; C 16rb-18rb D 12va-13vb; F 18va-20vb; G 19ra-21va; L (11v-13v) 12rb-13vb; M 156rb-159va; N 13vb-15va; P 11vb-13ra; R 73rb-74va; S 30r-33v; T 13ra-14rb; U *deest*; V 12ra-13va; W 8vb-9ra; X 162ra-164vb]

Lectio VII: Circumscribatur igitur: c. 7: 1098a20 [A 12vb-13ra; B 24rb-vb; C 18va-b; D 13vb-14ra; F 20vb-21rb; G 21va-22ra; L (13v-14r) 13vb-14ra; M 159va-160ra; N 15va-b; P 13ra-b; R 74va-b; S 33v-34v; T 14rb-va; U *deest*; V 13va-14ra; W 9ra-10ra; X 164vb-165rb]

19. Utrum humana felicitas consistat in uno bono vel in pluribus [A 13ra-b; B 24vb-25rb; C 18vb-19rb; D 14rb-va; F 21rb-vb; G 22ra-va; L 14ra-b; M 160ra-161ra; N 15vb-16ra; P 13rb-va; R 74vb-75ra; S 34v-35r; T 14va-15ra; U 21v-22r; V 14ra-b; W 10ra-b; X 165rb-vb]

20. Utrum bonum propter se et non propter alterum appetibile sit melius bono propter se et propter alterum appetibili [A 13va-b; B 25rb-26ra; C 19rb-vb; D 14va-b; F 21vb-22rb; G 22va-23ra; L 14rb-vb; M 161ra-vb; N 16ra-va; P 13vb-14ra; R 75ra-b; S 35v-36r; U 22r-23r; T 15ra-b; V 14rb-va; W 10rb-va; X 165vb-166va]

21. Utrum operatio in qua principaliter consistit felicitas sit operatio intellectus vel voluntatis [A 13vb-14va; B 26rb-27va; C 19vb-20va; D 14vb-15va; F 22rb-23rb; G 23ra-24rb; L 14vb-15rb; M 161vb-163rb; N 16va-17rb; P 14ra-va; R 75rb-va; S 36r-38r; T 15rb-vb; U 15v-16v; V 14va-15ra; W 10va-11ra; X 166va-167vb]

22. Utrum principium sit plusquam medietas totius operis [A 14va; B 27va-b; C 20va-b; D 15va-b; F 23rb-va; G 24rb-vb; L 15rb; M 163rb-vb; N 17rb-va; P 14va-b; R 75vb; S 38r-v; T 15vb-16ra; U 23r; V 15ra-b; W 11ra-b; X 167vb-168ra]

Lectio VIII: Scrutandum ergo: c. 8: 1098b9 [A 14va-15va; B 27vb-29vb; C 20vb-22rb; D 15vb-16va (partial); F 23va-25ra; G 24vb-26va; L (14r-17r) 15rb-16va; M 26ra-27ra (fragment) and 163vb-164vb; N 17va-18vb; P 14vb-15va; R 75vb-76va; S 38v-41r; T 16ra-17ra; U *deest*; V 15rb-16va; W 11rb-12ra; X 168ra-169vb]

23. Utrum ad felicitatem requiratur virtutis usus [A 15va-16ra; B 29vb-30va; C 22rb-vb; D *deest*; F 25ra-va; G 26va-27rb; L 16va-b; M 27ra-vb; N 18vb-19rb;

P 15va-16ra; R 76va-b; S 41r-42r; T 17ra-b; U 23r-v; V 16va-b; W 12ra-b; X 169vb-170va]

24. Utrum delectatio (|| *Sent.* IV.49.7) [A 16ra-b; B 30va-31rb; C 22vb-23va; D *deest*; F 25va-26rb; G 27rb-28ra; L 16vb-17rb; M 27vb-28vb; N 19rb-vb; P 16ra-b; R 76vb-77ra; S 42r-43r; T 17rb-vb; U 16v; V 16vb-17rb; W 12rb-va; X 170va-171rb]

25. Utrum temporalis prosperitas [A 16rb-va; B 31rb-va; C 23va; D *deest*; F 26rb; G 28ra; L 17rb; M 28vb; N 19vb; P 16rb-va; R 77ra-b; S 43v; T 17vb; U 23v-24r; V 17rb; W 12va-b; X 171rb-va]

26. Utrum bona corporis dispositio [A 16va-b; B 31va-32rb; C 23va-24ra; D *deest*; F 26rb-27ra; G 28ra-va; L 17rb-va; M 28vb-29va; N 19vb-20rb; P 16va-b; R 77rb-va; S 43v-44v; T 17vb-18rb; U 24r-v; V 17rb-va; W 12vb-13ra; X 171va-172ra]

Lectio IX: Unde et quaeritur: c. 9: 1099b9 [A 16vb-17rb; B 32rb-33rb; C 24ra-vb; D 16vb (fragment); F 27ra-vb; G 28va-29va; L (17r-18r) 17va-18ra; M 29va-30va; N 20rb-vb; P 16vb-17rb; R 77va-vb; S 44v-46r; T 18rb-vb; U *deest*; V 17va-18rb; W 13ra-b; X 172ra-173ra]

27. Utrum <felicitas> insit hominibus a fortuna [A 17rb-va; B 33rb-va; C 24vb-25ra; D 16vb; F 27vb; G 29va-b; L 18ra-b; M 30va-b; N 20vb-21ra; P 17rb; R 77vb-78ra; S 46r; T 18vb; U 24v; V 18rb; W 13rb-va; X 173ra-b]

28. An a causa humana [A 17va; B 33va-b; C 25ra-b; D 16vb-17ra; F 27vb-28ra; G 29vb-30ra; L 18rb-va; M 30vb-31rb; N 21ra; P 17va; R 78ra; S 46r-v; T 18vb-19ra; U 24v-25r; V 18rb-va; W 13va; X 173rb-vb]

29. Utrum a causa divina [A 17va-b; B 33vb-34ra; C 25rb; D 17ra-b; F 28ra-b; G 30ra-b; L 18va; M 31rb-va; N 21ra-b; P 17va; R 78ra-b; S 46v-47r; T 19ra-b; U 25r; V 18va; W 13va; X 173vb-174ra]

Lectio X: Multae autem transmutationes: c. 9: 1100a5 [A 17vb-19rb; B 34ra-37rb; C 25rb-27rb; D 17rb-18vb; F 28rb-30rb; G 30rb-32va; L (18v-21r) 18va-20ra; M 31va-34rb; N 21rb-22vb; P 17va-18vb; R 78rb-79rb; S 47r-50v; T 19rb-20va; U *deest*; V 18va-20va; W 13va-14vb; X 173ra-176rb]

30. Utrum inter fortunas huius vitae possit haberi felicitas [A 19rb; B 37rb-va; C 27rb-va; D 18vb-19ra; F 30rb-va; G 32va-b; L 20ra; M 34rb-vb; N 22vb-23ra; P 18vb-19ra; R 79rb; S 50v-51r; T 20va; U 25r-v; V 20va; W 14vb; X 176rb-va]

31. Utrum intentio Aristotelis de positione felicitatis concordet vel repugnet veritati et fidei Christianae [A 19rb-vb; B 37va-38va; C 27va-28rb; D 19ra-b; F 30va-31rb; G 32vb-33vb; L 20ra-va; M 34vb-35vb; N 23ra-va; P 19ra-b; R 79rb-va; S 51r-52r; T 20vb-21ra; U 25v-26r; V 20va-21ra; W 14vb-15ra; X 176vb-177va]

Lectio XI: Determinatis autem his: c. 12: 1101b10 [A 19vb-20ra; B 38va-39ra; C 28rb-va; D 19rb-vb; F 31rb-va; G 33vb-34rb; L (21r-22r) 20va-b; M 35vb-36rb; N 23va-b; P 19rb-va; R 79va-b; S 52r-v; T 21ra-b; U *deest*; V 21ra-va; W 15ra-b; X 177va-178ra]

32. Utrum felicitas sit laudabilis [A 20ra-b; B 39ra-va; C 28va-29ra; D 19vb-20ra; F 31va-32ra; G 34rb-vb; L 20vb-21rb; M 36rb-37ra; N 23vb-24ra; P 19va-b; R 79vb-80ra; S 52v-53v; T 21rb-va; U 17r; V 21va-b; W 15rb-va; X 178ra-va]

Lectio XII: Si autem felicitas: c. 13: 1102a5 [A 20rb-21rb; B 39va-41rb; C 29ra-30rb; D 20ra-21ra; F 32ra-33rb; G 34vb-35rb; L (22r-23v) 21rb-22ra; M 37ra-38vb; N 24rb-25ra; P 19vb-20vb; R 80ra-vb; S 53v-54r; T 21va-22va; U *deest*; V 21vb-23ra; W 15va-16rb; X 178va-180rb]

33. Utrum ad moralem scientiam pertineat inquirere totam dispositionem hominis naturalem [A 21rb-22ra; B 41va-43rb; C 30rb-31vb; D 21ra-22ra; F 33rb-34vb; G 36rb-38rb; L 22ra-23rb; M 39ra-40vb; **N** 25rb-26rb; P 20vb-21va; R 80vb-81va; S 54v-57v; T 22va-23va; U 30r-31; V 23ra-vb; W 16rb-17ra; X 180rb-182ra]

34. Utrum potentiae animae sint inter se et ab anima realiter distinctae [A 22ra-vb; B 43rb-44rb; C 31vb-32rb; D 22ra-va; F 34vb-35rb; G 38rb-39ra; L 23rb-va; M 40vb-41va; N 26rb-vb; P 21va-22ra; R 81va-b; S 57v-58v; T 23va-24ra; U 26r-v; V 24ra-b; W 17ra-b; X 182rb-183ra]

35. Utrum appetitus intellectivus sit rationalis per essentiam aut participationem tantum [A 22vb; B 44rb-va; C 32rb-va; D 22va-b; F 35rb-vb; G 39ra-b; L 23va-b; M 41va-vb; N 26vb; P 22ra-b; R 81vb; S 58v-59r; T 24ra; U 17r-v; V 24rb-va; W 17rb; X 183ra-b]

36. Utrum virtutes morales sint in appetitu sensitivo vel intellectivo (= *Sent.* II.25) [A 22vb-23rb; B 44va-45va; C 32va-33ra; D 22vb-23rb; F 35va-36rb; G 39rb-40rb; L 23vb-24rb; M 41vb-43ra; N 26vb-27va; P 22rb-va; R 81vb-82rb; S 59r-60r; T 24ra-va; U 26v-27r; V 24va-b; W 17rb-vb; X 183rb-184rb]

Liber secundus

Lectio I: Duplici autem existente virtute: c. 1: 1103a14 [A 23rb-24ra; B 45va-47ra; C 33rb-34ra; D 23rb-24ra; F 36rb-37rb; G 40rb-41va; L (24r-25v) 24rb-vb; M 43va-45ra; N 27va-28rb; P 22vb-23rb; R 82rb-vb; S 60v-62v; T 24va-25rb; U *deest*; V 25ra-vb; W 17vb-18rb; X 184va-185va]

1. Utrum naturalis appetitus possit assuefieri ad oppositum eius ad quod naturaliter inclinatur [A 24ra-b; B 47ra-vb; C 34ra-vb; D 24ra-va; F 37rb-vb; G 41va-42va; L 25ra-rb; M 45ra-vb; N 28rb-va; P 23rb-vb; R 82vb-83ra; S 62r-63r; T 25rb-vb; U 31r-v; V 25vb-26ra; W 18rb-va; X 185va-186rb]

2. Utrum virtutes morales generentur a natura, vel ex doctrina, vel ex consuetudine (*Sent.* II.27.1) [A 24rb-vb; B 47vb-48va; C 34vb-35rb; D 24va-25ra; F 37vb-38va; G 42va-43rb; L 25rb-va; M 45vb-47ra; N 28va-29ra; P 23vb-24ra; R 83ra-b; S 63r-64r; T 25vb-26ra; U 27r-28r; V 26ra-va; W 18va-b; X 186rb-187rb]

3. Utrum corrumpi possent [A 24vb-25ra; B 48va-49ra; C 35ra-va; D 25ra-b; F 38va-39ra; G 43rb-vb; L 25vb; M 47ra-va; N 29ra-b; P 24ra-b; R 83rb-va; S 64r-v; T 26ra-b; V 26va-b; W 18vb-19ra; X 187rb-va]

Lectio II: Quoniam igitur praesens negotium: c. 2: 1103b26 [A 25ra-26vb; B 49ra-52ra; C 35va-37vb; D 25rb-27ra; F 39ra-41va; G 43rb-46vb; L (25v-28v)

25vb-27rb; M 47va-50ra; N 29rb-31ra; P 24rb-25vb; R 83va-84va; S 64v-67r; T 26rb-27vb; U *deest*; V 26vb-28va; W 19ra-20ra; X 187va-190vb]

4. Utrum ex unica operatione possit generari virtus [A 26vb-27ra; B 52rb-53ra; C 37vb-38va; D 27ra-va; F 41va-42rb; G 46vb-47va; L 27rb-vb; M 50ra-51ra; N 31ra-va; P 25vb-26ra; R 84va-b; S 67r-68r; T 28ra-b; U 28r-29r; V 28vb-29ra; W 20ra-b; X 190vb-191va]

5. Utrum operationes virtutem praecedentes et sequentes sint eiusdem speciei [A 27ra-va; B 53ra-va; C 38va-b; D 27va-b; F 42rb-vb; G 47vb-48rb; L 27vb-28ra; M 51ra-vb; N 31va-b; P 26ra-b; R 84vb-85ra; S 68r-69r; T 28rb-va; U 32r; V 29ra-b; W 20rb-va; X 191va-192ra]

6. Utrum virtus sit magis circa delectationes quam circa tristitias [A 27va-b; B 53va-54ra; C 39ra-b; D 27vb-28ra; F 42vb-43ra; G 48rb-vb; L 28ra-b; M 51vb-52va; N 32ra-b; P 26rb-va; R 85ra-b; S 69r-v; T 28va-vb; U 32r-v; V 29rb-va; W 20va-b; X 192ra-vb]

7. Utrum virtus sit impassibilitas animae [A 27vb-28ra; B 54ra-va; C 39rb-va; D 28ra-b; F 43ra-va; G 48vb-49rb; L 28rb-va; M 52va-53ra; N 32rb-va; P 26va-b; R 85rb-va; S 69v-70r; T 28vb-29ra; U 29r; V 29va-b; W 20vb; X 192vb-193ra]

Lectio III: Quaeret autem utique aliquis: c. 4: 1105a17 [A 28ra-rb; B 54va-55ra; C 39va-40ra; D 28rb-va; F 43va-b; G 49rb-vb; L (28v-29v) 28va-29ra; M 53ra-vb; N 32va-b, P 26vb-27ra; Q 12ra-vb; R 85va-b; S 70r-v; T 29ra-va; U *deest*; V 29vb-30rb; W 20vb-21ra; X 193rb-vb]

8. Utrum non iustus possit operari iusta et non temperatus temperata et sic de aliis circa quamlibet virtutem [A 28rb-vb; B 55ra-56ra; C 40ra-vb; D 28va-29ra; F 43vb-44va; G 49vb-50vb; L 29ra-va; M 53vb-54vb; N 32vb-33rb; P 27ra-va; R 85vb-86ra; S 70v-71v; T 29va-b; U 32v-33r; V 30rb-vb; W 21ra-b; X 193vb-194vb]

Lectio IV: Post haec autem: c. 5: 1105b19 [A 28vb-29ra; B 56ra-va; C 40vb-41ra; D 29ra-b; F 44va-b; G 50vb-51ra; L (29v-30v) 29va; M 54vb-55rb; N 33rb-va; P 27va-b; Q 12vb-13va(?); R 86ra-b; S 71v-72r; T 29vb-30ra; U *deest*; V 30vb-31ra; W 21va; X 194vb-195ra]

9. Utrum secundum passiones dicamur studiosi vel pravi, laudandi vel vituperandi [A 29ra-vb; B 56va-58ra; C 41ra-42rb; D 29rb-30rb; F45ra-46rb; G 51ra-52vb; L 29va-30va; M 55rb-57rb; N 33va-34va; P 27vb-28va; R 86rb-vb; S 72r-73v; T 30ra-31ra; U 33v-34v; V 31ra-vb; W 21va-22ra; X 195ra-196vb]

10. Utrum habitus sit genus virtutis [A 29vb-30ra; B 58ra-va; C 42rb-va; D 30rb; F 46rb; G 52vb-53ra; L 30va; M 57rb-va; N 34va; P 28va; R 86vb-87ra; S 74r; T 31ra; U 33r-v; V 31vb-32ra; W 22rb; X 196vb-197ra]

Lectio V: Oportet autem non solum: c. 6: 1106a14 [A 30ra-vb; B 58ra-59va; C 42va-43rb; D 30rb-31ra; F 46rb-47rb; G 53ra-54ra; L (30v-32r) 30va-31ra; M 57va-58vb; N 34va-35rb; P 28va-29ra; R 87ra-b; S 74r-75v; T 31ra-vb; U *deest*; V 32ra-vb; W 22rb-vb; X 197ra-198rb]

Lectio VI: Est ergo virtus habitus electivus: c. 6: 1106b36 [A 30vb-31ra; B 59va-60ra; C 43rb-vb; D 31ra-b; F 47rb-vb; G 54ra-vb; L (32r-33r) 31rb-va; M 58vb-59va;

N 35rb-vb; P 29ra; Q 14vb-16va; R 87rb-va; S 75v-76r; T 31vb-32ra; U *deest*; V 32vb-33rb; W 22vb-23ra; X 198rb-199ra]

11. Utrum virtus sit dispositio activa vel passiva respectu propriae operationis [A 31ra-b; B 60ra-vb; C 44ra-b; D 31va; F 48ra-b; G 55ra-b; L 31va-b; M 59va-60ra; N 35vb-36ra; P 29va-b; Q 16va; R 87vb; S 76v-77r; T 32ra-b; U 35r; V 33rb-va; W 23ra; X 199ra-va]

12. Quae est prima regula operis virtuosi [A 31rb; B 60vb; C 44rb (n.t.); D 31va-b; F 48rb; G 55rb-va; L 31vb; M 60ra (n.t.); G 55va-b; N 36ra; P 29vb; Q 16va; R 87vb; S 77r; T 32rb-va; U 35r; V 33va; W 23ra-b; X 199va-b]

13. Quomodo bonitas operis virtuosi consistat in medio [A 31rb-va; B 60vb-61ra; C 44rb-va; D 31vb; F 48rb-va; G 55va-b; L 31vb-32ra; M 60ra-b (n.t.); N 36ra-b; P 29vb; Q 16va; R 87vb-88ra (n.t.); S 77r-v; T 32va; U 35v; V 33va; W 23rb; X 199vb-200ra]

14. Quomodo malitia peccati deviet a medio [A 31va; B 61ra-b; C 44va; D 31vb-32ra; F 48va-b; G 55vb; L 32ra; M 60rb-va (n.t.); N 36rb; P 29vb-30ra; Q 16va; R 88ra; S 77v; T 32va; U 35v; V 33va-b; W 23rb; X 200ra]

15. Utrum habitus virtutis sit medius inter habitus vitiosos, sicut rubeum inter album et nigrum [A 31va-b; B 61rb-va; C 44va-b; D 32ra; F 48vb-49ra; G 55vb-56ra; L 32ra-rb; M 60va (n.t.); N 36rb; P 30ra; Q 16va; R 88ra; S 77v-78r; T 32va-b; U 35v; V 33vb; W 23rb; X 200ra-b-b]

16. Utrum passio per virtutem regulata sit medium inter extremas passiones, sicut temperatum inter intensum et remissum [A 31vb; B 61va-b; C 44vb; D 32ra-b; F 49ra; G 56ra-b; L 32rb; M 60va-b (n.t.); N 36va; P 30ra-b; Q 16vb; R 88ra-b; S 78r; T 32vb; U 36r; V 33vb-34ra; W 23rb-va; X 200rb-va]

17. Utrum virtus intellectualis consistat in medio [A 31vb; B 61vb; C 44vb-45ra; D 32rb; F 49ra; G 56rb; L 32rb; M 60vb (n.t.); N 36va; P 30rb; Q 16vb; R 88rb; S 78r; T 32vb; U 36r; V 34ra; W 23va; X 200va]

18. Utrum virtus moralis sit melior intellectuali [A 31vb-32ra; B 61vb; C 45ra; D 32rb; F 49ra-rb; G 56rb; L 32rb; M 60vb-61ra (n.t.); N 36va; P 30rb; Q 16vb; R 88rb; S 78r; T 32vb-33ra; U 36r; V 34ra; W 23vb; X 200va-b]

19. Utrum certior [A 32ra-b; B 61vb-62vb; C 45ra-va; D 32rb-va; F 49rb-va; G 56rb-57ra; L 32rb-vb; M 61ra-va (n.t.); N 36va-b; P 30rb-va; Q 16vb; R 88rb-va; S 78r-79r; T 33ra-b; U 36r-v; V 34ra-b; W 23va-b; X 200vb-201rb]

20. Utrum definitio virtutis sit bene assignata (≈ *Sent.* II.27.2) [A 32rb-va; B 62vb-63ra; C 45va-b; D 32va-b; F 49va-50ra; G 57ra-b; L 32vb-33ra; M 61va-b (n.t.); N 36vb-37ra; P 30va-b; Q 16vb; R 88va; S 79r-v; T 33rb-va; U 36v; V 34rb-va; W 23vb; X 201rb-vb]

Lectio VII: Oportet non solum universaliter dici: c. 7: 1107a28 [A 32va-33ra; B 63ra-64ra; C 45vb-46va; D 32vb-33va; F 50ra-vb; G 57rb-58va; L (33r-35r) 33ra-va; M 61vb-63ra; N 37ra-vb; P 30vb-31rb; Q 16vb-17rb; R 88va-89ra; S 79v-81r; T 33va-34ra; U *deest*; V 34va-35va; W 23vb-24rb; X 201vb-202vb]

21. Utrum virtus convenienter dividatur in quatuor cardinales, scilicet prudentiam, iustitiam, fortitudinem, et temperantiam (= *Sent.* III.33.1) [A 33ra-b; B 64ra-va; C 46va-47ra; D 33va-b; F 51ra-b; G 58va-59ra; L 33va-b; M 63ra-b; N 37vb-38ra; P 31rb-va; Q *deest*; R 89ra-b; S 81r-v; T 34ra-rb; U 37v; V 35va-b; W 24rb-va; X 203ra-b]

22. Utrum virtus moralis convenienter dividatur in istas quatuor de quibus hic agitur et in virtutem vel in virtutes iustitiae [A 33rb-vb; B 64va-65va; C 47ra-va; D 33vb-34rb; F 51rb-52ra; G 59ra-vb; L 33vb-34rb; M 63rb-64ra; N 38ra-va; P 31va-32ra; Q *deest*; R 89rb-va; S 81v-82v; T 34rb-vb; U 37v-38v; V 35vb-36ra; W 24va-b; X 203rb-204rb]

Lectio VIII: Tribus autem dispositionibus: c. 8: 1108b11 [A33vb-34rb; B 65va-b (fragment) and 67ra-b; C 47va-48rb; D 34rb-va; F 52ra-va; G 59vb-60va; L (35r-36r) 34rb-vb; M 64ra-vb; N 38va-39ra; P 32ra-va; Q 17rb-18rb; R 89va-b; S 82v-83v; T 34vb-35ra; U *deest*; V 36ra-va; W 24vb-25ra; X 204rb-205ra]

23. Utrum extrema vitia magis opponantur inter se quam virtuti mediae [A 34rb; B 67rb-va; C 48rb-va; D 34va-b; F 52vb-53ra; G 60va-b; L 34vb-35ra; M 64vb-65ra; N 39ra; P 32va; Q 18rb; R 89vb-90ra; S 83v-84r; T 35rb; U 38v; V 36vb; W 25ra-b; X 205ra-b]

24. Utrum virtus minus distet ab uno extremo vitio quam ab alio [A 34rb-va; B 67va-b; C 48va; D 34vb-35ra; F 53ra; G 60vb-61rb; L 35ra; M 65ra-b; N 39ra-b; P 32va-b; Q 18rb; R 90ra; S 84r-v; T 35rb-va; U 38v; V 36vb-37ra; W 25rb; X 205rb-vb]

25. Utrum universaliter maius bonum contrarietur maiori malo [A 34va-b; B 67va (fragment) and 66ra-va; C 48va-49ra; D 35ra-b; F 53ra-va; G 61rb-vb; L 35ra-va; M 65rb-va; N 39rb-va; P 32vb-33ra; Q 18rb; R 90ra-b; S 84v-85r; T 35va-b; U 29r; V 37ra-b; W 25rb-va; X 205vb-206rb]

Lectio IX: Quoniam quidem igitur: c. 9: 1109a20 [A 34vb-35rb; B 66va-b (fragment) and 69ra-b; C 49ra-vb; D 35rb-vb; F 53va-54rb; G 61vb-62va; L (36r-37r) 35va-36ra; M 65va-66rb; N 39va-40ra; P 33ra-va; Q 18va-19va; R 90rb-va; S 85r-86r; T 35vb-36rb; U *deest*; V 37rb-vb; W 25va-b; X 206rb-207ra]

26. Utrum doctrina super inventionem medii tradita sit vera et bona [A 35rb-va; B 68ra (fragment) and 69rb-vb; C 49vb-50rb; D 35vb-36ra; F 54rb-55vb; G 62va-63rb; L 36ra-b; M 66rb-vb; N 40ra-va; P 33va-b; Q 19va-b; R 90va-b; S 86r-v; T 36rb-va; U 39r; V 37vb-38ra; W 25vb-26ra; X 207ra-vb]

Liber tertius

Lectio I: Virtute itaque et circa passiones et operationes existente: c. 1: 1109b30 [A 35va-36va; B 68ra-vb (fragment) and 70ra-vb; C 50rb-51va; D 36ra-37ra; F 55vb-56ra; G 63rb-65ra; L (37r-39r) 36va-37va; M 66vb-67va (fragment); N 40va-41va; P 33vb-34va; Q 20ra-22ra; R 90vb-91va; S 87r-89r; T 36va-37va; U 39v; V 38rb-39rb; W 26ra-vb; X 207vb-209va]

1. Utrum agens naturale et voluntarium et liberum et dominativum differant in modo agendi [A 36va-37ra; B 70vb-71va; C 51va-52rb; D 37ra-b; F 56ra-va; G 65ra-vb; L 37va-38ra; N 41va-b; P 34vb-35ra; Q *deest*; R 91ra-b; S 89r-90r; T 37va-38ra; U 39v-40r; V 39va-b; W 26vb-27ra; X 209va-210rb]

2. Utrum violentia causet involuntarium [A 37ra-va; B 71va-72va; C 52rb-vb; D 37rb-vb; F 56va-57ra; G 65vb-66vb; L 38ra-va; N 42ra-b; P 35ra-va; Q *deest*; R 91rb-92rb; S 90r-91r; T 38ra-b; U 40r; V 39vb-40rb; W 27ra-b; X 210rb-211rb]

3. Utrum cedere timori in aliquo casu sit laudabile (= *Sent.* III.34-35.2) [A 37va-38ra; B 72va-73rb; C 52vb-53va; D 37vb-38rb; F 57ra-vb; G 66vb-67va; L 38va-39ra; N 42rb-43ra; P 35va-b; Q *deest*; R 92rb-va; S 91r-92r; T 38va-39ra; U *deest*; V 40rb-va; W 27rb-va; X 211rb-212ra]

4. Utrum actus ab obiecto totaliter causatus possit dici voluntarius [A 38ra; B 73rb-va; C 53va-b; D 38rb-va; F 57vb-58ra; G 67va-b; L 39ra; N 43ra; P 35vb-36ra; Q *deest*; R 92va-b; S 92r-v; T 39ra; U 40v-41; V 40va-b; W 27vb; X 212ra-b]

Lectio II: Quod autem propter ignorantiam: c. 1: 1110b18 [A 38ra-vb; B 73va-75ra; C 53vb-54vb; D 38va-39rb; F 58ra-59ra; G 67vb-69rb; L (39r-40r) 39ra-40ra; N 43ra-44ra; P 36ra-vb; Q 22ra-23ra; R 92vb-93rb; S 92v-94r; T 39ra-vb; U *deest*; V 40vb-41vb; W 27vb-28rb; X 212rb-213vb]

5. Utrum ignorantia causet involuntarium (≈ *Sent.* II.21-22.3) [A 38vb-39va; B 75ra-76ra; C 55rb-va; D 39rb-va; F 59ra-vb; G 69rb-70rb; L 40ra-va; N 44ra-va; P 36vb-37rb; Q 23ra-va; R 93rb-va; S 94r-95v; T 39vb-40rb; U 41r-42r; V 41vb-42rb; W 28rb-vb; X 213vb-214vb]

6. Utrum omnis malus sit ignorans [A 39va-40ra; B 76ra-77ra; C 55va-56rb; D 39va-40ra; F 59vb-60va; G 70rb-71rb; L 40va-41ra; N 44va-45ra; P 37rb-vb; Q 23va-24va; R 93va-94ra; S 95v-96v; T 40rb-vb; U 42r-v; V 42rb-vb; W28vb-29ra; X 214vb-215vb]

7. Utrum humana operatio sit bona vel mala moraliter ex circumstantia (= *Sent.* II.21-22.4) [A 40ra-va; B 77ra-78ra; C 56rb-57ra; D 40ra-va; F 60va-61rb; G 71ra-72rb; L 41ra-va; N 45ra-va; P 37vb-38ra; Q 24va-25ra; R 94ra-b; S 96v-97v; T 40vb-41ra; U 42v-43r; V 42vb-43rb; W 29ra-b; X 215vb-216vb]

Lectio III: Existente autem involuntario: c. 1: 1111a22 [A 40va-b; B 78ra-va; C 57ra-va; D 40va-41ra; F 61rb-vb; G 72rb-73ra; L (40v-41r) 41va-b; N 45va-45va; P 38ra-va; Q 25ra-va; R 94rb-va; S 97v-98v; T 41ra-vb; U *deest*; V 43rb-va; W 29rb-va; X 216vb-217ra]

8. Utrum definitio voluntarii sit bene assignata [A 40vb-41ra; B 78va-79ra; C 57va-b; D 41ra; F 61vb-62ra; G 73ra-b; L 41vb-42ra; N 45vb-46ra; P 38va; Q 25va-b; R 94va-b; S 98v; T 41vb; U 43v-44r; V 43vb; W 29va-b; X 217va-b]

9. Utrum concupiscentia vel ira causet involuntarium [A 41ra-b; B 79ra-b; C 57vb-58ra; D 41rb; F 62ra-b; G 73rb-va; L 42ra; N 46ra-b; P 38va-b; Q 26ra; R 94vb; S 99r; T 41vb-42ra; V 43va-44ra; U 44r; W 29vb; X 217vb-218rb]

Lectio IV: Determinatis autem his: c. 2: 1111b4 [A 41rb-42ra; B 79rb-81ra; C 58ra-59rb; D 41rb-42ra; F 62rb-63va; G 73va-75rb; L (41v-43v) 42ra-43ra; N 46rb-47rb;

P 38vb-39va; Q 26rb-28ra; R 94vb-95va; S 99r-101r; T 42ra-vb; U *deest*; V 44ra-45ra; W 29vb-30rb; X 218rb-219vb]

10. Quid est obiectum electionis [A 42ra-b; B 81ra-va; C 59rb-vb; D 42ra-b; F 63va-64ra; G 75rb-vb; L 43ra-b; N 47rb-va; P 39va-b; Q 28ra-rb; R 95va-b; S 101r-v; T 42vb-43ra; U 44r-v; V 45ra-b; W 30va; X 219vb-220rb]

11. Quid est subiectum [A 42rb-va; B 81va-82ra; C 59vb-60ra; D 42rb-va; F 64ra-va; G 75vb-76rb; L 43rb-va; N 47va-b; P 39vb-40ra; Q 28va-b; R 95vb-96ra; S 101v-102r; T 43ra-va; U 44v-45r; V 45va-b; W 30va-b; X 220rb-vb]

12. Quae differentia electionis ad alios actus qui sunt in eodem subiecto cum electione (*Sent.* II.40) [A 42va-43rb; B 82ra-83rb; C 60ra-61ra; D 42va-43rb; F 64va-65rb; G 76va-77va; L 43va-44ra; N 48ra-va; P 40ra-va; Q 28vb-29va; R 96ra-b; S 102v103v; T 43va-44ra; U 45r-46r; V 45vb-46rb; W 30vb-31rb; X 220vb-221vb]

13. Qualis est habitudo electionis ad virtutem [A 43rb; B 83rb-va; C 61ra-b; D 43rb; F 65rb-va; G 77vb-78ra; L 44ra-b; N 48va-b; P 40va-b; Q 29va-b; R 96rb-va; S 103v-104r; T 44ra-b; U 46r-v; V 46rb; W 31rb; X 221vb-222rb]

Lectio V: Consiliantur autem utrum de omnibus: c. 3: 1112a18 [A 43va-44rb; B 83va-85rb; C 61rb-62va; D 43va-44rb; F 65vb-66vb; G 78ra-79va; L (43v-46r) 44rb-45ra; N 48vb-49va; P 40vb-41va; Q 29vb-31ra; R 96va-97ra; S 104r-105v; T 44rb-45ra; U *deest*; V 46rb-47rb; W 31rb-vb; X 222rb-223vb]

Lectio VI: Videtur autem quomodo non omnis esse consilium: c. 3: 1112b [A 44rb-vb; B 85rb-86ra; C 62va-63ra; D 44rb-va; F 66vb-67va; G 79va-80rb; L (46r-46v) 45ra-va; N 49vb-50rb; P 41va-42ra; Q 31ra-32va; R 97ra-va; S 105v-106v; T 45ra-va; U *deest*; V 47rb-48ra; W 32ra-b; X 223vb-224va]

14. De materia et obiecto consilii, utrum scilicet consilium sit de omnibus bonis et malis [A 44vb-45rb; B 86ra-87ra; C 63ra-vb; D 44vb-45ra; F 67va-68ra; G 80va-b (fragment); L 45va-46ra; N 50rb-vb; P 42ra-b; Q 32va-33rb; R 97va-b; S 106v-107v; T 45va-46ra; U 46r-47r; V 48ra-b; W 32rb-va; X 224vb-225va]

15. De subiecto et principio consilii, utrum scilicet consilium sit actus voluntatis vel intellectus [A 45rb-va; B 87ra-va; C 63vb-64rb; D 45ra-rb; F 68ra-va; G *deest*; L 46ra-b; N 50vb-51ra; P 42rb-va; Q 33rb-33vb; R 97vb-98ra; S 107v-108r; T 46ra-b; U 47r-v; V 48va-b; W 32va-b; X 225va-226ra]

16. De forma consilii, utrum scilicet consilium sit quaestio resolutoria [A 45va-b; B 87va-88ra; C 64rb-vb; D 45rb-vb; F 68va-69ra; G *deest*; L 46rb-va; N 51ra-b; P 42va-43ra; Q 33vb-34ra; R 98ra-b; S 108r-109r; T 46rb-vb; U 47v-48r; V 48vb-49ra; W 32vb-33ra; X 226ra-vb]

17. De fine consilii, utrum scilicet finis consilii sit utilitas sola, an utilitas et honestas simul [A 45vb-46ra; B 88ra-va; C 64vb-65ra; D 45vb; F 69ra-b; G *deest*; L 46va-b; N 51rb-va; P 43ra; Q 34ra-34va; R 98rb-va; S 109r; T 46vb-47ra; V 49ra-b; W 33ra-rb; X 226vb-227rb]

Lectio VII: Voluntas autem quoniam quidem finis est: c. 4: 1113a15 [A 46ra-va; B 88va-89va; C 65ra-vb; D 45vb-46rb; F 69rb-70ra; G *deest*; L (46v-47v) 46vb-47rb;

N 51va-52rb; P 43ra-va; Q 34va-35va; R 98va-b; S 109v-110v; T 47ra-rb; U *deest*; V 49rb-vb; W 33rb-va; X 227rb-228rb]

18. Utrum noluntas sit idem quod voluntas (≈ *Sent.* II.39) [A 46va-b; B 89va-b; C 65vb-66ra; D 46rb-va; F 70ra-b; G *deest*; L 47rb-va; N 52rb-va; P 43va-b; Q 35va-b; R 98vb-99ra; S 110v-111r; T 47va; U 48v-49r; V 49vb-50ra; W 33va-b; X 228rb-va]

19. Utrum voluntas sit tantummodo finis (= *Sent.* II.38.1) [A 46vb; B 89vb-90rb; C 66ra-b; D 46va-b; F 70rb-va; G *deest*; L 47va-b; N 52va; P 43vb; Q 35vb-36ra; R 99ra; S 111r; T 47va-b; U 49r; V 50ra; W 33vb; X 228va-b]

20. Utrum voluntas sit tantummodo boni existentis (= *Sent.* II.38.2) [A 46vb-47ra; B 90rb-vb; C 66rb-vb; D 46vb-47ra; F 70va-71ra; G *deest*; L 47vb-48ra; N 52va-b; P 43vb-44ra; Q 36ra-b; R 99ra-b; S 111r-v; T 47vb-48ra; U 49r-v; V 50ra-b; W 33vb-34ra; X 228vb-229rb]

21. Utrum habitus malus magis corrumpat iudicium rationis quam passio mala, vel e converso [A 47ra-b; B 90vb-91ra; C 66vb-67ra; D 47ra; F71ra-b; G *deest*; L 48ra-b; N 52vb-53ra; P 44ra-b; Q 36va-b; R 99rb-va; S 111v-112r; T 48ra-b; U 49v-50r; V 50rb-va; W 34ra; X 229rb-vb]

Lectio VIII: Existente utique voluntabili quidem finis: c. 5: 1113b3 [A 47rb-48rb; B 91ra-93ra; C 67ra-68va; D 47ra-48ra; F 71rb-72vb; G *deest*; L (47v-49r) 48rb-49ra; N 53ra-54rb; P 44rb-45rb; Q 36vb-38vb; R 99va-100ra; S 112r-114r; T 48rb-49rb; U *deest*; V 50va-51vb; W 34ra-vb; X 229vb-231vb]

Lectio IX: Sed forsitan talis aliquis est: c. 5: 1114a3 [A 48rb-vb; B 93ra-94ra; C 68va-69rb; D 48ra-va; F 72vb-73va; G *deest*; L (49r-50v) 49rb-va; N 54rb-54vb; P 45rb-vb; Q 38vb-39vb; R 100rb-va; S 114v-115v; T 49rb-vb; U *deest*; V 51vb-52va; W 34vb-35rb; X 231vb-232vb]

Lectio X: Si autem quis dicat: c. 5: 1114a31 [A 48vb-49va; B 94ra-95ra; C 69rb-70rb; D 48va-49ra; F 73va-74va; G *deest*; L (50v-52r) 49vb-50rb; N 54vb-55va; P 45vb-46rb; Q 39vb-41ra; R 100va-101ra; S 115v-117r; T 49vb-50rb; U *deest*; V 52va-53vb; W 35rb-va; X 232vb-234ra]

22. Utrum homo fiat malus involuntarie propter ignorantiam (= *Sent.* II.29.1) [A 49va-50ra; B 95ra-96ra; C 70rb-71ra; D 49ra-va; F 74va-75rb; G *deest*; L 50rb-vb; N 55va-56ra; P 46rb-vb; Q 41ra-vb; R 101ra-b; S 117r-118r; T 50rb-vb; U 50r-51r; V 53vb-54rb; W 35va-36ra; X 234ra-235ra]

23. Utrum fiat malus involuntarie propter impotentiam (= *Sent.* II.29.2) [A 50ra-vb; B 96ra-97va; C 71ra-72rb; D 49va-50rb; F 75va-76va; G 81va-b (fragment); L 50vb-51va; N 56ra-vb; P 46vb-47va; Q 41vb-42vb; R 101rb-102ra; S 118r-119v; T 50vb-51va; U 51r-52r; V 54rb-va; W 36ra-va; X 235ra-236va]

24. Utrum fiat malus involuntarie propter concupiscentiam et nativitatem (= *Sent.* II.29.3) [A 50vb-51rb; B 97va-98rb; C 72rb-vb; D 50rb-vb; F 76va-77rb; G 81vb-82va; L 51va-52ra; N 56vb-57rb; P 47va-48ra; R 102ra-b; S 119v-120v; T 51va-52ra; U 52r-53r; V 54va-55ra; W 36va-b; X 236va-237va; Q 42vb-43rb]

25. Utrum remaneat malus involuntarie post acquisitam malitiam (= *Sent.* II.29.4) [A 51rb-va; B 98rb-vb; C 72vb-73rb; D 50vb-51ra; F 77rb-vb; G 82va-83ra; L 52ra-b; N 57rb-va; P 48ra; Q 43rb-va; R 102rb-va; S 120v-121r; T 52ra-b; U 53r; V 55ra; W 36vb; X 237va-b]

Liber quartus

Lectio I: Quoniam quidem igitur medietas: l.III, c. 6: 1115a6 [A 51va-52va; B 98vb-100vb; C 73rb-74vb; D 51ra-vb; F 77vb-79ra; G 83ra-84vb; L (52r-53v) 52rb-53rb; N 57va-58va; P 48ra-49ra; Q 43va-44vb; R 102va-103rb; S 121r-123r; T 52rb-53rb; U 53r; V 55rb-56rb; W 37ra-va; X 238ra-239vb]

Lectio II: Fortis autem et instupescibilis: l.III, c. 7: 1115b10 [A 52va-53ra; B 100vb-101vb (n.t.); C 74vb-75va; D 51vb-52rb; F 79ra-80ra; G 84vb-85vb; L (53v-54v) 53rb-vb; N 58va-59ra; P 49ra-va; Q 44vb-46va; R 103rb-va; S 123r-124r; T 53rb-vb; U *deest*; V 56rb-57ra; W 37va-38ra; X 239vb-240vb]

Lectio III: Dicuntur autem et aliae secundum quinque modos: l.III, c.8: 1116a16 [A 53ra-54rb; B 101vb-103va; C 75va-77rb; D 52rb-53rb; F 80ra-81vb; G 85vb-87vb; L (54v-57r) 53vb-54vb; N 59ra-60ra; P 49va-50va; Q 46va-49ra; R 103va-104rb; S 124v-126v; T 53vb-54vb; U *deest*; V 57ra-58va; W 38ra-va; X 240vb-242vb]

Lectio IV: Circa audacias autem et timores: l.III, c. 9: 1117a29 [A54rb-vb; B 103va-104rb; C 77rb-vb; D 53rb-vb; F 81vb-82va; G 87vb-88va; L (57r-58v) 54vb-55rb; N 60ra-va; P 50va-b; Q 49ra-vb; R 104rb-va; S 126v-127v; T 54vb-55ra; U *deest*; V 58va-59ra; W 38va-39ra; X 242vb-243vb]

1. Utrum fortitudo sit tantum moderatrix timoris et audaciae [A 54vb-55ra; B 104va-105ra; C 77vb-78rb; D 53vb-54ra; F 82va-83ra; G 88va-89ra; L 55rb-vb; N 60va-b; P 51ra-rb; Q 49vb-50rb; R 104vb; S 127v-128r; T 55ra-va; U 53v-54r; V 59ra-b; W 39ra-b; X 243vb-244rb]

2. Utrum regulet appetitum circa pericula bellica [A 55ra-va; B 105ra-va; C 78rb-vb; D 54ra-b; F 83ra-va; G 89ra-va; L 55vb-56ra; N 60vb-61ra; P 51rb-va; Q 50rb-va; R 104vb-105ra; S 128r-v; T 55va-b; U 54r; V 59rb-va; W 39rb; X 244rb-vb]

3. Utrum aequaliter se habeat ad aggressum et expectationem [A 55va-b; B 105va-106ra; C 78vb-79rb; D 54rb-va; F 83va-84ra; G 89va-90rb; L 56ra-b; N 61ra-b; P 151va-b; Q 50va-51ra; R 105ra-b; S 128v-129r; T 55vb-56ra; U 54r-v; V 59va-b; W 39rb-va; X 244vb-245va]

4. Utrum aequaliter opponatur timiditati et intimiditati, audaciae et cohardiae [A 55vb-56rb; B 106ra-107ra; C 79rb-80ra; D 54va-55ra; F 84ra-va; G 90rb-91rb; L 56rb-vb; N 61rb-vb; P 51vb-52ra; R 105rb-vb; S 129r-130r; T 56ra-va; U 54v-55v; V 59vb-60rb; W 39va-40ra; X 245va-246va; Q 51ra-va]

5. Utrum sit virtus cardinalis (= *Sent.* III.33.4) [A 56rb-57ra; B 107ra-108rb; C 80ra-81ra; D 55ra-vb; F 84va-86ra; G 91rb-92rb; L 56vb-57va; N 61vb-62va; P 52ra-vb; Q 51va-52rb; R 105vb-106ra; S 130r-131v; T 56va-57ra; U 55v-56v; V 60vb-61ra; W 40ra-b; X 246va-247vb]

6. Quae sint partes eius [A 57ra-b; B 108rb-vb; C 81ra-b; D 55vb-56ra; F 86ra-b; G 92rb-vb; L 57va-b; N 62va-b; P 52vb; Q 52rb-va; R 106rb; S 131v-132r; T 57ra-va; U 56v; V 61ra-b; W 40rb-va; X 247vb-248ra]

7. Utrum opus eius sit aequaliter triste et delectabile [A 57rb-va; B 108vb-109ra; C 81rb-va; D 56ra-b; F 86rb-va; G 92vb-93ra; L 57vb; N 62vb; P 52vb-53ra; Q 52va-b; R 106rb-va; S 132r; T 57va; U 56v-57r; V 61rb-va; W 40va; X 248ra-va]

8. Utrum martyrium sit opus eius [A 57va; B 109ra-rb; C 81va-b; D 56rb; G 93ra-b; F 86va-b; L 57vb-58ra; N 62vb-63ra; P 53ra-b; Q 52vb-53ra; R 106va; S 132r-v; T 57va-b; U 57r; V 61va; W 40vb; X 248va-b]

9. Utrum si non esset alia vita esset mors expectanda ex inclinatione fortitudinis [A 57va-58ra; B 109rb-vb; C 81vb-82rb; D 56rb-va; F 86vb-87rb; G 93rb-94ra; L 58ra-b; N 63ra-b; P 53rb-va; Q 53ra-b; R 106va-b; S 132v-133r; T 57vb-58ra; U 57r-58r; V 61va-vb; W 40vb-41ra; X 248vb-249rb]

10. Utrum omnes similitudinarie imitentur veram fortitudinem [A 58ra-b; B 109vb-110va; C 82rb-vb; D 56va-57ra; F 87rb-88ra; G 94ra-vb; L 58rb-vb; N 63rb-vb; P 53va-b; Q 53va-b; R 106vb-107ra; S 133r-134r; T 58ra-va; U *deest*; V 62ra-b; W 41ra-b; X 249vb-250ra]

Lectio V: Post haec de temperantia dicamus: l.III, c. 10: 1117b23 [A 58rb-59va; B 110va-112vb; C 82vb-84vb; D 57ra-58ra; F 88ra-90ra; G 94vb-97ra; L (58v-60r) 58vb-60ra; N 63vb-64vb; P 53vb-54vb; Q 53vb-56ra; R 107ra-108ra; S 134r-136v; T 58va-59vb; U *deest*; V 62rb-63vb; W 41rb-42ra; X 250ra-252va]

Lectio VI: Concupiscentiarum autem: c. 11: 1118b8 [A 59va-60rb; B 112vb-114ra; C 84vb-85vb; D 58rb-vb; F 90ra-91rb; G 97ra-98rb; L (60r-61v) 60ra-vb; N 64vb-65va; P 54vb-55va; Q 56ra-57va; R 108ra-va; S 136v-138r; T 59vb-60va; U *deest*; V 63vb-64va; W 42ra-va; X 252va-253vb]

Lectio VII: Voluntario autem magis assimilatur: l.III, c. 12: 1119a21 [A 60rb-61ra; B 114ra-115va; C 85vb-86vb; D 58vb-59va; F 91rb-92rb; G 98rb-99vb; L (62r-63r) 60vb-61va; N 65va-66rb; P 55va-56ra; Q 57va-59ra; R 108va-109ra; S 138r-139v; T 60va-61rb; U *deest*; V 64va-65vb; W 42va-43ra; X 254ra-255rb]

11. Utrum temperantia tantum moderetur delectationes tactus et gustus (= *Sent.* III.33.6) [A 61ra-62ra; B 115va-117ra; C 87ra-88rb; D 59va-60rb; F 92rb-93vb; G 99vb-101rb; L 61va-62rb; N 66rb-67rb; P 56rb-57ra; Q 59ra-60ra; R 109ra-vb; S 140r-141v; T 61rb-62ra; U 58r-59v; V 65vb-66rb; W 43ra-va; X 255rb-257ra]

12. Utrum temperantia sit virtus cardinalis (= *Sent.* III.33.5) [A 62ra-va; B 117ra-vb; C 88rb-89ra; D 60rb-vb; F 93vb-94va; G 101rb-102rb; L 62rb-vb; N 67rb-va; P 57ra-va; Q 60ra-vb; R 109vb-110ra; S 142r-v; T 62ra-va; U 59v-60r; V 66rb-vb; W 43va-44ra; X 257ra-258ra]

13. Utrum insensibilitas sit vitium [A 62va; B 117vb-118rb; C 89ra-b; D 60vb; F 94va-b; G 102rb-vb; L 62vb-63ra; N 67va-b; P 57va; Q 60vb-61ra; R 110ra-rb; S 143r; T 62va-b; U 60r-v; V 66vb-67ra; W 44ra; X 258ra-b]

14. Utrum virginitas sit moralis virtus tanquam species temperantiae et castitatis [A 62va-63va; B 118rb-120rb; C 89rb-90vb; D 60vb-62ra; F 94vb-96vb; G 102vb-104va; L 63ra-64ra; N 67vb-69ra; P 57va-58va; Q 61ra-62rb; R 110rb-11ra; S 143r-145v; T 62vb-63vb; U 60v-62r; V 67ra-68ra; W 44ra-vb; X 258rb-260va]

Lectio VIII: Dicamus deinceps de liberalitate: c. 1: 1119b22 [A 63va-65ra; B 120rb-122va; C 90vb-92vb; D 62ra-63ra; F 96vb-98vb; G 104va-107ra; L (63r-66v) 64ra-65va; N 69ra-70rb; P 58va-59vb; Q 62va-65vb; R 111ra-112ra; S 145v-148v; T 63vb-65ra; U *deest*; V 68ra-69vb; W 44vb-45vb; X 260va-262vb]

Lectio IX: Dictum est autem nobis: c. 1: 1121a10 [A 65ra-va; B 122va-123va; C 92vb-93vb; D 63ra-vb; F 98vb-100ra; G 107ra-108rb; L (66v-67v) 65va-66ra; N 70rb-vb; P 59vb-60rb; Q 65vb-67vb; R 112ra-va; S 148v-150r; T 65ra-vb; U *deest*; V 69vb-70va; W 45vb-46rb; X 262vb-264ra]

Lectio X: Illiberalitas autem: c. 1: 1121b12 [A 65va-66rb; B 123vb-124vb; C 93vb-95ra; D 63vb-64va; F 100ra-101rb; G 108rb-109va; L (67v-69r) 66ra-vb; N 70vb-71va; P 60rb-61ra; Q 67vb-68vb; R 112va-113ra; S 150r-151v; T 65vb-66va; U *deest*; V 70va-71va; W 46rb-vb; X 264ra-265va]

15. Utrum liberalitas sit virtus [A 66rb-vb; B 124vb-125va; C 95ra-va; D 64va-b; F 101rb-vb; G 109va-110rb; L 67ra-b; N 71va-72ra; P 61ra-b; Q 68vb-69ra; R 113rb; S 152r-v; T 66va-b; U 62r-v; V 71va-b; W 46vb-47ra; X 265va-266ra]

16. Utrum sit specialis virtus distincta ab omni virtute donativa [A 66vb-67rb; B 125va-126vb; C 95va-96va; D 64vb-65va; F 101vb-103ra; G 110rb-111va; L 67rb-68ra; N 72ra-vb; P 61rb-62ra; Q 69ra-70ra; R 113rb-114ra; S 152v-154r; T 66vb-67va; U 62v-64r; V 71vb-72rb; W 47ra-va; X 266ra-267rb]

17. Utrum prodigalitas sit moralis malitia [A 67rb-va; B 126vb-127rb; C 96va-97ra; D 65va-b; F 103ra-va; G 111va-112ra; L 68ra-b; N 72vb-73ra; P 62ra-b; Q 70ra-va; R 114ra; S 154r-v; T 67va-b; U 64r; V 72rb-72va; W 47va-b; X 267rb-vb]

18. Utrum prodigus plus peccet dando quibus oportet non dare quam non dando quibus oportet dare [A 67va-68ra; B 127rb-128ra; C 97ra-va; D 65vb-66ra; F 103va-104rb; G 112ra-vb; L 68rb-vb; N 73ra-va; P 62rb-vb; Q 70va-71ra; R 114ra-va; S 154v-155v; T 67vb-68rb; U 64r-65r; V 72va-73ra; W 47vb-48ra; X 267vb-268vb]

19. Utrum illiberalitas sit avaritia [A 68ra-b; B 128ra-b; C 97va-b; D 66ra-b; F 104rb-va; G 112vb-113ra; L 68vb; N 73va; P 62vb; Q 71ra-b; R 114va; S 155v-156r; T 68rb; U 65r; V 73ra-b; W 48ra-b; X 268vb-269ra]

20. Utrum omnis usura secundum se sit mala, dato quod de iure positivo non sit prohibita (≈ *Sent.* IV.15.II.2) [A 68rb-vb; B 128rb-129rb; C 97vb-98va; D 66rb-vb; F 104va-105va; G 113ra-114ra; L 68vb-69rb; N 73vb-74rb; P 62vb-63rb; Q 71rb-vb; R 114va-115ra; S 156r-157r; T 68rb-vb; U 65r-66r; V 73rb-va; W 48rb-va; X 269ra-270ra]

Lectio XI: Videbitur autem utique: c. 2: 1122a18 [A 68vb-69va; B 129rb-130vb; C 98va-100ra; D 66vb-67vb; F 105va-107ra; G 114ra-115va; L (69r-70v) 69rb-70rb;

N 74rb-75ra; P 63rb-64ra; Q 71vb-72vb; R 115ra-vb; S 157v-159r; T 68vb-69vb; U *deest*; V 73va-74va; W 48va-49rb; X 270ra-271va][59]

Lectio XII: Est autem sumptuum: c. 2: 1122b19 [A 69va-70ra; B 130vb-132ra; C 100ra-101ra; D 67vb-68rb; F 107ra-108ra; G 115va-115[a]vb; L (70v-72r) 70rb-71ra; N 75ra-vb; P 64ra-vb; Q 73va-75ra; R 115vb-116rb; S 159r-160v; T 69vb-70rb; U *deest*; V 74va-75va; W 49rb-va; X 271va-272vb]

Lectio XIII: Superabundans autem: c. 2: 1123a19 [A 70ra-b; B 132ra-b; C 101ra-b; D 68rb-va; F 108ra-va; G 115[a]vb-116rb; L (72r-v) 71ra-b; N 75vb-76ra; P 64vb; Q 75ra-va; R 116rb; S 160v-161r; T 70rb-va; U *deest*; V 75va-b; W 49va-b; X 273ra-b]

21. Utrum magnificentia sit moralis virtus [A 70rb-vb; B 132rb-133ra; C 101va-b; D 68va-69ra; F 108va-109rb; G 116rb-vb; L 71rb-va; N 76ra-b; P 65ra-b; Q 75va-76ra; R 116rb-va; S 161v-162r; T 70va-71ra; U 66r-v; V 75vb-76ra; W 49vb-50ra; X 273va-274ra]

22. Utrum sit nobilior liberalitate [A 70vb-71ra; B 133ra-vb; C 102ra-va; D 69ra-va; F 109rb-110rb; G 116vb-117vb; L 71va-72ra; N 76rb-vb; P 65rb-va; Q 76ra-va; R 116va-117ra; S 162r-164r; T 71ra-va; U 66v-67r; V 76ra-va; W 50ra-va; X 274ra-275ra]

23. Utrum pervificentia sit deterior quam banavsia [A 71ra-va; B 133vb-134va; C 102va-103rb; D 69va-b; F 110rb-vb; G 117vb-118va; L 72ra-va; N 76vb-77ra; P 65va-66ra (n.t.) ; Q 76va-77ra; R 117ra-rb; S 164r-168r; T 71va-b; U 67r-v; V 76va-b; W 50 va-b; X 275ra-vb]

Lectio XIV: Magnanimitas autem: c. 3: 1123a34 [A 71va-72rb; B 134va-136ra; C 103rb-104va; D 69vb-70va; F 110vb-112ra; G 118va-120rb; L (72v-73v) 72va-73rb; N 77ra-78ra; P 66ra-vb; Q 77ra-78ra; R 117rb-118ra; S 168r-170r; T 71vb-72vb; V 76vb-77vb; W 50vb-51rb; X 275vb-277rb]

Lectio XV: Magnanimus autem: c. 3: 1123b26 [A 72rb-73rb; B 136ra-137vb; C 104va-106ra; D 70va-71va; F 112ra-113vb; G 120rb-122rb; L (73v-75v) 73rb-74va; N 78ra-79ra; P 66vb-67vb; Q 78ra-80vb; R 118ra-vb; S 170r-172r; T 72vb-74ra; U *deest*; V 77vb-79ra; W 51rb-52ra; X 277rb-279va]

Lectio XVI: Non est autem microquindinos: c. 3: 1124b6 [A 73rb-74rb; B 138ra-139va; C 106ra-107va; D 71va-72va; F 113vb-115rb; G 122rb-124ra; L (75v-77r) 74va-75va; N 79ra-80ra; P 67vb-68vb; Q 80vb-82vb; R 118vb-119va; S 172r-174v; T 74ra-75ra; U *deest*; V 79ra-80ra; W 52ra-vb; X 279va-281rb]

Lectio XVII: Deficiens autem: c. 3: 1125a17 [A 74rb-va; B 139va-140ra; C 107va-108ra; D 72va-b; F 115rb-vb; G 124ra-va; L (77r-78r) 75va-b; N 80ra-b; P 68vb-69ra; Q 82vb-83va; R 119va-b; S 174v-175r; T 75ra-rb; U *deest*; V 80ra-va; W 52vb-53ra; X 281rb-vb]

Lectio XVIII: Videtur autem et circa hunc: c.4: 1125b1 [A 74va-75ra; B 140ra-vb; C 108ra-va; D 72vb-73rb; F 115vb-116va; G 124va-125va; L (78r-79r) 75vb-76rb;

---

[59] Although not clear in all witnesses, there is probably another Lectio between XI and XII: Magnificus autem scienti.

N 80rb-vb; P 69ra-va; Q 83va-84va; R 119vb-120rb; S 175r-176r; T 75rb-vb; U *deest*; V 80va-81ra; W 53ra-b; X 281vb-282vb]

24. Utrum sit melius honorare alterum quam honorari ab altero, vel e converso [A 75ra-vb; B 140vb-142ra; C 108vb-109va; D 73rb-vb; F 116va-117va; G 125va-126va; H 292r; L 76rb-vb; N 80vb-81va; P 69va-70ra; Q 84va-85rb; R 120rb-vb; S 176r-177r; T 75vb-76rb; U 67v-68v; V 81ra-va; W 53rb-vb; X 282vb-284ra]

25. Utrum magnanimus secundum magnanimitatem honoris magnos magis appetat quam contemnat [A 75vb-76vb; B 142ra-144ra; C 109va-111rb; D 73vb-75ra; F 117va-119rb; G 126va-128va; L 76vb-78ra; N 81va-82vb; P 70ra-71ra; Q 85rb-87ra; R 120vb-121vb; S 177v-180r; T 76rb-77va; U 68v-70v; V 81va-82va; W 53vb-54va; X 284ra-286rb]

26. Utrum magnanimitas moderetur aliquas passiones et quas [A 76vb-77rb; B 144ra-va; C 111rb-vb; D 75ra-b; F 119rb-vb; G 128vb-129rb; L 78ra-b; N 82vb-83ra; P 71ra-va; Q 87ra-va; R 121vb-122ra; S 180r-v; T 77va-b; U 70v-71r; V 82vb-83ra; W 54va-b; X 286rb-vb]

27. Utrum omnis magnanimus sit superbus [A 77rb-va; B 144va-145rb; C 111vb-112rb; D 75rb-vb; F 119vb-120rb; G 129rb-vb; L 78rb-va; N 83ra-b; P 71va-b; Q 87va-b; R 122ra-b; S 180v-181r; T 77vb-78rb; U 71r-v; V 83ra-b; W 54vb-55ra; X 286vb-287va]

28. Utrum sit humilis vel non [A 77va-78ra; B 145rb-146rb; C 112rb-113ra; D 75vb-76rb; F 120rb-121rb; G 129vb-131ra; L 78va-79ra; P 71vb-72rb; N 83rb-84ra; Q 87vb-88vb; R 122rb-vb; S 181r-182v; T 78rb-vb; U 71v-72v; V 83rb-vb; W 55ra-va; X 287va-288va]

29. Utrum magnanimitas sit virtus [A 78ra-va; B 146rb-147ra; C 113ra-vb; D 76rb-vb; F 121rb-122ra; G 131ra-132ra; L 79ra-va; N 84ra-va; P 72rb-vb; Q 88vb-89rb; R 122vb-123ra; S 182v-183v; T 78vb-79rb; U 72v-73r; V 83vb-84ra; W 55va-56ra; X 288va-289ra]

30. Utrum magnanimitas sit virtus generalis [A 78va-b; B 147ra-b; C 113vb-114ra; D 76vb; F 122ra; G 132ra-b; L 79va; N 84va; P 72vb; Q 89rb-va; R 123ra; S 183v; T 79rb-va; U 73r-v; V 84ra-b; W 56ra; X 289rb]

31. Quot sunt partes magnanimitatis [A 78vb; B 147rb-va; C 114ra-b; D 76vb-77ra; F 122ra-va; G 132rb-va; L 79va-b; N 84va-b; P 72vb-73ra; Q 89va-b; R 123ra-b; S 183v-184r; T 79va-b; U 73v-74r; V 84rb-va; W 56ra-b; X 289rb-vb]

32. Quae est eius definitio [A 78vb-79ra; B 147va-b; C 114rb-va; D 77ra-b; F 122va-b; G 132va-b; L 79vb-80ra; N 84vb; P 73ra; Q 89vb; R 123rb; S 184r-v; T 79vb; U 74r; V 84va; W 56rb; X 289vb-290ra]

33. Utrum chaimus sit deterior pusillanimi [A 79ra-b; B 147vb-148rb; C 114va-115ra; D 77rb-va; F 122vb-123rb; G 132vb-133va; L 80ra-b; N 84vb-85rb; P 73ra-va; Q 89vb-90rb; R 123rb-va; S 184v-185r; T 79vb-80rb; U 74r-v; V 84va-b; W 56rb-va; X 290ra-va]

34. Utrum euphilotimia sit virtus distincta a magnanimitate [A 79rb-va; B 148rb-va; C 115ra; D 77va-b; F 123rb; G 133va-b; L 80rb; N 85rb;

P 73va; Q 90rb-va; R 123va-b; S 185r-v; T 80rb; U 74v; V 84vb-85ra; W 56va; X 290va-b]

35. Quid est definitio euphilotimiae [A 79va; B 148va; C 115ra-b; D 77vb; F 123rb; G 133vb; L 80rb; N 85rb; P 73va; Q 90vb; R 123vb; S 185v; T 80rb; U 75r; V 85ra; W 56va; X 290vb]

Lectio XIX: Mansuetudo autem est: c. 5: 1125b26 [A 79va-80rb; B 148va-150ra; C 115rb-116va; D 77vb-78va; F 123va-124vb; G 133vb-135rb; L (79r-82r) 80rb-81ra; N 85rb-86rb; P 73va-74rb; Q 90vb-92vb; R 123vb-124va; S 185v-187v; T 80rb-81ra; U *deest*; V 85ra-86ra; W 56va-57rb; X 290vb-292rb]

36. Utrum omne irasci sit universaliter malum [A 80rb-vb; B 150ra-vb; C 116va-117ra; D 78va-79ra; F 124vb-125va; G 135rb-136ra; L 81rb-va; N 86rb-vb; P 74rb-vb; Q 92vb-93ra; R 124va-vb; S 187v-188v; T 81ra-va; U 75r-v; V 86ra-b; W 57rb-va; X 292rb-293ra]

37. Utrum mansuetudo sit virtus differens a clementia [A 80vb-81ra; B 150vb-151rb; C 117ra-va; D 79ra-b; F 125va-b; G 136ra-vb; L 81va-b; N 86vb-87ra; P 74vb-75ra; Q 93ra-va; R 124vb-125ra; S 188v-189r; T 81va-b; U 75v-76r; V 86rb-va; W 57va-b; X 293ra-va]

38. Utrum species iracundiae sint bene distinctae in velocem, acutam, amaram, et difficilem [A 81ra-b; B 151rb-152ra; C 117va-118ra; D 79rb; F 125vb-126rb; G 136vb-137rb; L 81vb-82rb; N 87ra-b; P 75ra-b; Q 93va-94ra; R 125ra-b; S 189r-190r; T 81vb-82rb; U 76r-v; V 86va-b; W 57vb-58ra; X 293va-294ra]

Lectio XX: In colloquiis autem et convivere: c. 6: 1126b11 [A 81va-82ra; B 152ra-153ra; C 118ra-119ra; D 79va-80rb; F 126va-127rb; G 137rb-138va; L (82r-83v) 82rb-vb; N 87rb-88ra; P 75rb-vb; Q 94ra-95va; R 125rb-vb; S 190r-191r; T 82rb-vb; U *deest*; V 86vb-87vb; W 58ra-va; X 294ra-295ra]

39. Utrum habitus medius inter placiditatem et discoliam, quem Philosophus vocat amicitiam, sit virtus (= *Sent.* III.27.1) [A 82ra-vb; B 153rb-154rb; C 119ra-vb; D 80rb-vb; F 127rb-128rb; G 138va-139vb; L 82vb-83rb; N 88ra-vb; P 75vb-76rb; Q 95va-96rb; R 125vb-126rb; S 191v-192v; T 82vb-83va; U 76v-77v; V 87vb-88rb; W 58va-59ra; X 295ra-296rb]

Lectio XXI: Circa eadem fere est iactantia: c. 7: 1127a13 [A 82vb-83va; B 154rb-155vb; C 119vb-121rb; D 80vb-81vb; F 128rb-129va; G 139vb-141va; L (83v-85v) 83va-84rb; N 88vb-89va; P 76va-77rb; Q 96rb-98ra; R 126rb-127ra; S 192v-194v; T 83va-84rb; U *deest*; V 88rb-89rb; W 59ra-va; X 296rb-297vb]

40. Utrum omne mendacium sit peccatum (= *Sent.* III.38.1) [A 83va-84ra; B 155vb-156vb; C 121rb-122ra; D 81vb-82ra; F 129va-130rb; G 141va-142rb; L 84rb-vb; N 89va-90ra; P 77rb-va; Q 98rb-vb; R 127ra-rb; S 194v-195v; T 84rb-vb; U 77v-78v; V 89rb-vb; W 59va-? (60r not filmed); X 297vb-298va]

41. Quid est veritas ut est moralis virtus, an sit veritas doctrinae, vel veritas iustitiae, vel veritas vitae (= *Sent.* III.38.2) [A 84ra; B 156vb; C 122ra; D 82ra-rb; F 130rb; G 142rb-va; L 84vb-85ra; N 90ra-b; P 77va-vb; Q 98vb; R 127rb; S 195v-196r; T 84vb-85ra; U 78v; V 89vb; W? (60r not filmed); X 298va]

42. Utrum hypocrisis dicatur univoce de iactantia et ironia [A 84ra-84rb; B 156vb-157ra; C 122ra-b; D 82rb; F 130rb-va; G 142va-b; L 85ra; N 90rb; P 77vb; Q 98vb-99ra; R 127rb-va; S 196r; T 85ra; U 78v-79r; V 89vb; W? (60r not filmed); X 298va-b]

Lectio XXII: Existente autem requie in vita: c. 8: 1127b33 [A 84rb-85ra; B 157ra-158va; C 122rb-123va; D 82rb-83ra; F 130va-131vb; G 142vb-144rb; L (85v-87r) 85ra-85vb; N 90rb-91ra; P 77vb-78va; Q 99ra-101vb; R 127va-128ra; S 196r-198r; T 85ra-vb; U *deest*; V 89vb-90vb; W?-60va (60r not filmed); X 298vb-300rb]

43. Utrum ludus possit esse virtutis opus [A 85ra-b; B 158va-159ra; C 123va-124ra; D 83ra-va; F 131vb-132rb; G 144rb-145ra; L 85vb-86rb; N 91rb-va; P 78va-b; Q 101vb-102rb; R 128ra-b; S 198r-199r; T 86ra-b; U 79r-80r; V 90vb-91ra; W 60vb-61ra; X 300rb-vb]

44. Quid est eutrapelia secundum descriptionem [A 85rb-va; B 159ra-b; C 124ra-b; D 83va; F 132rb; G 145ra; L 86rb; N 91va; P 79ra; Q 102rb; R 128rb-va; S 199r; T 86rb; U 80r; V 91ra-b; W 61ra; X 300vb]

Lectio XXIII: De verecundia autem: c. 9: 1128b10 [A 85va-86ra; B 159rb-160rb; C 124rb-125ra; D 83va-84ra; F 132rb-133ra; G 145ra-146rb; L (87r-88r) 86rb-vb; N 91va-92rb; P 79ra-va; Q 102rb-102va; R 128va-b; S 199r-200v; T 86rb-87ra; U *deest*; V 91rb-vb; W 61ra-va; X 301ra-vb]

45. Utrum aliquis simpliciter bonus et studiosus sit verecundus [A 86ra-va; B 160rb-161rb; C 125ra-126ra; D 84ra-vb; F 133ra-134ra; G 146rb-147rb; L 86vb-87va; N 92rb-93ra; P 79va-80ra; Q 102va-103rb; R 128vb-129rb; S 200v-201v; T 87ra-va; U 80r-81r; V 91vb-92rb; W 61va-b; X 301vb-302vb]

Liber quintus

Lectio I: De iustitia autem et iniustitia: c. 1: 1129a3 [A 86va-87rb; B 161va-162vb; C 126ra-127rb; D 84vb-85va; F 134ra-135rb; G 147rb-148vb; L (88r-89r) 87va-88rb; N 93ra-vb; P 80ra-vb; Q 103va-105rb; R 129rb-130ra; S 202r-203v; T 87va-88rb; U 81r-81v; V 92va-93rb; W 62ra-va; X 303ra-304rb]

1. Utrum iustitia secundum communem intentionem sit hic convenienter descripta [A 87rb-va; B 162vb-163va; C 127rb-vb; D 85va-vb; F 135rb-va; G 148vb-149va; L 88rb-va; N 93vb-94rb; P 80vb-81ra; Q 105rb-vb; R 130ra-b; S 203v-204v; T 88va-b; U 81v-82r; V 93rb-va; W 62va-b; X 304va-305ra]

2. Utrum iustitia sit naturaliter prior iure [A 87va-88ra; B 163va-164ra; C 127vb-128va; D 85vb-86rb; F 135va-136rb; G 149va-150rb; L 88vb-89ra; N 94rb-vb; P 81ra-b; Q 105vb-106rb; R 130rb-va; S 204v-205r; T 88vb-89rb; U 82r-83r; V 93va-b; W 62vb-63ra; X 305ra-vb]

Lectio II: Videtur autem illegalis: c. 1: 1129a32 [A 88ra-vb; B 164ra-165vb; C 128va-129vb; D 86rb-87ra; F 136rb-137va; G 150rb-152ra; L (89r-90v) 89ra-90ra; N 94vb-95va; P 81rb-82ra; Q 106rb-107vb; R 130va-131rb; S 205r-207r; T 89rb-90ra; U *deest*; V 93vb-94vb; W 63ra-vb; X 305vb-307va]

3. Utrum iustitia sit convenienter divisa in legalem et aequalem sive particularem (= *Sent.* III.36.2) [A 88vb-89ra; B 165vb-166va; C 129vb-130va; D 87ra-va; F 137va-138ra; G 152ra-vb; L 90ra-b; N 95vb-96ra; P 82ra-va; Q 107vb-108rb; R 131rb-va; S 207r-208r; T 90ra-va; U 83v-84r; V 94vb-95rb; W 63vb-64ra; X 307va-308rb]

4. Utrum aliqua una virtus sit operativa omnium operum quarumcumque virtutum (= *Sent.* III.36.3) [A 89ra-va; B 166va-167rb; C 130va-131ra; D 87va-b; F 138ra-vb; G 152vb-153va; L 90rb-vb; N 96ra-va; P 82va-b; Q 108rb-vb; R 131va-132ra; S 208r-209r; T 90va-b; U 84r-v; V 95rb-va; W 64ra-b; X 308rb-309ra]

Lectio III: Haec quidem igitur iustitia: c. 1: 1130a8 [A 89va-b; B 167rb-vb; C 131ra-va; D 87vb-88rb; F 138vb-139va; G 153va-154rb; L (90v-) 90vb-91rb; N 96va-97ra; P 82vb-83rb; Q 108vb-109va; R 132ra-b; S 209r-210r; T 90vb-91rb; U *deest*; V 95va-96ra; W 64rb-vb; X 309ra-vb]

5. Utrum legalis iustitia sit aliquis unus habitus ab habitibus virtutum moralium distinctus, an ipsa sit simul omnes habitus virtuosi et omnium virtutum moralium aggregatio (≈ *Sent.* III.33.3) [A 89vb-91rb; B 167vb-170rb; C 131va-133vb; D 88rb-89va; F 139va-141va; G 154rb-156va; L 91rb-92va; N 97ra-98va; P 83rb-84va; Q 109va-111rb; R 132rb-133rb; S 210r-213r; T 91rb-92vb; U 84v-86v; V 96ra-97rb; W 64vb-65vb; X 309vb-312rb]

Lectio IV: Quaerimus autem eam: c. 2: 1130a14 [A 91rb-va; B 170va-171rb; C 133vb-134va; D 89va-90ra; F 141va-142rb; G 156vb-157vb; L (90v-91v) 92va-93ra; N 98va-99ra; P 84va-b; Q 111rb-112va; R 133rb-vb; S 213r-214r; T 92vb-93rb; U *deest*; V 97rb-98ra; W 65vb-66ra; X 312va-313rb]

6. Utrum mechans propter lucrum simpliciter sit avarus et non luxuriosus [A 91va-b; B 171rb-vb; C 134va-b; D 90ra-b; F 142rb-va; G 157vb-158ra; L 93ra; N 99ra-b; P 84vb-85ra; Q 112va-b; R 133vb-134ra; S 214r-v; T 93rb-va; U 86v-87r; V 98ra; W 66ra-b; X 313rb-vb]

7. Utrum iustitia particularis moderetur aliquam passionem [A 91vb-92rb; B 171vb-172vb; C 134vb-135va; D 90rb-vb; F 142va-143va; G 158ra-159rb; L 93ra-va; N 99rb-vb; P 85ra-va; Q 112vb-113va; R 134ra-b; S 214v-216v; T 93va-94ra; U 87r-88r; V 98rb-va; W 66rb-vb; X 313vb-314vb]

Lectio V: Quia autem inaequale: c. 2: 1130b10 [A 92rb-93ra; B 172vb-174ra; C 135va-136vb; D 90vb-91va; F 143va-144va; G 159rb-160va; L (90v-93r) 93va-94rb; N 99vb-100va; P 85va-86ra; Q 113va-114vb; R 134rb-135ra; S 216v-218v; T 94ra-vb; U *deest*; V 98va-99va; W 66vb-67rb; X 314vb-316ra]

8. Utrum legalis iustitia distinguatur a particulari et ab aliis virtutibus per esse ad alterum [A 93ra-b; B 174ra-vb; C 136vb-137rb; D 91va-b; F 144va-145rb; G 160va-161va; L 94rb-vb; N 100va-b; P 86rb-va; Q 114vb-115rb; R 135ra-b; S 219r-v; T 94vb-95rb; U 88r-v; V 99va-vb; W 67rb-va; X 316rb-317ra]

Lectio VI: Quia autem et iniustus inaequalis: c. 3: 1131a10 [A 93rb-94va; B 174vb-177ra; C 137rb-139ra; D 92ra-93ra; F 145rb-146vb; G 161va-163vb; L (93r-95v)

94vb-95vb; N 100vb-102ra; P 86va-87va; Q 115va-117va; R 135rb-136rb; S 219v-221v; T 95rb-96va; U *deest*; V 99vb-101rb; W 67va-68rb; X 317ra-319ra]

9. Utrum acceptio personarum opponatur iustitiae distributivae [A 94va-b; B 177ra-vb; C 139rb-vb; D 93ra-va; F 147ra-va; G 163vb-164va; L 95vb-96rb; N 102ra-va; P 87va-88ra; Q 117va-118ra; R 136rb-va; S 221v-222v; T 96va-97ra; U 88v-89r; V 101rb-va; W 68va-vb; X 319rb-320ra]

10. Utrum faciens iniustum habeat plus de bono et minus de malo quam iniustum patiens [A 94vb-95ra; B 177vb-178rb; C 139vb-140rb; D 93va-b; F 147va-148ra; G 164va-165ra; L 96rb-va; N 102va-b; P 88ra-b; Q 118ra-va; R 136va-b; S 222v-223r; T 97ra-b; U 89r-v; V 101va-b; W 68vb-69ra; X 320ra-va]

Lectio VII: Reliqua autem una vita directivum: c. 4: 1131b25 [A 95ra-96rb; B 178rb-180va; C 140rb-142rb; D 93vb-95ra; F 148ra-149vb; G 165ra-167rb; L (95v-98r) 96va-97vb; N 102vb-104ra; P 88rb-89rb; Q 118va-121ra; R 136vb-137vb; S 223r-225v; T 97rb-98va; U *deest*; V 101vb-103rb; W 69ra-70ra; X 320va-322va]

11. Utrum expedientius sit civitatem regi bona lege sine bono homine quam bono homine sine bona lege [A 96rb-97ra; B 180va-182ra; C 142rb-143va; D 95ra-vb; F 149vb-151rb; G 167rb-169ra; H 292r; L 97vb-98va; N 104ra-105ra; P 89va-90rb; Q *deest*; R 137vb-138va; S 225v-227r; T 98va-99va; U 89v-91r; V 103rb-104ra; W 70ra-va; X 322vb-324rb]

Lectio VIII: Videtur autem aliquibus: c. 5: 1132b21 [A 97ra-b; B 182ra-b; C 143va-b; D 95vb-96ra; F 151rb; G 169ra-rb; L (98r-v) 98va-b; N 105ra; P 90rb; R 138va; S 227r; T 99va; U *deest*; V 104ra- rb; W 70va-b; X 324rb-vb; Q 121ra-b]

12. Utrum contrapassum sit simpliciter iustum [A 97rb-vb; B 182rb-183rb; C 143vb-144va; D 96ra-va; F 151rb-152ra; G 169rb-170rb; L 98vb-99rb; N 105ra-va; P 90rb-vb; Q *deest*; R 138va-139ra; S 227r-228r; T 99va-100ra; U 91r-92r; V 104rb-vb; W 70vb-71ra; X 324vb-325vb]

Lectio IX: In contrafacere enim proportionale: c. 5: 1132b33 [A 97vb-98vb; B 183rb-185rb; C 144va-146ra; D 96va-97va; F 152ra-vb; G 170va-172va; L (99r-101r) 99rb-100rb; N 105va-106vb; P 90vb-91vb; Q 121rb-123vb; R 139ra-vb; S 228r-230v; T 100ra-101rb; U *deest*; V 104vb-106ra; W 71ra-72ra; X 325vb-328ra]

Lectio X: Determinatis autem his: c. 5: 1133b30 [A 98vb-99ra; B 185rb-vb; C 146ra-va; D 97va-b; F 153vb-154ra; G 172va-173ra; L (101r-102r) 100rb-va; N 106vb-107ra; P 91vb-92ra; Q 123vb-124rb; R 139vb-140ra; S 230v-231r; T 101rb-va; U *deest*; V 106ra-va; W 72ra; X 328ra-va]

13. Utrum operatio iusta sit medium inter iniustum facere et iniustum pati [A 99ra-va; B 185vb-187ra; C 146va-147va; D 97vb-98va; F 154rb-155rb; G 173ra-174va; L 100va-101rb; N 107ra-vb; P 92ra-vb; Q *deest*; R 140ra-va; S 231r-232r; T 101va-102rb; U 92r-93r; V 106va-107ra; W 72ra-va; X 328va-330ra]

14. Utrum iustitia sit media inter duas malitias, sicut ceterae virtutes [A 99va-100rb; B 187ra-188rb; C 147va-148va; D 98va-99ra; F 155rb-156ra; G 174va-175vb;

L 101rb-vb; N 107vb-108rb; P 92vb-93va; S 232r-233v; Q *deest*; R 140va-141ra; T 102rb-103ra; U 93r-94r; V 107ra-vb; W 72va-73ra; X 330ra-331rb]

Lectio XI: Quia autem est iniustum facientem: c. 6: 1134a17 [A 100rb-va; B 188rb-va; C 148va; D 99ra-b; F 156ra-b; G 175vb-176ra; L (102r) 101vb-102ra; N 108rb-va; P 93va; Q 124rb-vb; R 141ra; S 233v; T 103ra; V 107vb-108ra; U 94r; W 73ra-b; X 331rb-va]

Lectio XII: Oportet autem non latere: c. 6: 1134a24 [A 100va-101ra; B 188va-189va; C 148va-149va; D 99rb-vb; F 156rb-157rb; G 176ra-177rb; L (102r-103r) 102ra-va; N 108vb-109ra; P 93va-94rb; Q 124vb-125vb; R 141ra-va; S 233v-235r; T 103ra-vb; U *deest*; V 108ra-va; W 73rb-vb; X 331va-332vb]

15. Utrum ius politicum sit aliud a iure dominativo et paterno et ab uxorio (= *Sent.* III.37.1) [A 101ra-b; B 189va-190rb; C 149va-150ra; D 99vb-100rb; F 157rb-vb; G 177rb-vb; L 102va-103ra; N 109ra-b; P 94rb-va; R 141va-b; S 235r-v; T 103vb-104ra; U 94r-v; V 108vb-109ra; W 73vb-74ra; X 332vb-333rb]

Lectio XIII: Politici autem iusti: c. 7: 1134b18 [A 101rb-vb; B 190rb-191ra; C 150ra-vb; D 100rb-vb; F 157vb-158va; G 177vb-178vb; L (103r-v) 103ra-b; N 109rb-110ra; P 94va-95ra; Q 125vb-127rb; R 141vb-142rb; S 235v-236v; T 104ra-vb; U *deest*; V 109ra-va; W 74ra-b; X 333va-334rb]

16. Utrum ius politicum sit convenienter divisum in ius naturale et in ius legale (= *Sent.* III.37.2) [A 101vb-102rb; B 191ra-192ra; C 150vb-151rb; D 100vb-101rb; F 158va-159rb; G 179ra-vb; L 103va-b; N 110ra-va; P 95ra-b; Q *deest*; R 142rb-vb; S 236v-237v; T 104vb-105rb; U 94v-95v; V 109va-110ra; W 74rb-vb; X 334va-335rb]

Lectio XIV: Iustorum autem et legalium: c. 7: 1135a5 [A 102rb-103ra; B 192ra-193rb; C 151rb-152rb; D 101rb-102ra; F 159rb-160va; G 179vb-181rb; L (103v-105r) 103vb-104va; N 110va-111rb; P 95rb-96ra; Q 127rb-128ra; R 142vb-143rb; S 237v-238v; T 105rb-106ra; U *deest*; V 110ra-rb; W 74vb-75rb; X 335rb-336va.

Lectio XV: Tribus utique existentibus: c. 8: 1135b11 [A 103ra-va; B 193rb-194rb; C 152va-153rb; D 102ra-va; F 160va-161rb; G 181rb-182va; L (105r-106v) 104va-105ra; N 111rb-vb; P 96ra-va; Q 128rb-129rb; R 143rb-vb; S 238v-239v; T 106ra-va; U *deest*; V 110rb-111va; W 75rb-vb; X 336va-337va]

17. Utrum divisio nocumenti in nocumentum ex ignorantia et in nocumentum ex passione et in nocumentum ex electione sit conveniens (= *Sent.* III.39.3) [A 103va-104ra; B 194rb-195ra; C 153rb-154ra; D 102va-103ra; F 161rb-162ra; G 182va-183va; L 105ra-va; N 111vb-112rb; P 96va-97ra; Q *deest*; R 143vb-144ra; S 239v-240v; T 106va-107ra; U 95v-96r; V 111va-112ra; W 75vb-76ra; X 337va-338rb]

18. Utrum omne nocumentum sit vel mortale vel veniale (*Sent.* III.39.2) [A 104ra-b; B 195ra-b; C 154ra-b; D 103ra-b; F 162ra-va; G 183va-184ra; L 105va-b; N 112rb-va; P 97ra-b; Q *deest*; R 144ra-b; S 240v-241r; T 107ra-b; U 96v; V 112ra; W 76ra-b; X 338rb-vb]

Lectio XVI: Dubitabit autem utique aliquis: c. 9: 1136a10 [A 104rb-vb; B 195rb-196vb; C 154rb-155rb; D 103rb-vb; F 162va-163vb; G 184ra-185rb; L (106v-107v)

105vb-106va; N 112va-113ra; P 97rb-98ra; Q 129va-130vb; R 144rb-vb; S 241r-242r; T 107rb-108ra; U *deest*; V 112ra-113ra; W 76rb-vb; X 338vb-340ra]

19. Utrum aliquis volens patiatur iniuriam seu iniustum [A 105ra-va; B 196vb-197va; C 155rb-156ra; D 103vb-104rb; F 163vb-164va; G 185rb-186rb; L 106va-107ra; N 113ra-va; P 98ra-va; Q *deest*; R 144vb-145ra (n.t.); S 242r-243v; T 108ra-va; U 96v-97v; V 113ra-va (as q. 18; numbering for remaining qq. of book IV has been corrected here); W 76vb-77ra; X 340rb-341ra]

Lectio XVII: Adhuc autem quae praeeligimus: c. 9: 1136b15 [A 105va-106rb; B 197va-199va; C 156ra-157va; D 104rb-105va; F 164va-166rb; G 186rb-188rb; L (107v-109v) 107ra-108ra; N 113va-114vb; P 98va-99va; Q 130vb-132vb; R 145ra-146ra; S 243v-245r; T 108va-109va; U *deest*; V 113va-114va; W 77ra-vb; X 341ra-343ra]

20. Utrum iudici liceat contra veritatem sibi notam iudicare sequendo proposita et probata (≈ *Sent.* IV. 16.4) [A 106va-107va; B 199va-201va; C 157va-159rb; D 105va-106va; F 166rb-168ra; G 188rb-190vb; H 292v; L 108ra-109rb; N 114vb-115vb; P 99va-100vb; Q *deest*; R 146ra-vb; S 245v-247v; T 109vb-110vb; U 97v-99v; V 114va-115vb; W 77vb-78vb; X 343ra-345va]

21. Utrum corruptus ferens iniustam sententiam pro parte corrumpente delinquat gravius quam corrumpens (= *Sent.* IV.19.1) [A 107va-108ra; B 201va-202vb; C 159rb-160rb; D 106va-107rb; F 168ra-169rb; G 190vb-192ra; H 292r-292v; L 109rb-vb; N 115vb-116va; P 100vb-101rb; Q *deest*; R 146vb-147va; S 247v-249r; T 110vb-111va; U 99v-100v; V 115vb-116rb; W 78vb-79rb; X 345va-346vb]

Lectio XVIII: De epieikia autem: c. 10: 1137a31 [A 108ra-vb; B 202vb-203vb; C 160rb-161rb; D 107rb-vb; F 169rb-170rb; G 192ra-193ra; L (109v-111r) 109vb-110va; N 116va-117rb; P 101rb-102ra; Q 132vb-134rb; R 147va-148ra; S 249r; T 111va-112va; U *deest*; V 116rb-117rb; W 79rb-vb; X 346vb-348ra]

22. Utrum ius epiekes sit directivum iuris naturalis [A 108vb-109rb; B 204ra-va; C 161va-162ra; D 108ra-b; F 170rb-171ra; G 193va-194rb; L 110va-111ra; N 117rb-va; P 102ra-va; Q *deest*; R 148ra-b; S 250v-251r; T 112va-113ra; U 100v-101r; V 117rb-vb; W 79vb-80ra; X 348rb-vb]

23. Utrum epiekeia sit moralis virtus contenta sub iustitia [A 109rb; B 204va-b; C 162ra-b; D 108rb-va; F 171ra-b; G 194va-b; L 111ra; N 117va-b; P 102va-b; Q *deest*; R 148rb-va; S 251r-v; T 113ra-b; U 101r-v; V 117vb; W 80ra; X 349ra-b]

Lectio XIX: Utrum autem contingit sibi ipsi: c. 11: 1138a4 [A 109rb-vb; B 204vb-205vb; C 162rb-163ra; D 108va-b; F 171rb-172ra; G 194vb-195vb; L (111r-112r) 111ra-va; N 117vb-118rb; P 102vb-103rb; Q 134rb-135rb; R 148va-b; 0S 251v-252v; T 113rb-vb; U *deest*; V 117vb-118va; W 80ra-b; X 349rb-350ra]

Lectio XX: Manifestum autem quoniam ambo: c. 11: 1138a [A 109vb-110rb; B 205vb-206va; C 163ra-va; D 108vb-109rb; F 172ra-va; G 195vb-196va; L (112r-v) 111va-112ra; N 118rb-vb; P 103rb-vb; Q 135rb-136ra; R 148vb-149rb; S 252v-253r; T 113vb-114ra; U *deest*; V 118va-119ra; W 80rb-va; X 350ra-vb]

24. Utrum interficere sit peius quam interfici [A 110rb-vb; B 206va-207rb; C 163va-164rb; D 109rb-vb; F 172va-173va; G 196va-197vb; H 292v-293r; L 112ra-va; N 118vb-119rb; P 103vb-104rb; Q *deest*; R 149rb-va; S 253r-254r; T 114ra-vb; U 101v-102r; V 119ra-b; W 80va-b; X 350vb-351vb]

Liber sextus

Lectio I: Quia autem extitimus: c. 1: 1138b18 [A 111ra-b; B 207va-b; C 164rb-vb; D 109vb-11ra; F 173va-b; G 197vb-198rb; L (112v-113r) 112va-b; N 119rb-va; P 104rb-va; Q 136ra-va; R 149va-b; S 254v; T 114vb-115ra; U *deest*; V 119va-b; W 81ra; X 352ra-b]

1. Utrum medium virtutis sit illud signum ad quod respicit intellectus cuiuslibet artificialiter vel moraliter operantis [A 111rb-va; B 207vb-208va; C 164vb-165rb; D 110ra-b; F 174ra-va; G 198rb-vb; L 112vb-113ra; N 119va-b; P 104va-b; Q *deest*; R 149vb-150ra; S 255r-v; T 115ra-va; U 102v-103r; V 119vb-120ra; W 81ra-b; X 352rb-353ra]

Lectio II: Animae autem virtutes: c. 1: 1138b35 [A 111va-b; B 208va-209ra; C 165rb-va; D 110rb-va; F 174va-b; G 199ra-va; L (113r-v) 113ra-b; N 119vb-120ra; P 104vb-105rb; Q 136va-137rb; R 150ra-b; S 255v-256r; T 115va-b; U *deest*; V 120ra-b; W 81rb-va; X 353ra-va]

2. Utrum pars animae scientifica et pars ratiocinativa sint naturaliter distinctae [A 111vb-112rb; B 209ra-vb; C 165va-166rb; D 110va-111ra; F 174vb-175va; G 199va-200va; L 113va-b; N 120ra-va; P 105rb-va; Q *deest*; R 150rb-vb; S 256r-257r; T 115vb-117rb (orig. foliation skips 116); U 103r-v; V 120rb-vb; W 81va-b; X 353va-354rb]

Lectio III: Sumendum ergo: c. 1: 1139a15 [A 112va-113rb; B 209vb-211rb; C 166rb-167va; D 111ra-vb; F 175va-176vb; G 200va-202ra; L (113v-115r) 113vb-114vb; N 120va-121va; P 105va-106va; Q 137rb-138vb; R 150vb-151rb; S 257r-258v; T 117rb-118ra; U *deest*; V 120vb-121vb; W 81vb-82ra; X 354rb-355vb]

3. Quid est speculatio definitive [A 113rb-va; B 211rb-vb; C 167va-b; D 112ra-rb; F 176vb-177ra; G 202rb-vb; L 114vb-115ra; N 121va-b; P 106va-b; Q *deest*; R 151rb-va; S 259r-v; T 118ra-b; U 103v-104r; V 121vb-122ra; W 82ra-va; X 356ra-b]

4. Quid est praxis [A 113va-114vb; B 211vb-213va; C 167vb-169rb; D 112rb-113ra; F 177ra-178va; G 202vb-204vb; L 115ra-116ra; N 121vb-122vb; P 106vb-107vb; Q *deest*; R 151va-152rb; S 259v-261v; T 118rb-119rb; U 104r-106r; V 122ra-123ra; W 82va-83rb; X 356rb-358ra]

5. Utrum mens speculativa et mens practica et mens factiva naturaliter distinguantur [A 114vb-115rb; B 213va-214va; C 169rb-170ra; D 113ra-va; F 178va-179ra; G 204vb-205va; L 116ra-va; N 122vb-123ra; P 107vb-108rb; Q *deest*; R 152rb-va; S 261v-262r T 119rb-vb; U 106r-v; V 1123ra-b; W 83rb-va; X 358rb-359ra]

6. Utrum mens practica principietur menti speculativae sicut menti factivae [A 115rb; B 214va-b; C 170ra-b; D 113va-b; F 179ra-b; G 205va-206ra; L 116va-

b; N 123ra-b; P 108rb-va; Q *deest*; R 152va-b; S 262r-v; T 119vb; U 106v; V 123rb-va; W 83va-b; X 359ra-va]

Lectio IV: Sunt utique quibus: c. 3: 1139b15 [A 115rb-vb; B 214vb-215va; C 170rb-va; D 113vb-114ra; F 179rb-vb; G 206ra-vb; L (115r-v) 116vb; N 123rb-va; P 108va-109ra; Q 138vb-139ra; R 152vb-153ra; S 262v-263v; T 119vb-120rb; U *deest*; V 123va-124ra; W 83vb-84ra; X 359va-360rb]

7. Utrum omne scibile sit aeternum [A 115vb-116ra; B 215va-216ra; C 170va-171rb; D 114ra-b; F 179vb-180rb; G 206vb-207vb; L 117ra-b; N 123va-b; P 109ra-b; Q *deest*; R 153ra-b; S 263v-264r; T 120rb-va; U 106v-107r; V 124ra-b; W 84ra; X 360rb-vb][60]

Lectio V: Contingentis autem: c. 4: 1140a1 [A 116ra-vb; B 216ra-217ra; C 171rb-172rb; D 114rb-115ra; F 180rb-181ra; G 207vb-208vb; L (115v-116v) 117rb-118ra; N 123vb-124va; P 109rb-vb; Q 139vb-140vb; R 153rb-vb; S 264r-265v; T 120va-121rb; U *deest*; V 124rb-125ra; W 84ra-va; X 360vb-362ra]

8. Utrum omnis ars sit habitus cum vera ratione factivus [A 116vb-117rb; B 217ra-218ra; C 250va-251rb; D 115ra-va; F 181ra-vb; L 118ra-va; N 124va-125ra; P 109vb-110va; G 208vb-209vb; Q *deest*; R 153vb-154ra; S 265v-266v; T 121rb-vb; U 107r-108r; V 125ra-va; W 84va-85ra; X 362ra-363ra]

Lectio VI: De prudentia sic utique assumamus: c. 5: 1140a24 [A 117rb-118rb; B 218ra-219va; C 172rb-173va; D 115va-116rb; F 181vb-182vb; G 209vb-211vb; L (116v-118r) 118va-119va; N 125ra-126ra; P 110va-111rb; Q 140vb-142va; R 154ra-vb; S 266v-267vb; T 121vb-122vb; U *deest*; V 125va-126va; W 85ra-va; X 363ra-364va]

9. Utrum definitio prudentiae sit conveniens [A 118rb-vb; B 219va-220ra; C 251rb-vb; D 116rb-vb; F 182vb-183va; G 211vb-212va; L 119va-b; N 126ra-b; P 111rb-vb; Q *deest*; R 154vb-155ra; S 267vb-268va; T 122vb-123rb; U 108r-v; V 126va-127ra; W 85va-b; X 364vb-365va]

10. Utrum prudentia differat ab omni arte [A 118vb-119rb; B 220ra-221ra; C 251vb-252va; D 116vb-117rb; F 183va-184va; G 212va-213vb; L 119vb-120rb; N 126rb-vb; P 111vb-112rb; Q *deest*; R 155ra-va; S 268va-269ra; T 123rb-vb; U 109r-v; V 127ra-va; W 85vb-86rb; X 365va-366va]

Lectio VII: Quia autem de universalibus: c. 6: 1140b31 [A 119rb; B 221ra-b; C 173va-b; D 117rb; F 184va; G 213vb-214ra; L (118r) 120rb-va; N 126vb-127ra; P 112rb; Q 142va-b; R 155va; S 269ra-b; T 123vb; U *deest*; V 127va-b; W 86rb; X 366va-b]

11. Utrum intellectus sit intellectualis virtus [A 119rb-120rb; B 221rb-222vb; C 252va-254ra; D 117rb-118rb; F 184va-185vb; G 214ra-215vb; L 120va-121rb; N 127ra-vb; P 112rb-113rb; Q *deest*; R 155va-156rb; S 269rb-270ra; T 123vb-124rb; U 109v-111r; V 127vb-128va; W 86rb-vb; X 366vb-368va]

---

[60] Although not clear in all witnesses, there is probably another lectio after lectio IV: Scientia quidem igitur.

Lectio VIII: Sapientiam autem: c. 7: 1141a9 [A 120rb-121ra; B 223ra-224rb; C 173vb-175ra; D 118rb-119ra; F 185vb-187ra; G 215vb-217va; L (118v-120r) 121rb-122rb; N 127vb-128vb; P 113rb-114ra; Q 142vb-144va; R 156rb-vb; S 270ra-271va; T 124vb-125va; U *deest*; V 128va-129va; W 86vb-? (87r and 88r not filmed); X 368va-370ra]

12. Utrum sapientia sit intellectualis virtus [A 121ra-b; B 224rb-vb; C 254ra-b; D 119ra-b; F 187ra-b; G 217va-218ra; L 122rb; N 128vb-129ra; P 114ra-b; Q *deest*; R 156vb-157ra; S 271va-b; T 125va-b; U 111r-v; V 129va-b; W 87va; X 370ra-va]

13. Utrum simul sit scientia et intellectus [A 121rb-vb; B 224vb-225va; C 254va-255ra; D 119rb-va; F 187rb-188ra; G 218ra-219ra; L 122rb-vb; N 129ra-b; P 114rb-vb; Q *deest*; R 157ra-b; S 271vb-272rb; T 125vb-126ra; U 111v-112r; V 129vb-130rb; W 87va-b; X 370va-371va]

Lectio IX: Erit autem quaedam: c. 7: 1141b22 [A 121vb-122vb; B 225va-227rb; C 175ra-176rb; D 119va-120va; F 188ra-189rb; G 219ra-221ra; L (120r-122r) 122vb-123vb; N 129rb-130rb; P 114vb-115vb; Q 144vb-146va; R 157rb-158rb; S 272rb-273va; T 126ra-127ra; U *deest*; V 130rb-131va; W 87vb-88va; X 371va-373rb]

14. Utrum prudentia personalis et prudentia economica et prudentia politica et prudentia legis positiva seu architectonica sint unus et idem habitus virtuosus an diversi (|| *Sent.* III.33.2) [A 122vb-123rb; B 227rb-228ra; C 255ra-vb; D120va-121ra; F 189rb-190ra; G 221ra-222ra; L 123vb-124ra; N 130rb-vb; P 115vb-116rb; Q *deest*; R 158rb-va; S 273va-274ra; T 127ra-va; U 112r-113r; V 131va-b; W 88va-89ra; X 373rb-374ra]

Lectio X: Oportet autem assumere de eubulia: c. 9: 1142a32 [A 123rb-124ra; B 228ra-229ra; C 176va-177rb; D 121ra-va; F 190ra-vb; G 222ra-223va; L (122r-124r) 124ra-vb; N 130vb-131va; P 116rb-vb; Q 146va-148ra; R 158va-159ra; S 274ra-vb; T 127va-128ra; U *deest*; V 131vb-132va; W 89ra-b; X 374ra-375va]

Lectio XI: Est autem et synesis: c. 10: 1142b34 [A 124ra-125ra; B 229ra-230vb; C 177rb-178vb; D 121vb-122va; F 191ra-192ra; G 223va-225va; L (124r-126v) 124vb-125vb; N 131va-132rb; P 116vb-117vb; Q 148ra-148vb; R 159ra-vb; S 274vb-276ra; T 128ra-129ra; U *deest*; V 132vb-133vb; W 89rb-90ra; X 375va-377rb][61]

15. Utrum eubulia, synesis, et gnome sint partes prudentiae an virtutes ab ipsa distinctae [A 125ra-126rb; B 230vb-233ra; C 255vb-257vb; D 122va-123vb; F 192ra-193va; G 225va-228ra; L 125vb-127ra; N 132rb-133va; P 117vb-119ra; Q *deest*; R 159vb-160vb; S 276ra-277va; T 129ra-130rb; U 113r-115r; V 133vb-135ra; W 90ra-91ra; X 377rb-379va]

Lectio XII: Dubitabit autem utique aliquis: c. 12: 1143b18 [A 126rb-127rb; B 233ra-234vb; C 178vb-180rb; D 123vb-124vb; F 193va-194vb; G 228ra-230rb;

---

[61] Although not clear in all witnesses, there are probably two other lectiones after lectio XI: Vocata autem gnome; Sunt autem omnes habitus.

L (126v-129r) 127ra-vb; N 133va-134va; P 119rb-120rb; Q 150ra-152ra; R 160vb-161va; S 277va-278vb; T 130rb-131rb; U *deest*; V 135ra-136ra; W 91ra-vb; X 379va-381va]

16. Utrum sapientia sit simpliciter melior quam prudentia [A 127rb-128rb; B 234vb-236va; C 257vb-259rb; D 124vb-125vb; F 194vb-196ra; G 230rb-232rb; L 128ra-vb; N 134va-135va; P 120rb-121rb; Q *deest*; R 161va-162rb; S 278vb-279vb; T 131rb-132ra; U 115r-116v; V 136rb-137ra; W 91vb-92rb; X 381va-383rb]

Lectio XIII: Intendendum utique: c. 13: 1144b1 [A 128rb-129ra; B 236va-237vb; C 180rb-181va; D 125vb-126va; F 196ra-197rb; G 232rb-233vb; L (129r-130v) 129ra-vb; N 135va-136rb; P 121rb-122ra; Q 152ra-153vb; R 162rb-vb; S 279vb-280va; T 132ra-vb; U *deest*; V 137va-138ra; W 92rb-93ra; X 383rb-384vb]

17. Utrum omnes virtutes morales sibi invicem et prudentiae inseparabiliter sint connexae (≈ *Sent.* III.36.4) [A 129ra-vb; B 237vb-238vb; C 259rb-260rb; D 126va-127ra; F 197rb-198rb; G 233vb-235ra; L 129vb-130va; N 136rb-137ra; P 122ra-vb; Q *deest*; R 162vb-163rb; S 280vb-281rb; T 132vb-133rb; U 116v-117v; V 138ra-va; W 93ra-b; X 384vb-386ra]

Liber septimus

Lectio I: Post haec autem dicendum: c. 1: 1145a15 [A 129vb-131ra; B 239ra-240vb; C 181vb-183ra; D 127ra-128rb; F 198rb-199vb; G 235rb-237rb; L (130v-131v) 130va-131va; N 137ra-138ra; P 122vb-123vb; Q 153vb-155rb; R 163rb-164rb; S 281rb-282va; T 133rb-134va;V 138va-139va; W 93rb-94ra; X 386ra-388ra]

Lectio II: Videbitur utique continentia: c. 1: 1145b8 [A 131ra-b; B 240vb-241rb; C 183ra-va; D 128rb-va; F 199vb-200ra; G 237rb-238ra; L (131v-132r) 131va-b; N 138ra-b; P 123vb-124rb; Q 155rb-156ra; R 164rb-va; S 282va-283r; T 134va-b; V 139va-140ra; W 94ra-b; X 388ra-va]

Lectio III: Dubitabit autem utique aliquis: c. 2: 1145b21 [A 131rb-132va; B 241rb-243rb; C 183va-185ra; D 128va-129va; F 200ra-201vb; G 238ra-240rb; L (132r-134r) 131vb-133ra; N 138rb-139va; P 124rb-125rb; Q 156ra-158rb; R 164va-165rb; S 283r-284v; T 134vb-135vb; V 140ra-141rb; W 94rb-95ra; X 388va-390rb]

Lectio IV: Primum quidem: c. 3: 1146b8 [A 132va-134ra; B 243rb-245vb; C 185ra-187rb; D 129va-131rb; F 201vb-203vb; G 240rb-243ra; L (134r-136r) 133ra-134vb; N 139va-141ra; P 125rb-126vb; Q 158rb-161rb; R 165rb-166va; S 284v-286v; T 135vb-137ra; V 141rb-143ra; W 95ra-vb (fragment); X 390va-393rb][62]

Lectio V: Utrum autem est aliquis: c. 4: 1147b20 [A 134ra-vb; B 245vb-247ra; C 187rb-188rb; D 131rb-vb; F 203vb-204va; G 243ra-244rb; L (136r-137r) 134vb-135rb; N 141ra-va; P 126vb-127vb; Q 161va-162vb; R 166va-167ra; S 286v-287v; T 137ra-vb; V 143ra-vb; W 126rb-127rb (*add. al. man.* at end); X 393rb-394va]

---

62) VX divide this lectio in two: Sed quia dupliciter: c. 3: 1146b31 [V 141vb-143ra; X391rb-393rb].

Lectio VI: Quia concupiscentiarum et delectationum: c. 4: 1148a22 [A 134vb-135rb; B 247ra-va; C 188rb-vb; D 131vb-132rb; F 204vb-205ra; G 244rb-245ra; L (137r-138v) 135va-b; N 141va-142ra; P 127va-128rb; Q 162vb-164va; R 167ra-b; S 287v-288r; T 137vb-138ra; V 143vb-144va; W 127rb-vb (*add. alia manu* at end); X 394va-395va]

1. Utrum circa praedicta secundum se naturaliter eligibilia sit aliqua malitia [A 135rb-136va; B 247va-250ra; C 189ra-190vb; D 132rb-133va; F 205ra-206vb; G 245ra-247va; L 135vb-137rb; N 142ra-143rb; P 128rb-129rb; R 167rb-168rb; S 288r-290r; T 138ra-139rb; U 119r-v; V 144va-145vb; W 127vb-129va (*add. alia manu* at end); X 395va-398ra]

Lectio VII: Quoniam autem et minus turpis: c. 6: 1149a24 [A 136va-137rb; B 250ra-251ra; C 190vb-191vb; D 133va-134rb; F 206vb-207va; G 247va-248va; L (138v-139v) 137rb-138ra; N 143rb-144ra; P 129rb-vb; Q 164va-166ra; R 168rb-vb; S 290r-291r; T 139rb-vb; V 145vb-146va; W 129va (fragment) and 96ra-rb; X 398ra-399rb]

Lectio VIII: Ipsarum autem: c. 6: 1149b26 [A 137rb-vb; B 251ra-252ra; C 191vb-192va; D 134rb-vb; F 207va-208rb; G 248va-249va; L; L (139v-140r) 138ra-va; N 144ra-va; P 129vb-130va; Q 166ra-vb; R 168vb-169rb; S 291r-v; T 139vb-140rb; V 146va-147ra; W 96rb-va; X 399rb-400ra]

Lectio IX: Circa delectationes autem: c. 7: 1150a9 [A 137vb-139ra; B 252ra-253vb; C 192va-194rb; D 134vb-136ra; F 208rb-209vb; G 249va-251vb; L (140r-141r) 138va-139vb; N 144va-145va; P 130va-131va; Q 166vb-168ra; R 169rb-170rb; S 291v-293r; T 140rb-141rb; U 119v; V 147ra-148rb; W 96va-97rb; X 400ra-402rb][63]

Lectio X: Est autem intemperatus: c. 8: 1150b29 [A 139ra-vb; B 253vb-255ra; C 194rb-195rb; D 136ra-vb; F 209vb-210vb; G 251vb-252rb (fragment); L (141r-142r) 139vb-140va; N 145va-146rb; P 131va-132rb; Q 168ra-169va; R 170rb-vb; S 293v-294r; T 141rb-142ra; U *deest*; V 148rb-149ra; W 97rb-vb; X 402rb-403va]

Lectio XI: Utrum igitur continens: c. 9: 1151a29 [A 139vb-140rb; B 255ra-va; C 195rb-vb; D 136vb-137ra; F 210vb-211rb; G 252rb (fragment); L (142r-v) 140va-141ra; N 146rb-vb; P 132rb-va; Q 169va-170va; R 170vb-171ra; S 294r-v; T 142ra-rb; U *deest*; V 149ra-va; W 97vb-98ra; X 403va-404rb]

Lectio XII: Quia autem est aliquis: c. 9: 1151b23 [A 140rb-va; B 255va-256rb; C 195vb-196va; D 137ra-va; F 211rb-vb; G 252va-253ra; L (142v) 141ra-va; N 146vb-147ra; P 132va-133ra; Q 170va-171rb; R 171ra-b; S 294v-295r; T 142rb-va; U *deest*; V 149va-150ra; W 98ra-rb; X 404rb-vb]

Lectio XIII: Neque simul prudentem: c. 10: 1152a6 [A 140va-141rb; B 256rb-257ra; C 196va-197ra; D 137va-138ra; F 211vb-212rb; G 253ra-255rb; L (142v-

---

63) In the middle of the lectio Odonis asks "Utrum sequi delectationem et fugere tristitiam sint duo motus vel unus," but he probably did not consider this a separate question, but part of the lectio, since it lacks the normal "Ad evidentiam" clause introducing it and the question structure.

143r) 141va-142ra; N 147ra-va; P 133ra-va; Q 171rb-172rb; R 171rb-va; S 295r-296r; T 142va-143ra; U *deest*; V 150ra-va; W 98rb-vb X 405ra-vb]
Lectio XIV: De delectatione autem et tristitia: c. 11: 1152b1 [A 141rb-vb; B 257ra-vb; C 197ra-vb; D 138ra-va; F 212va-213va; G 255rb-256ra; L (143r-v) 142ra-va; N 147va-148ra; P 133va-b; Q 172rb-173rb; R 171va-172ra; S 296r-v; T 143ra-b; U *deest*; V 150va-151ra; W 98vb-99ra; X 405vb-406va]
Lectio XV: Quoniam autem non accidit: c. 12: 1152b25 [A 141vb-143rb; B 257vb-259vb; C 197vb-199va; D 138va-139vb; F 213va-214va; G 256ra-258rb; L (143v-144v) 142vb-144rb; N 148ra-149rb; P 133vb-135ra; Q 173rb-175vb; R 172ra-vb; S 296v-298r; T 143va-144va; U *deest*; V 151-152rb; W 99ra-vb; X 406va-408vb]
Lectio XVI: Forte autem et necessarium: c. 13: 1153b9 [A 143rb-144ra; B 260ra-261ra; C 199va-200va; D 139vb-140va; F 214va-215va; G 258rb-259va; L (144v-145r) 144rb-145ra; N 149rb-vb; P 135ra-va; Q 175vb-177ra; R 172vb-173rb; S 298r-299r; T 144va-145ra; U *deest*; V 152va-153ra; W 99vb-100rb; X 408vb-409vb]
Lectio XVII: De corporalibus autem: c. 14: 1154a8 [A 144ra-145vb; B 261ra-263ra; C 200va-202rb; D 140va-141vb; F 215va-217rb; G 259va-261va; L (145r-146v) 145ra-146vb; N 149vb-151ra; P 135va-136vb; Q 177ra-179vb; R 173rb-174rb; S 299r-300v; T 145ra-146rb; U *deest*; V 153ra-154va; W 100rb-101ra (n.t.); X 409vb-411vb]

Liber octavus
Lectio I: Post haec autem etc.: c. 1: 1155a3 [A 145vb-146va; B 263rb-264ra; C 202rb-203rb; D 141vb-142va; F 217rb-218ra; G 261vb-262vb: L (146v-147r) 146vb-147rb; N 151ra-vb; P 136vb-137rb; Q 179vb-181ra; R 174rb-vb; S 301r-v; T 146va-147ra; V 154va-155ra; W 101rb-va; X 412ra-vb]
Lectio II: Dubitantur autem etc.: c. 1: 1155a32 [A 146va-b; B 264rb-va; C 203rb-vb; D 142va-b; F 218ra-va; G 262vb-263rb; L (147r) 147rb-vb; N 151vb-152ra; P 137rb-va; Q 181ra-vb; R 174vb-175ra; S 301v-302r; T 147ra-rb; V 155rb-va; W 101va-b; X 412vb-413rb]
Lectio III: Forte autem utique: c. 2: 1155b17 [A 146vb-147rb; B 264vb-265va; C 203vb-204rb; D 142vb-143rb; F 218va-219ra; G 263rb-264ra; L (147r-v) 147vb-148rb; N 152ra-va; P 137vb-138ra; Q 181vb-182vb; R 175ra-b; S 302r-v; T 147rb-vb; V 155va-156ra; W 101vb-102rb; X 413rb-414rb]
Lectio IV: Differunt autem: c. 3: 1156a6 [A 147rb-148ra; B 265va-266va; C 204rb-205rb; D 143rb-144ra; F 219ra-220ra; G 264ra-265rb; L (147v-148v) 148rb-149ra; N 152va-153ra; P 138ra-vb; Q 182vb-184ra; R 175rb-vb; S 302v-303v; T 147vb-148rb; V 156ra-vb; W 102rb-va; X 414rb-415rb]
Lectio V: Perfecta autem est: c. 3: 1156b7 [A 148ra-vb; B 266va-267va; C 205rb-206ra; D 144ra-va; F 220ra-vb; G 265rb-266rb; L (148v-149r) 149ra-vb; N 153ra-va, P 138vb-139rb; Q 184rb-185rb; R 175vb-176rb; S 303v-304r; T 148rb-vb; V 156vb-157rb; W 102vb-103ra; X 415rb-416rb]
Lectio VI: Quae autem propter delectabile: c. 4: 1156b35 [A 148vb-149rb; B 267va-268rb; C 206ra-vb; D 144va-145ra; F 220vb-221rb; G 266rb-267ra; L (149r-v)

149vb-150rb; N 153va-154ra; P 139rb-va; Q 185rb-186va; R 176rb-vb; S 304r-v; T 148vb-149rb; V 157rb-158ra; W 103ra-b; X 416rb-417rb]

Lectio VII: Quemadmodum autem in virtutibus: c. 5: 1157b5 [A 149rb-150va; B 268rb-270ra; C 206vb-208rb; D 145ra-146rb; F 221rb-223ra; G 267ra-269ra; L (149v-151r) 150rb-151vb; N 154ra-155ra; P 139va-140vb; Q 186va-189rb; R 176vb-177va; S 304v-306r; T 149rb-150ra; V 158ra-159rb; W 103rb-104ra; X 417rb-419rb]

Lectio VIII: Altera autem est amicitiae species: c. 7: 1158b11 [A 150va-151va; B 270ra-271va; C 208rb-209va; D 146rb-147ra; F 223ra-224ra; G 269ra-270rb; L (151v-152r) 151vb-152va; N 155ra-155va; P 140vb-141rb; Q 189rb-190vb; R 177va-178ra; S 306r-307r; T 150rb-vb; V 159rb-160rb; W 104ra-va; X 419rb-420va]

Lectio IX: Multi enim videntur: c. 8: 1159a12 [A 151va-152ra; B 271va-272va; C 209va-210rb; D 147ra-vb; F 224ra-vb; G 270rb-271rb; L (152r-153r) 152va-153rb; N 155va-156rb; P 141rb-142ra; Q 190vb-192rb; R 178ra-va; S 307r-v; T 150vb-151rb; V 160rb-161ra; W 104va-105ra; X 420va-421vb]

Lectio X: Videtur autem quemadmodum: c. 9: 1159b25 [A 152ra-vb; B 272va-273rb; C 210rb-211ra; D 147vb-148rb; F 224vb-225va; G 271rb-272rb; L (153r-154r) 153rb-154ra; N 156rb-vb; P 142ra-va; Q 192rb-193va; R 178va-179ra; S 307v-308r; T 151rb-vb; V 161ra-vb; W 105ra-va; X 421vb-422vb]

Lectio XI: Politicae autem sunt tres species: c. 10: 1160a31 [A 152vb-153va; B 273va-274va; C 211rb-212ra; D 148rb-149ra; F 225vb-226va; G 272rb-273va; L (154r-155r) 154ra-vb; N 156vb-157rb; P 142va-143ra; Q 193va-195rb; R 179ra-va; S 308r-309r; T 151vb-152rb; V 161vb-162va; W 105va-vb; X 422vb-424ra]

Lectio XII: Secundum autem: c. 11: 1161a10 [A 153va-154ra; B 274va-275rb; C 212ra-vb; D 149ra-va; F 226va-227rb; G 273va-274rb; L (155r-156r) 154vb-155rb; N 157rb-vb; P 143ra-va; Q 195rb-196va; R 179va-180ra; S 309r-v; T 152rb-vb; V 162va-163ra; W 105vb-106rb; X 424ra-vb]

Lectio XIII: In communicatione: c. 12: 1161b11 [A 154ra-155rb; B 275rb-277ra; C 212vb-214rb; D 149va-150vb; F 227rb-229va; G 274rb-276ra; L (156r-157r) 155rb-156va; N 157vb-158vb; P 143va-144va; Q 196va-198vb; R 180ra-vb; S 309v-310v; T 152vb-153va; V 163ra-164rb; W 106rb-107ra (n.t.); 424vb-426va]

Lectio XIV: Trinis utique existentibus: c. 13: 1162a34 [A 155va-157rb; B 277ra-279vb; C 214rb-216va; D 150vb-152rb; F 229va-230va; G 276ra-278vb; L (157r-159r) 156va-158va; N 158vb-160rb; P 144va-146ra; Q 198vb-202rb; R 180vb-182ra; S 310v-312r; T 153va-155ra; V 164rb-166ra; W 107ra-108ra (n.t.); X 426va-429ra]

Liber nonus

Lectio I: In omnibus autem dissimilium specierum amicitiis: c. 1: 1163b32 [A 157rb-158rb; B 279vb-281rb; C 216va-217vb; D 152rb-153rb; F 230va-231vb; G 278vb-280rb; L (159r-160r) 158va-159va; N 160rb-161ra; P 146ra-vb; Q 202rb-204rb; R 182ra-vb; S 312r-313r; T 155ra-vb; U *deest*; V 166rb-167rb; W 108ra-vb; X 429ra-430va]

1. Utrum aestimatio faciendae retributionis pertineat ad dantem vel ad recipientem [A 158rb-vb; B 281rb-vb; C 217vb-218rb; D 153rb-va; F 231vb-232ra; G 280rb-vb; H 293r; L 159va-160ra; N 161ra-b; P 146vb-147ra; Q *deest*; R 182vb-183ra; S 313r-v; T 155vb-156ra; U 120r-v; V 167rb-va; W 108vb-109ra; X 430va-431ra]

Lectio II: Dubitationem autem: c. 2: 1164b22 [A 158vb-159va; B 281vb-282vb; C 218rb-219rb; D 153va-154rb; F 232ra-233ra; G 280vb-281vb; L (160r-161r) 160ra-vb; N 161rb-162ra; P 147ra-vb; Q 204rb-206ra; R 183ra-va; S 313v-314r; T 156ra-vb; U *deest*; V 167va-168rb; W 109ra-rb; X 431ra-432rb]

2. Utrum in opere civili sit magis oboediendum principi quam patri [A 159va; B 282vb-283ra; C 219rb; D 154rb; F 233ra; G 281vb-282ra; H 293r; L 160vb; N 162ra; P 147vb; Q *deest*; R 183va; S 314r; T 156vb; U 120v; V 168rb; W 109va; X 432rb-va]

3. Utrum in opere domestico magis patri quam duci [A 159va-b; B 283ra-b; C 219rb; D 154rb-va; F 233ra-b; G 282ra; H 293r; L 161ra; N 162ra; P 147vb; Q *deest*; R 183va; S 314r-v; T 156vb; U 120v (fragment); V 168rb-va; W 109va; X 432va]

4. Utrum patri in opere domestico sit magis oboediendum quam principi in opere civili [A 159vb; B 283rb; C 219rb-va; D 154va; F 233rb; G 282ra; H 293r; L 161ra; N 162ra; P 148ra; Q *deest*; R 183va-b; S 314v; T 156vb; V 168va; W 109va; X 432va-b]

5. Utrum in extrema necessitate sit subveniendum ei qui est amicus propter identitatem generis magis quam ei qui est amicus propter bonitatem virtutis (= *Sent*. III.30.1) [A 159vb-160ra; B 283rb-vb; C 219va-b; D 154va-b; F 233rb-va; G 282rb-va; H 293r-293v; L 161ra-b; N 162rb; P 148ra-b; Q *deest*; R 183vb; S *deest*; T 156vb-157ra; V 168va-b; W 109va-b; X 432vb-433ra]

6. Utrum filius magis teneatur liberare patrem suum a latronibus cum periculo sui quam eum qui se liberavit in casu simili (= *Sent.* III.30.2) [A 160ra-va; B 283vb-284va; C 219vb-220va; D 154vb-155rb; F 233va-234rb; G 282va-283rb; H 293v; L 161rb-vb; N 162rb-vb; P 148rb-va; Q *deest*; R 183vb-184rb; S 314v-315r; T 157ra-va; V 168vb-169ra; W 109vb-110ra; X 433ra-vb]

7. Utrum propter malitiam benefactoris neganda sit recompensatio retributionis [A 160va-b; B 284va-b; C 220va; D 155rb; F 234rb; G 283va; L 161vb-162ra; N 162vb; P 148va; Q *deest*; R 184rb; S 315r; T 157va; V 169ra; W 110ra; X 433vb-434ra]

8. Utrum honor debitus Deo et honor debitus patri et debitus matri et debitus principi et debitus seni et debitus sapienti sint universaliter distincti [A 160vb; B 284vb; C 220va-b; D 155rb-va; F 234rb-va; G 283va-b; H 293v; L 162ra; N 162vb-163ra; P 148va-b; Q *deest*; R 184rb; S 315r; T 157va; V 169ra-b; W 110ra-b; X 434ra-b]

Lectio III: Habet autem dubitationem: c. 3: 1165a36 [A 160vb-161va; B 284vb-285vb; C 220vb-221rb; D 155va-156ra; F 234va-235ra; G 283vb-284vb; L (161r-162r)

162ra-vb; N 163ra-va; P 148vb-149rb; Q 206ra-207rb; R 184rb-vb; S 315r-317r; T 157va-158ra; V 169rb-vb; W 110rb-va; X 434rb-435ra]

Lectio IV: Amicabilia autem: c. 4: 1166a1 [A 161va-162rb; B 285vb-287ra; C 221rb-222va; D 156ra-vb; F 235ra-236ra; G 284vb-286ra; H 293v; L (162r-v) 162vb-163va; N 163va-164ra; P 149rb-150ra; Q 207rb-208vb; R 184vb-185rb; S 317r-318r; T 158ra-vb; V 169vb-170va; W 110va-111ra; X 435ra-436rb]

Lectio V: Ad se ipsum autem utrum est vel non est amicitia: c. 4: 1166a10 [A 162rb-163ra; B 287ra-288ra; C 222va-223va; D 156vb-157va; F 236ra-vb; G 286ra-287ra; L (162v-163v) 163va-164rb; N 164ra-vb; P 150ra-va; Q 208vb-210ra; R 185rb-vb; S 318r-319r; T 158vb-159rb; V 170va-171rb; W 111ra-va; X 436rb-437rb]

Lectio VI: Benivolentia autem: c. 5: 1166b30 [A 163ra-vb; B 288rb-289rb; C 223va-224rb; D 157va-158ra; F 236vb-237vb; G 287ra-288ra; L (163v-164r) 164rb-165ra; N 164vb-165rb; P 150va-151ra; R 185vb-186rb; S 319r-v; T 159rb-vb; V 171rb-vb; W 111va-112ra; X 437rb-438rb; Q 210ra-211rb]

Lectio VII: Amicabile autem: c. 6: 1167a22 [A 163vb-164rb; B 289rb-290ra; C 224rb-225ra; D 158ra-va; F 237vb-238va; G 288ra-289ra; L (164r-165r) 165ra-va; N 165rb-vb; P 151ra-va; Q 211rb-212rb; R 186rb-vb; S 319v-320r; T 159vb-160rb; V 171vb-172ra; W 112ra-b; X 438rb-439rb]

Lectio VIII: Benefactores autem: c. 7: 1167b17 [A 164rb-165vb; B 290ra-292ra; C 225ra-226vb; D 158va-159va; F 238va-240ra; G 289ra-291ra; L (165r-166r) 165va-166vb; N 165vb-167ra; P 151va-152vb; Q 212rb-214va; R 186vb-187vb; S 320v-322r; T 160rb-161va; V 172ra-173vb; W 112rb-113rb; X 439rb-441rb]

Lectio IX: Dubitatur autem: c. 8: 1168a28 [A 165vb-167rb; B 292ra-294ra; C 226vb-228va; D 159va-161ra; F 240ra-241va; G 291ra-293ra; L (166r-168r) 166vb-168ra; N 167ra-168ra; P 152vb-153vb; Q 214va-217ra; R 187vb-188vb; S 322r-323v; T 161va-162va; V 173vb-175ra; W 113rb-114ra; X 441rb-443ra]

Lectio X: Dubitatur autem et circa felicem: c. 9: 1169b3 [A 167rb-168ra; B 294ra-295rb; C 228va-229vb; D 161ra-162ra; F 241va-242vb; G 293ra-294va; L (168r-169v) 168ra-169ra; N 168ra-vb; P 153vb-154va; Q 217ra-218vb; R 188vb-189rb; S 323v-324v; T 162va-163rb; V 175ra-176ra; W 114ra-va; X 443ra-444rb]

Lectio XI: Naturalius autem intendentibus: c. 9: 1170a13 [A 168ra-169ra; B 295rb-296vb; C 229vb-231ra; D 162ra-vb; F 242vb-243vb; G 294va-295vb; L (169v-170v) 169ra-vb; N 168vb-169va; P 154va-155rb; Q 218vb-220va; R 189rb-190ra; S 324v-325v; T 163rb-vb; V 176ra-177ra; W 114va-115rb; X 444rb-445vb]

Lectio XII: Utrum igitur plures amicos: c. 10: 1170b20 [A 169ra-vb; B 297ra-298rb; C 231ra-232ra; D 163ra-va; F 243vb-244vb; G 295vb-297rb; L (170v-171r) 169vb-170vb; N 169va-170rb; P 155rb-156ra; Q 220va-222ra; R 190ra-va; S 325v-326v; T 163vb-164va; V 177ra-vb; W 115rb-vb; X 445vb-447ra]

Lectio XIII: Utrum autem in bonis fortunis: c. 11: 1171a21 [A 169vb-170va; B 298rb-299va; C 232ra-233rb; D 163vb-164va; F 244vb-246ra; G 297rb-298vb; L (171r-172r) 170vb-171va; N 170rb-171ra; P 156ra-vb; Q 222ra-223va; R 190va-191ra; S 326v-327v; T 164va-165rb; V 177vb-178va; W 115vb-116rb; X 447ra-448rb]

Lectio XIV: Iam ergo quemadmodum: c. 12: 1171b29 [A 170va-171ra; B 299va-300rb; C 233rb-vb; D 164va-b; F 246ra-va; G 298vb-299rb; L (172r-v) 171va-172ra; N 171ra-va; P 156vb-157ra; Q 223va-224rb; R 191ra-b; S 327v-328r; T 165rb-vb; V 178va-179ra; W 116rb-va; X 448rb-449ra]

Liber decimus

Lectio I: Post haec autem de delectatione: c. 1: 1172a19 [A 171ra-va; B 300rb-301ra; C 233vb-234va; D 164vb-165rb; F 246va-247rb; G 299va-300rb; L (172v-173r) 172ra-vb; N 171va-172ra; P 157ra-va; Q 224rb-225rb; R 191rb-vb; S 328r-v; T 165vb-166ra; V 179ra-va; W 116vb-117ra; X 449ra-vb]

Lectio II: Eudoxus igitur: c. 2: 1172b9 [A 171va-172ra; B 301ra-302ra; C 234va-235rb; D 165rb-166ra; F 247rb-248ra; G 300rb-301rb; L (173r-v) 172vb-173va; N 172ra-va; P 157va-158ra; Q 225rb-226va; R 191vb-192rb; S 328v (fragment); T 166ra-va; V 179va-180rb; W 117ra-va; X 449vb-450vb]

Lectio III: Non tamen: c. 3: 1173a13 [A 172rb-vb; B 302rb-303va; C 235rb-236rb; D 166ra-vb; F 248ra-249ra; G 301va-302vb; L (173v-174v) 173va-174va; N 172va-173rb; P 158ra-vb; Q 226va-228rb; R 192rb-vb; S 328v (fragment); T 166va-167rb; V 180rb-181rb; W 117va-118ra; X 450vb-452ra]

Lectio IV: Ad proferentes autem: c. 3: 1173b20 [A 172vb-173va; B 303va-304va; C 236rb-237rb; D 166vb-167rb; F 249ra-250ra; G 302vb-303vb; L (174v-175r) 174va-175ra; N 173rb-vb; P 158vb-159va; Q 228rb-229rb; R 192vb-193rb; S 329r-v; T 167rb-vb; V 181rb-vb; W 118ra-va; X 452ra-vb]

Lectio V: Quid autem est vel quale quid: c. 4: 1174a13 [A 173va-174va; B 304va-306rb-va; C 237rb-238va; D 167rb-168rb; F 250ra-251rb; G 303vb-305va; L (175r-176r) 175ra-176rb; N 173vb-174rb; P 159va-160va; Q 229rb-231rb; R 193rb-194ra; S 329v-330v; T 167vb-168vb; V 181vb-183ra; W 118va-119rb; X 452vb-454va]

Lectio VI: Qualiter igitur continue: c. 4: 1175a3 [A 174va-176ra; B 306va-308vb; C 238va-240va; D 168rb-169vb; G 305va-307vb; F 251rb-253rb; L (176r-178r) 176rb-178ra; N 174vb-176ra; P 160va-161vb; Q 231rb-234va; R 194ra-195ra; S 330v-332v; T 168vb-170ra; V 183ra-184vb; W 119rb-120rb; X 454va-457ra][64]

Lectio VII: Dictis utique his: c. 6: 1176a30 [A 176ra-177ra; B 309ra-310va; C 240va-241vb; D 169vb-170va; F 253rb-254rb; G 307vb-309rb; L (178r-178v) 178ra-179ra; N 176ra-vb; P 161vb-162vb; Q 234va-236ra; R 195ra-vb; S 332v-334r; T 170ra-vb; V 184vb-185vb; W 120rb-vb; X 457ra-458rb]

Lectio VIII: Si autem est felicitas: c. 7: 1177a12 [A 177ra-vb; B 310va-311vb; C 241vb-242vb; D 170va-171rb; F 254rb-255rb; G 309rb-310rb; L (178v-179r)

---

64) VX indicate another lectio in the middle of lectio VI: "Sensus omnis ad sensibile," but this is introduced by "Consequenter ibi," which is normally internal to a lectio. Following lectio VI the manuscripts and printed editions announce four questions but omit the responses: 1) Utrum quaelibet pars motus differat specie a qualibet alia parte et a toto motu; 2) Utrum visionis puncti vel unitatis sit generatio; 3) Utrum delectationis sit generatio; 4) Utrum delectatio perficiat operationem per modum finis.

179ra-vb; N 177ra-va; P 162vb-163rb; Q 236rb-237rb; R 195vb-196rb; S 334r-335r; T 170vb-171rb; V 185vb-186va; W 120vb-121rb; X 458rb-459ra]

Lectio IX: Videturque felicitas: c. 7: 1177b1 [A 177vb-178va; B 311vb-313rb; C 242vb-244ra; D 171rb-172ra; F 255rb-256rb; G 310rb-311va; L (179r-180r) 179vb-180va; N 177va-178rb; P 163rb-164ra; Q 237rb-238vb; R 196rb-197ra; S 335r-337r; T 171rb-172ra; V 186va-187rb; W 121rb-122ra; X 459ra-460rb]

Lectio X: Quod autem est dictum prius: c. 7: 1178a4 [A 178vb-179rb; B 313rb-314rb; C 244ra-245ra; D 172ra-vb; F 256rb-257rb; G 311va-312va; L (180r-v) 180va-181rb; N 178rb-179ra; P 164ra-vb; Q 238vb-240ra; R 197ra-va; S 337r-338r; T 172ra-va; V 187rb-188ra; W 122ra-va; X 460rb-461rb][65]

Lectio XI: Perfecta autem felicitas: c. 9: 1178b7 [A 179rb-180va; B 314rb-316ra; C 245ra-246rb; D 172vb-173va; F 257rb-258ra; G 312va-313vb; L (180v-181v) 181rb-182va; N 179ra-180ra; P 164vb-165vb; Q 240ra-242ra; R 197va-198rb; S 338v-340v; T 172va-173rb; V 188ra-189ra; W 122va-123ra; X 461rb-462vb]

Lectio XII: Utrum igitur si de his: c. 9: 1179a33 [A 180va-182va; B 316ra-319rb; C 246rb-250ra; D 173vb-175va; F 258ra-261rb; G 314ra-316vb; L (182r-183v) 182va-184va; N 180ra-181vb; P 165vb-167va; Q 242ra-245vb; R 198rb-199vb; S 340v-344r; T 173rb-174vb; V 189ra-191rb; W 123rb-124va; X 462vb-466ra]

Lectio XIII: Igitur post hoc intendendum: c. 9: 1181b28 [A 182va-183rb; B 319rb-320rb; C 250ra-b; D 175va-176rb; F 261rb-262rb; G 316vb-317vb; L (183v-185r) 184va-185rb; N 181vb-182rb; P 167va-168ra; Q 245vb-247ra; R 199vb-200rb; S 344-346r; T 174vb-175va; V 191rb-192rb; W 124va-125ra; X 466ra-467ra]

---

65) In the middle of the lectio Odonis asks "Utrum operatio sit principalior in virtute quam electio," but it lacks the "Ad evidentiam" introductory clause and does not have the normal question structure.